

Content Overview

Table of Contents	9
Zusammenfassung	17
Table of Abbreviations	21
Introduction	27
Chapter 1: Theoretical and Constitutional Foundations	49
A. Theoretical Foundations	49
B. Constitutional Foundations of the Separation of Ethics and Law	78
Chapter 2: Preimplantation Genetic Diagnosis	175
A. Preimplantation Genetic Diagnosis in Germany	175
B. Preimplantation Genetic Diagnosis in Italy	218
C. Preimplantation Genetic Diagnosis in England	247
D. Comparative Analysis	274
Chapter 3: Non-Invasive Prenatal Testing	303
A. Non-Invasive Prenatal Testing in Germany	303
B. Non-Invasive Prenatal Testing in Italy	327
C. Non-Invasive Prenatal Testing in England	346
D. Comparative Analysis	377
Conclusions	395
Bibliography	431
Literature	431
Materials	464

Table of Contents

Zusammenfassung	17
Table of Abbreviations	21
Introduction	27
1. Problem Statement	27
2. State of Research	36
3. Research Objectives and Methodology	39
4. Overview of the Structure	47
Chapter 1: Theoretical and Constitutional Foundations	49
A. Theoretical Foundations	49
I. Ethically Controversial Health Technologies	49
1. Health Technologies and Ethical Pluralism	49
2. The Bioethical Approach	52
3. Ethical Concerns in the Field of Reproductive Technologies	55
a. What is Special about Reproductive Technologies: The Question of Moral Status and Personhood	55
b. Preimplantation Genetic Diagnosis and Non-invasive Prenatal Testing	57
i. Admissibility	57
ii. Public Funding	61
II. Between Ethical and Legal Concerns: Ethics and Law as Two Separate Systems	65
1. Descriptive Separation of Ethics and Law	65
a. A Positivist Approach	65
b. Ethical Concerns Turned Legal	68
2. Normative Separation of Ethics and Law	71
a. Preservation of Ethical Autonomy and Pluralism	71
b. Ethical Neutrality of the State	74
c. The Separation of Ethics and Law from an Intra-Legal Perspective	76

B. Constitutional Foundations of the Separation of Ethics and Law	78
I. Ethical Neutrality of the State in Germany	78
1. Constitutional Foundations	78
2. Ethical Neutrality of the State in the Field of Health Technologies	87
a Neutralty of the State and the Fundamental Right to Personal Freedom and Physical Integrity	87
b Neutralty of the State and the Statutory Health Insurance	91
II. Italian Laicity	99
1. The Principle of Laicity in the Constitution	99
2. Laicity in the Field of Health Technologies	108
a Laicity and the Fundamental Right to Health	108
b The Principle of Laicity in the National Health Service	117
III. Procedural Principles and Accountability for Reasonableness in England	126
1. Constitutional Framework	126
a Procedural Principles and Political Constitutionalism	126
b A Secular and Neutral State	132
2. Procedural Legitimacy and Accountability for Reasonableness in the Field of Healthcare Technologies	137
a Building Consensus	137
i. Ethics and Law in Courts' Decisions	137
ii. Acceptability of Legislation through Procedural Legitimacy	144
b Judicial Review and Accountability for Reasonableness	150
i. Procedural Duties and Rights in the NHS	150
ii. Reasonableness and Relevancy in Judicial Review	156
iii. Accountability for Reasonableness in the NHS	164
IV. Comparative Findings	167
1. Constitutional Framework	167
2. Coverage and Reimbursement of Ethically Controversial Health Technologies	169

Chapter 2: Preimplantation Genetic Diagnosis	175
A. Preimplantation Genetic Diagnosis in Germany	175
I. PGD in the Embryo Protection Act	175
1. Ethical Approach	175
2. Initial Uncertainty	177
a Legislative Proposal and Public Debate	177
b Case Law	181
3. Legislative Intervention	185
a Reform Preparation	185
i. The Introduction of Three Draft Bills	185
ii. Opinion of the German Ethics Council	188
iii. Parliamentary Debates	189
b Introduction of §3a Embryo Protection Act	192
c Ethics and Law in PGD Regulation	193
d PGD Ethics Commissions	199
i. Procedure before the Ethics Commissions	199
ii. PGD Commissions before the Administrative	
Courts	203
iii. Influence on Patients' Uptake of PGD	206
II. PGD in the Statutory Health Insurance	209
1. Lack of Public Coverage	209
2. Reform Proposals	215
B. Preimplantation Genetic Diagnosis in Italy	218
I. PGD in Law no. 40/2004	218
1. Ethical Approach	218
2. Initial Uncertainty	223
a Ministerial Guidelines and First Case Law	223
b PGD for Infertile Couples: Tacit Approval of the	
Constitutional Court	229
c PGD for Fertile Couples	231
3. Constitutional Court Intervention	233
II. PGD in the National Health Service	237
1. Lack of National Public Coverage	237
2. Direct Application of Constitutional Principles in the	
Case Law	242

C. Preimplantation Genetic Diagnosis in England	247
I. PGD in the Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990	247
1. Ethical Approach	247
2. Initial Uncertainty	252
a HFEA's Licensing of PGD	252
b Case law on PGD	258
c Emergence of 'Regulatory Disconnections'	261
3. Legislative Intervention	264
a Reform preparation	264
b The Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act (2008)	266
II. PGD in the NHS	270
1. Initial Lack of National Public Coverage	270
2. Central Commissioning of PGD as Specialised Service	272
D. Comparative Analysis	274
I. Development and Instruments of PGD Regulation	274
1. PGD within the Regulation of Fertility Treatments	274
2. Role of Case Law and Legislation in the Adoption of PGD Regulation	276
3. Substantial and Procedural Tools of PGD Regulation	278
II. Ethical Concerns in PGD Regulation	283
1. Public Debates and Legislative Process	283
2. Statutory Texts and Implementation	285
3. Acceptance of PGD Regulation	288
III. PGD in the Public Healthcare System	289
1. Public Funding	289
2. Influence of Ethical Concerns on Public Funding and Patient Uptake	290
IV. Coherence with the Normative Framework	292
1. PGD Regulation and Implementation	292
2. Access to PGD: The Case of the Ethics Commissions in Germany	296
3. Public Funding	298
Chapter 3: Non-Invasive Prenatal Testing	303
A. Non-Invasive Prenatal Testing in Germany	303
I. NIPT in the Private Sector	303

II. NIPT in the Statutory Health Insurance	305
1. Access to Prenatal Testing	305
a Prenatal Diagnoses in the Statutory Health Insurance	305
b Right to Know and Right Not to Know	309
2. The G-BA's Assessment of NIPT	311
a Reactions to the Initiation of the Procedure	311
b Health Technology Assessment	313
c Consultation and Parliamentary Debate	315
d Inclusion of NIPT in the Maternity Guidelines	318
3. <i>Room for Ethical Considerations in the G-BA's Assessment</i>	322
B. Non-Invasive Prenatal Testing in Italy	327
I. NIPT in the Private Sector	327
II. NIPT in the National Health Service	328
1. Access to Prenatal Screening and Diagnoses	328
a Prenatal Screening and Diagnoses in the Essential Levels of Care	328
b Informed Consent	331
2. Coverage of NIPT in Different Regional Healthcare Systems	333
3. Prospective Coverage of NIPT at the National Level	338
a Guidelines of the Italian National Health Council	338
b NIPT before the National Commission for the Updating of the Essential Levels of Care	341
c Criteria for Updating the Essential Levels of Care and Room for Ethical Concerns	342
C. Non-Invasive Prenatal Testing in England	346
I. NIPT in the Private Sector	346
II. NIPT in the NHS	349
1. Access to Prenatal Screening and Diagnoses	349
a Prenatal Screening and Diagnoses in the NHS	349
b Autonomy and Informed Consent	351
2. Evaluation Procedure before the UK National Screening Committee	354
a The UK National Screening Committee's Recommendation	354
b Reactions to the UK NSC's Assessment	358

c	Evaluative Implementation of NIPT in the NHS	362
3.	Ethical Considerations in the Assessment Procedure of NIPT	364
a	The Nuffield Council of Bioethics' Report on NIPT	364
b	Considerations of Ethical Aspects by the UK National Screening Committee	368
c	Room for Ethical Considerations in the Evaluation of Screening Programmes	372
D.	Comparative Analysis	377
I.	NIPT in the Private Sector	377
II.	Public Coverage of Traditional Prenatal Testing	378
III.	Autonomy and Informed Consent	379
IV.	NIPT in the Public Healthcare System	380
1.	Criteria for Access to NIPT	380
2.	Ethical Concerns to Public Funding of NIPT	382
a	Public Debates	382
b	Consideration of Ethical Concerns in the Evaluation Procedure	385
i.	Procedural Aspects	385
ii.	Substantive Elements	387
c	Assessment	389
i.	Compliance with the Normative Framework	389
ii.	Calls for More Consideration of Ethics in the Decision-Making	392
	Conclusions	395
I.	Summary of Argumentation	395
1.	Theoretical and Constitutional Foundations	395
2.	Case Studies	399
II.	Legitimately Dealing with Ethical Concerns	400
1.	Operationalisation and Neutrality	400
2.	Between Ethical Concerns and Legitimate Legal Interests	404
3.	Relevance of the Institutional Interplay	407
4.	Ethical Considerations in the Public Funding of Health Technologies	413
a	Neutrality in Coverage Decisions	413

b Legal and Institutional Settings	417
5. Towards a Procedural Approach to Neutrality	421
III. Closing Remarks	428
 Bibliography	431
Literature	431
Materials	464