

|          |                                                                                                            |           |
|----------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------|
| <b>1</b> | <b>Introduction</b>                                                                                        | <b>1</b>  |
| 1.1      | “There Is Something Wrong Here!” – Unpredictability and Uncertainty at the South African-Zimbabwean Border | 1         |
| 1.2      | Introducing the Subject and the Perspective of the Thesis                                                  | 6         |
| 1.2.1    | In Times of Uncertainty: Perceiving Imponderables, Pondering on Repercussions                              | 10        |
| 1.2.2    | A Wide Horizon of Expectation as a Resource                                                                | 15        |
| 1.2.3    | Sense-Making of Unclear and Unforeseen Issues, Uncertainty through Sense-Making                            | 20        |
| 1.3      | Introducing the Research Context                                                                           | 22        |
| 1.3.1    | Experiencing Migration, Practices of Making an Income, and the Border in South Africa                      | 22        |
| 1.3.2    | Historical and Geographical Positioning of the Border Area                                                 | 26        |
| 1.4      | Reflections on Access to and Positionality in the Field                                                    | 28        |
| 1.5      | Outline of the Thesis                                                                                      | 34        |
| <b>2</b> | <b>At a Crossing Point – Introducing the South African-Zimbabwean Border</b>                               | <b>39</b> |
| 2.1      | Officials and Travellers Encountering the Border                                                           | 39        |
| 2.2      | Conceptualising the South African-Zimbabwean Border                                                        | 40        |
| 2.3      | The Border as a Dangerous Place                                                                            | 44        |
| 2.3.1    | Narratives about Dangerous Border Actors and Actants                                                       | 44        |
| 2.3.2    | Officials’ Imponderable Making for Border Actors                                                           | 48        |

|          |                                                                                                              |           |
|----------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------|
| 2.4      | Questioning Practices of Border Control .....                                                                | 58        |
| 2.4.1    | Border Crossers' Questioning Practices of Border Control .....                                               | 58        |
| 2.4.2    | Border Actors' Pursuing Alternative Control of Border Processes .....                                        | 62        |
| 2.4.3    | Border Officials' Countering Practices of Border Control for Unauthorised Border Crossers .....              | 66        |
| 2.5      | Challenging Challengers: Border Officials' Countering of Their Observers .....                               | 70        |
| 2.6      | Conclusion .....                                                                                             | 76        |
| <b>3</b> | <b>The Temporariness of Categories and Local Arrangements – Asylum Seeking and Detention in Musina .....</b> | <b>79</b> |
| 3.1      | Approaching Asylum Seeking and Detention .....                                                               | 79        |
| 3.1.1    | Introduction .....                                                                                           | 79        |
| 3.1.2    | Contextualising Undocumented Migrancy, Asylum, and Detention in Musina .....                                 | 82        |
| 3.1.3    | A History of Temporary Arrangements: Asylum and Detention in Musina .....                                    | 85        |
| 3.2      | Encounters with Asylum Seeking and Detention .....                                                           | 91        |
| 3.2.1    | Migrants, Humanitarians, and Security Officials in Between: Sans Papiers, Asylum, Detention .....            | 91        |
| 3.2.1.1  | Encounters of Migrants with the Police and Humanitarians at the Stage of Asylum Seeking .....                | 91        |
| 3.2.1.2  | State Officials' and Humanitarians' Monitoring and Policing of Detainees .....                               | 99        |
| 3.2.2    | In Search of Decision-Making: Negotiations between State Actors and Humanitarian Stakeholders .....          | 106       |
| 3.2.2.1  | Struggling for Access to the Detention Facility .....                                                        | 107       |
| 3.2.2.2  | Demise or Rescue of the Migrants' Shelter? Confrontation and Cooperation of Stakeholders .....               | 110       |
| 3.3      | Conclusion .....                                                                                             | 115       |

|                                                                                                                                                     |     |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| <b>4 Migrants' Belonging and the Legal Practice of Migration – Sense-Making of Facilitated Undocumented Long-Distance Migration to South Africa</b> | 119 |
| 4.1 “The People Were Running All Over!”                                                                                                             | 119 |
| 4.2 Contextualising Facilitated Undocumented Long-Distance Migration to South Africa                                                                | 120 |
| 4.3 Speculations About the Ethiopians' Border Crossing                                                                                              | 123 |
| 4.4 The Opaque Respectively Discernible Market of Facilitated Undocumented Long-Distance Migration                                                  | 125 |
| 4.4.1 Opaque Syndicates: Deceitful Concealment of Exploitative Slavery                                                                              | 125 |
| 4.4.2 Discernible Entrepreneur Structures: Agreed Deals in the Context of Profit-Oriented Facilitation                                              | 133 |
| 4.5 Investigations into the Case: Migrants as Subjects of State Authorities or as Flexible Agents in the Legal Practice of Migration                | 141 |
| 4.5.1 Migrants as Subjects and Non-Transparent Legal Procedures in the Ethiopians' Case                                                             | 141 |
| 4.5.2 Agency and Flexibility: Migrants' Adaptability to Confinement and State Authorities' Pragmatic Decisions in Legal Matters                     | 148 |
| 4.6 Conclusion                                                                                                                                      | 152 |
| <b>5 Negotiating around ‘Human Trafficking’ in South Africa and the Border Area</b>                                                                 | 157 |
| 5.1 “Trafficking is Prone in the Border Town Musina!”                                                                                               | 157 |
| 5.2 Contextualising Human Trafficking, Cross-Border Movement, and Selling Sex                                                                       | 157 |
| 5.3 The International and South African Opinion Spectrum and Legal Range of Human Trafficking                                                       | 161 |
| 5.3.1 Historic Developments: Abolitionism of Slavery of African People and of ‘White Slavery’                                                       | 161 |
| 5.3.2 The Debates are Merged: The Palermo Protocol                                                                                                  | 164 |
| 5.3.3 Anti-Trafficking Legislation and Trafficking Paradigms in South Africa                                                                        | 166 |
| 5.4 Speculations about and Campaigns on Human Trafficking in the Border Region                                                                      | 170 |
| 5.4.1 (In)visible and (In)discernible Cross-Border Human Trafficking                                                                                | 170 |

|          |                                                                                                                                               |            |
|----------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| 5.4.2    | “Trafficking is Prone in the Border Town Musina!”<br>The Paradox Concept of Human Trafficking<br>for Sexual Exploitation .....                | 178        |
| 5.4.2.1  | Human Trafficking for Sexual Exploitation<br>in the Focus .....                                                                               | 178        |
| 5.4.2.2  | Obvious Opacity of Sexual Exploitation<br>versus Overlooked Complexities of Selling<br>Sex .....                                              | 182        |
| 5.5      | Conclusion .....                                                                                                                              | 188        |
| <b>6</b> | <b>From Hoping for Benevolence to Fearing<br/>Trafficking – Speculations about a New NGO in Musina .....</b>                                  | <b>193</b> |
| 6.1      | Glimpses into a Newly Established NGO .....                                                                                                   | 193        |
| 6.2      | Contextualising Changes in Sense-Making about the New<br>NGO in Musina .....                                                                  | 194        |
| 6.3      | About the Founder’s Refuge to South Africa<br>and about Police Investigations .....                                                           | 199        |
| 6.4      | Between Hope and Doubt .....                                                                                                                  | 202        |
| 6.5      | The Tunisia Trip as a Turning Point .....                                                                                                     | 209        |
| 6.6      | The Mutual Impact of Social Relations and Actors’<br>Involvement in the New NGO .....                                                         | 212        |
| 6.7      | The Rumour of Human Trafficking .....                                                                                                         | 215        |
| 6.8      | From Philanthropist to Perpetrator .....                                                                                                      | 219        |
| 6.9      | Conclusion .....                                                                                                                              | 222        |
| <b>7</b> | <b>Conclusion: Weaving Together Imponderable Experiences,<br/>Sense-Making of Unclear Issues, and Matters of Personal<br/>Relevance .....</b> | <b>225</b> |
|          | <b>Bibliography .....</b>                                                                                                                     | <b>235</b> |