

## Table of Contents

|                                                  |    |
|--------------------------------------------------|----|
| <b>Introduction</b> .....                        | 21 |
| I. Research Subject .....                        | 21 |
| II. Research Objectives .....                    | 22 |
| III. Research Method and Scope of Analysis ..... | 22 |
| IV. Structure of the Study .....                 | 25 |

### *Part 1*

|                                                                                                 |    |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| <b>The Development of the Normative Framework<br/>of the Brazilian Criminal Procedure</b> ..... | 27 |
| A. Historical Background .....                                                                  | 27 |
| B. The Current Code of Criminal Procedure .....                                                 | 30 |
| I. The Enactment of the Federal Constitution .....                                              | 31 |
| II. Modifications to the Code of Criminal Procedure .....                                       | 32 |
| 1. Legislative Reforms .....                                                                    | 33 |
| 2. Outcome of the Previous Reforms .....                                                        | 35 |
| 3. Latest Statutory Modifications .....                                                         | 37 |

### *Part 2*

|                              |    |
|------------------------------|----|
| <b>Country Reports</b> ..... | 40 |
|------------------------------|----|

#### Chapter 1

|                                             |    |
|---------------------------------------------|----|
| <b>Germany</b> .....                        | 40 |
| A. Introduction .....                       | 40 |
| B. Overview of the Criminal Procedure ..... | 41 |
| I. Legal Sources .....                      | 41 |
| II. Court System .....                      | 43 |
| III. Main Procedural Actors .....           | 45 |
| 1. Judges .....                             | 46 |
| 2. Prosecutors .....                        | 47 |

|                                                                                                 |    |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| 3. Defense Counsel .....                                                                        | 48 |
| IV. Procedural Phases .....                                                                     | 49 |
| 1. Investigatory Phase .....                                                                    | 49 |
| a) Evidence Gathering by the State .....                                                        | 49 |
| b) Rights of the Defense in the Investigatory Phase .....                                       | 51 |
| 2. Intermediate Proceedings: Evidentiary Standard of hinreichender Tatverdacht .....            | 52 |
| 3. Main Proceedings .....                                                                       | 53 |
| a) Preparation for the Main Hearing .....                                                       | 53 |
| b) Main Hearing .....                                                                           | 54 |
| aa) Determining Attendance of the Procedural Actors and that Evidence is Present .....          | 54 |
| bb) Defendant's Examination .....                                                               | 54 |
| cc) Evidence Taking and Closing Arguments .....                                                 | 55 |
| dd) Deliberations, Voting and Pronouncement of Judgment .....                                   | 56 |
| C. Evidence Law .....                                                                           | 57 |
| I. Introduction .....                                                                           | 57 |
| 1. Finder of Fact: Professional and Lay Judges .....                                            | 57 |
| 2. Trial Setting .....                                                                          | 58 |
| a) Officialized Factfinding .....                                                               | 58 |
| b) Rights of the Prosecution and Defense in Participating in the Presentation of Evidence ..... | 59 |
| II. Methods of Proving Facts .....                                                              | 60 |
| 1. Exceptions to the Need of Proof .....                                                        | 60 |
| 2. Strict and Discretionary Forms of Proof .....                                                | 61 |
| III. Means of Evidence .....                                                                    | 62 |
| 1. Defendant .....                                                                              | 62 |
| 2. Witnesses .....                                                                              | 65 |
| a) Rights and Duties .....                                                                      | 66 |
| b) Particularities of the Examination of Witnesses .....                                        | 68 |
| 3. Experts .....                                                                                | 69 |
| 4. Documentary Evidence .....                                                                   | 70 |
| 5. Inspection .....                                                                             | 72 |
| IV. Admissibility of Evidence .....                                                             | 74 |
| 1. Admissibility of Evidence and Rationale Behind Limiting or Excluding Evidence .....          | 74 |
| 2. Statutory and Constitutional Rules Excluding or Limiting Evidence .....                      | 75 |
| a) Protection of the Defendant's Right of Personality .....                                     | 75 |
| b) Nemo Tenetur Se Ipsum Accusare .....                                                         | 76 |
| c) Prohibited Methods of Examining the Accused .....                                            | 79 |

|                                                                       |    |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| d) Witnesses' Rights and Duties to Refuse to Testify .....            | 80 |
| aa) Right to Refuse to Testify .....                                  | 80 |
| bb) Duty to Refuse to Testify .....                                   | 81 |
| D. Evidentiary Principles and Procedural Safeguards .....             | 82 |
| I. Principle of Ascertainment of the Truth .....                      | 83 |
| II. The Defendant's Right to Request the Court to Take Evidence ..... | 83 |
| III. Principle of Free Evaluation of Evidence .....                   | 86 |

## Chapter 2

|                                                                                    |     |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| <b>The United States of America</b> .....                                          | 87  |
| A. Introduction .....                                                              | 87  |
| B. Overview of the Criminal Procedure .....                                        | 89  |
| I. Legal Sources .....                                                             | 89  |
| II. Court System .....                                                             | 90  |
| III. Main Procedural Actors .....                                                  | 91  |
| 1. Judges .....                                                                    | 91  |
| 2. Prosecutors .....                                                               | 92  |
| 3. Defense Counsel .....                                                           | 93  |
| IV. Procedural Phases .....                                                        | 94  |
| 1. Investigatory Phase .....                                                       | 94  |
| a) Evidence Gathering by the State .....                                           | 94  |
| b) Rights of the Defense Prior to Trial .....                                      | 95  |
| 2. Adjudicatory Phase .....                                                        | 96  |
| a) Issuance of a Complaint and Initial Appearance .....                            | 96  |
| b) Grand Jury or Preliminary Hearing: Evidentiary Standard of Probable Cause ..... | 97  |
| c) Arraignment and Pretrial Motions .....                                          | 99  |
| d) Trial .....                                                                     | 100 |
| aa) Jury Selection .....                                                           | 100 |
| bb) Opening Statements, Evidence Taking, and Closing Arguments .....               | 101 |
| cc) Jury Instructions, Jury Deliberation, and Announcement of the Verdict .....    | 103 |
| e) Sentencing Phase .....                                                          | 103 |
| C. Evidence Law .....                                                              | 104 |
| I. Introduction .....                                                              | 104 |
| 1. Finder of Fact: Jury and Bench Trials .....                                     | 105 |
| 2. Trial Setting .....                                                             | 106 |
| a) Party-Controlled Presentation of Evidence .....                                 | 106 |
| b) The Role of the Trial Judge .....                                               | 107 |
| aa) Role as an Umpire .....                                                        | 107 |

|                                                                                        |     |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| bb) Judicial Discretion in Presenting Evidence .....                                   | 109 |
| II. Methods of Proving Facts .....                                                     | 110 |
| 1. Evidence: Direct and Circumstantial Evidence .....                                  | 110 |
| 2. Alternatives to Formal Proof .....                                                  | 110 |
| III. Types of Evidence .....                                                           | 112 |
| 1. Testimonial Evidence: Defendant, Witnesses and Expert Witnesses .....               | 112 |
| a) Witness Competency .....                                                            | 112 |
| b) Examination of Witnesses .....                                                      | 114 |
| aa) Credibility and Rehabilitation of Witnesses .....                                  | 115 |
| bb) Impeachment of Witnesses .....                                                     | 115 |
| 2. Real Evidence: Documentary and Demonstrative Evidence .....                         | 118 |
| IV. Admissibility of Evidence .....                                                    | 120 |
| 1. Admissibility of Evidence and Rationale Behind Limiting or Excluding Evidence ..... | 120 |
| 2. Statutory and Constitutional Rules Excluding or Limiting Evidence .....             | 121 |
| a) Probative Value v. Prejudicial Effects .....                                        | 121 |
| b) Privilege Against Compulsory Self-Incrimination .....                               | 123 |
| c) Search and Seizure .....                                                            | 124 |
| d) Privilege .....                                                                     | 125 |
| e) Hearsay .....                                                                       | 127 |
| D. Procedural Safeguards .....                                                         | 129 |
| I. Safeguards to the Adversarial Trial Setting .....                                   | 129 |
| 1. Discovery Rights of the Defense .....                                               | 129 |
| 2. Compulsory Process Clause .....                                                     | 132 |
| 3. Confrontation Clause .....                                                          | 133 |
| II. Safeguards to Lay Factfinding .....                                                | 135 |
| 1. (Strict) Rules as to the Admissibility and Exclusion of Evidence .....              | 136 |
| 2. Jury Instructions .....                                                             | 136 |

## Chapter 3

|                                             |     |
|---------------------------------------------|-----|
| <b>Brazil</b> .....                         | 137 |
| A. Introduction .....                       | 137 |
| B. Overview of the Criminal Procedure ..... | 139 |
| I. Legal Sources .....                      | 139 |
| II. Court System .....                      | 142 |
| III. Main Procedural Actors .....           | 142 |
| 1. Judges .....                             | 143 |
| 2. Prosecutors .....                        | 144 |

|                                                                                   |     |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 3. Defense Counsel .....                                                          | 145 |
| IV. Procedural Phases .....                                                       | 146 |
| 1. Investigatory Phase .....                                                      | 146 |
| a) Evidence Gathering by the State .....                                          | 146 |
| b) Rights of the Defense in the Investigatory Phase .....                         | 147 |
| 2. Adjudicatory Phase .....                                                       | 149 |
| a) Filing a Bill of Indictment and the Evidentiary Standard of Justa Causa ...    | 149 |
| b) Filling a Written Reply to the Bill of Indictment and Setting a Date for Trial | 150 |
| c) Procedure of Evidence Taking .....                                             | 151 |
| d) Closing Arguments and Sentencing .....                                         | 152 |
| C. Evidence Law .....                                                             | 153 |
| I. Introduction .....                                                             | 153 |
| 1. Finder of Fact: Professional Judges .....                                      | 153 |
| 2. Trial Setting .....                                                            | 154 |
| a) Elements of Officialized Fact-Finding .....                                    | 154 |
| b) Elements of Party-Controlled Presentation of Evidence .....                    | 156 |
| II. Methods of Proving Facts .....                                                | 157 |
| 1. Information Gathered in the Investigatory Stage and Evidence Senu Stricto      | 157 |
| 2. Direct and Circumstantial Evidence .....                                       | 158 |
| III. Means of Evidence .....                                                      | 159 |
| 1. Defendant .....                                                                | 159 |
| a) Examining the Defendant .....                                                  | 160 |
| b) Duty to Attend Trial and Exception to the Defendant's Examination at Court     | 163 |
| 2. Witnesses .....                                                                | 163 |
| a) Summoning Witnesses .....                                                      | 165 |
| b) Examining Witnesses .....                                                      | 166 |
| 3. Victim .....                                                                   | 169 |
| 4. Experts .....                                                                  | 170 |
| 5. Documentary Evidence .....                                                     | 171 |
| IV. Admissibility of Evidence .....                                               | 172 |
| 1. Admissibility of Evidence and Rationale for Limiting or Excluding Evidence     | 172 |
| 2. Statutory and Constitutional Rules for Excluding or Limiting Evidence .....    | 173 |
| a) Nemo Tenetur Se Ipsum Detegere .....                                           | 173 |
| aa) Right to Silence .....                                                        | 174 |
| bb) Right Not to Be Compelled to do Something Except by Virtue of Law             | 175 |
| b) Inadmissibility of Illegally Obtained Evidence .....                           | 177 |
| c) The Witnesses' Rights and Duties to Refuse Testimony .....                     | 179 |
| d) Hearsay .....                                                                  | 180 |
| D. Evidentiary Principles .....                                                   | 181 |
| I. Principles Associated to the Officialized Factfinding .....                    | 181 |

|                                                                                      |     |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| II. Principles Associated to the Party-Controlled Presentation of Evidence . . . . . | 183 |
| 1. Principles of Audiatur et Altera Pars and (the Right) to a Full Defense . . . . . | 183 |
| 2. Principle of Equality of Arms . . . . .                                           | 184 |

### *Part 3*

|                                                                                                                             |     |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| <b>Key Concepts of Comparative Law, Comparative Study, and<br/>(Possible) Solutions to the Brazilian Criminal Procedure</b> | 186 |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|

### Chapter 4

|                                                                                                       |     |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| <b>Terminology in Comparative Law</b>                                                                 | 187 |
| A. Introduction: Misapprehension of Legal Definitions . . . . .                                       | 187 |
| B. Theoretical Framework: Procedural Models . . . . .                                                 | 188 |
| I. Definitions . . . . .                                                                              | 188 |
| II. Main Features . . . . .                                                                           | 191 |
| 1. Inquisitorial System . . . . .                                                                     | 192 |
| a) Historical Approach . . . . .                                                                      | 192 |
| b) Analytical Approach . . . . .                                                                      | 193 |
| 2. Adversarial System . . . . .                                                                       | 195 |
| a) Historical Approach . . . . .                                                                      | 195 |
| b) Analytical Approach . . . . .                                                                      | 196 |
| III. Differences in the Concept of Truth and Justice . . . . .                                        | 197 |
| IV. Structural Strengths and Weaknesses . . . . .                                                     | 200 |
| 1. Inquisitorial System . . . . .                                                                     | 200 |
| 2. Adversarial System . . . . .                                                                       | 202 |
| V. Definition of “Accusatorial” . . . . .                                                             | 202 |
| C. Legal Definitions in the Brazilian Criminal Procedure . . . . .                                    | 203 |
| I. Misdiagnosis of its Features as a Hinderance in Finding Effective Solutions . . . . .              | 203 |
| II. Defining the Predominant Evidentiary Arrangement of the Brazilian Criminal<br>Procedure . . . . . | 205 |

### Chapter 5

|                                                                                                                        |     |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| <b>The Importance of Identifying both a Country’s Normative Framework<br/>and its Legal Culture in Comparative Law</b> | 209 |
| A. Introduction . . . . .                                                                                              | 209 |
| B. Legal Translations . . . . .                                                                                        | 211 |
| I. Procedural Culture . . . . .                                                                                        | 211 |

|                                                                                                                                 |     |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| II. Importance of Understanding the Receiving Country's Institutional Context . . . .                                           | 213 |
| III. The Introduction of Legal Ideas Conducted in Disregard to a Country's Normative Framework and Procedural Culture . . . . . | 214 |
| 1. Example in the German Criminal Procedure . . . . .                                                                           | 215 |
| 2. Example in the Brazilian Criminal Procedure . . . . .                                                                        | 216 |
| C. Identifying the Brazilian Legal Culture . . . . .                                                                            | 217 |
| I. The Influence of the Historical Background . . . . .                                                                         | 218 |
| II. The Role of the Procedural Actors: The Gap Between the Normative Framework and the Legal Culture . . . . .                  | 219 |

## Chapter 6

|                                                                                                                                |            |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| <b>Comparative Study and (Possible) Solutions<br/>to the Brazilian Criminal Procedure</b>                                      | <b>222</b> |
| A. Identifying the Main Problematic Features . . . . .                                                                         | 222        |
| I. Alleged Reason: "Inquisitorial" Features . . . . .                                                                          | 222        |
| II. Possible Reasons . . . . .                                                                                                 | 224        |
| 1. Unawareness of the Indispensability of Procedural Safeguards . . . . .                                                      | 224        |
| a) Sample of Lack of Procedural Safeguards in a Setting of Party-Controlled<br>Presentation of Evidence . . . . .              | 226        |
| b) Consequences of the Lack of Procedural Safeguards in a Setting of Official-<br>ized Factfinding . . . . .                   | 227        |
| 2. Features Unrelated to the Inquisitorial Evidentiary Arrangement that Increase<br>the Risk of Judicial Bias . . . . .        | 229        |
| a) Mostly Partisan Character of the Criminal Investigation . . . . .                                                           | 229        |
| b) Lack of Division of Judicial Roles . . . . .                                                                                | 230        |
| B. (Possible) Solutions to Selected Features of the Brazilian Criminal Procedure . . . . .                                     | 231        |
| I. Lack of Effective Procedural Safeguards . . . . .                                                                           | 231        |
| 1. Initial Assessment . . . . .                                                                                                | 232        |
| 2. Countering the Structural Weaknesses Stemming from the Features of the Ad-<br>versarial Evidentiary Arrangement . . . . .   | 234        |
| a) Rights Afforded to the Defense in Gathering Evidence Prior to Trial . . . . .                                               | 235        |
| b) Rights Afforded to the Defense in Presenting Evidence at Trial . . . . .                                                    | 238        |
| aa) The Extent of the Right to Subpoena . . . . .                                                                              | 238        |
| bb) As to the Desirability of Employing Cross-Examination in Examining<br>Witnesses . . . . .                                  | 240        |
| c) Suggestions . . . . .                                                                                                       | 241        |
| 3. Countering the Structural Weaknesses Stemming from the Features of the In-<br>quisitorial Evidentiary Arrangement . . . . . | 243        |

|                                                                                                                                   |     |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| II. The Trial Judge's Access to Information that was Gathered in the Investigatory Phase and its Use in Basing a Conviction ..... | 248 |
| 1. Comparative Study .....                                                                                                        | 251 |
| a) Germany .....                                                                                                                  | 251 |
| b) The United States .....                                                                                                        | 252 |
| 2. Suggestions .....                                                                                                              | 253 |
| C. Silver Lining: A Case for the Benefits of a Trial Setting with Both Inquisitorial and Adversarial Elements .....               | 254 |
| <b>Conclusion</b> .....                                                                                                           | 257 |
| <b>Bibliography</b> .....                                                                                                         | 261 |
| <b>Subject Index</b> .....                                                                                                        | 272 |