

Hans C. Hirt

**The Enforcement of
Directors' Duties in
Britain and Germany**

**A Comparative Study
with Particular Reference
to Large Companies**

Peter Lang

Contents

Select abbreviations	13
Introduction	17
1 The theoretical framework	25
1.1 The problem underlying the subject of this book	25
1.2 The theoretical framework of legal strategies	36
1.3 The decision rights strategy	38
1.4 The ‘trusteeship’ strategy	54
1.5 The standards strategy	63
1.6 Evaluation of the framework of legal strategies	70
2 The principles underlying the enforcement of directors’ duties in British law	71
2.1 The rule in <i>Foss v Harbottle</i>	71
2.2 The principles of ratification and related doctrines	89
2.3 Evaluation	118
3 Derivative actions in British company law	121
3.1 The concept of derivative actions and procedural consequences	121
3.2 The scope of the rule in <i>Foss v Harbottle</i>	135
3.3 Three modern standing requirements for derivative actions	142
3.4 Evaluation of the law regarding the enforcement of directors’ duties	177

4	Vinelott J's model	183
4.1	<i>Prudential Assurance Co Ltd v Newman Industries Ltd (No 2)</i>	184
4.2	The propositions on which Vinelott J's model is based	186
4.3	The legal strategy underlying Vinelott J's model: Refined decision rights strategy	191
4.4	Vinelott J's use of the interests of justice 'exception'	193
4.5	Problems with Vinelott J's proposition that only disinterested shareholders are entitled to ratify	195
4.6	Evaluation of Vinelott J's model	198
4.7	Conclusion	212
5	The Law Commission's model	215
5.1	The Law Commission's proposal	216
5.2	The legal strategies underlying the Law Commission's model	236
5.3	Evaluation of the Law Commission's model	239
5.4	The CLR's recommendations	247
6	The German model	255
6.1	Aktiengesellschaft: Constitution and allocation of powers	258
6.2	The power to assert claims against members of the administrative organs	262
6.3	The shareholders' power to initiate the assertion of claims against members of the administrative organs	279
6.4	Problems with the minority shareholders' power to initiate the assertion of claims under § 147	303
6.5	The reform of the shareholders' rights regarding the assertion of claims against members of the administrative organs	317
6.6	Lessons from Germany for law reform in Britain?	334

7	The reform of the law	337
7.1	Choice of a portfolio of legal strategies	337
7.2	A reform proposal regarding the enforcement of directors' duties in large companies	348
8	Conclusion	367
8.1	The enforcement of directors' duties in Britain and Germany	369
8.2	Two main choices regarding the enforcement of directors' duties	372
8.3	The factors influencing the choice of legal strategies	376
8.4	Towards one 'best' company law system?	382
	Bibliography	385
	Index	399