# **Comparative Studies** in the History of Insurance Law

# Studien zur vergleichenden Geschichte des Versicherungsrechts

Volume/Band 4

## The Influence of Marine Insurance Law on the Legal Development of Life and Fire Insurance in England

By

**Sinem Ogis** 



Duncker & Humblot · Berlin

### SINEM OGIS

The Influence of Marine Insurance Law on the Legal Development of Life and Fire Insurance in England

# Comparative Studies in the History of Insurance Law

# Studien zur vergleichenden Geschichte des Versicherungsrechts

Edited by/ Herausgegeben von Prof. Dr. Phillip Hellwege

Volume/Band 4

## The Influence of Marine Insurance Law on the Legal Development of Life and Fire Insurance in England

By Sinem Ogis



Duncker & Humblot · Berlin

The project 'A Comparative History of Insurance Law in Europe' has received funding from the European Research Council (ERC) under the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme (grant agreement No. 647019).





Die Juristische Fakultät der Universität Augsburg hat diese Arbeit im Jahr 2019 als Dissertation angenommen.

Bibliographic information of the German national library

The German national library registers this publication in the German national bibliography; specified bibliographic data are retrievable on the Internet about http://dnb.d-nb.de.

#### D 384

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced, translated, or utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, without the expressed written consent of the publisher.

© 2019 Duncker & Humblot GmbH, Berlin
Printing: CPI buchbücher.de GmbH, Birkach

Printed in Germany

ISSN 2625-638X (Print) / ISSN 2625-6398 (Online)

ISBN 978-3-428-15881-2 (Print) ISBN 978-3-428-55881-0 (E-Book) ISBN 978-3-428-85881-1 (Print & E-Book)

Printed on no aging resistant (non-acid) paper according to ISO 9706 ⊗

Internet: http://www.duncker-humblot.de

#### Acknowledgements

The kindness, support, advice and inspiration of many people lie behind the lines of these pages, and I take great pleasure in making that sub-text explicit here. This project was completed under Phillip Hellwege's supervision at the Augsburg University. To him, I owe an immense intellectual and personal debt for helping to shape this study that eventually has become this book. I think that his wide-ranging knowledge was reflected in my attempt to explore the history of insurance from a variety of angles.

I would like to also express my deepest gratitude and regards to the European Research Council (ERC) for providing this opportunity. The present book has received funding from the ERC under the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and under the project "Comparative History of Insurance Law in Europe" (CHILE) (grant agreement No. 647019).

I am also grateful to the many archivists and librarians who made their collections available to me or who aided my search for records. In particular I would like to thank the staff of the London Metropolitan Archives, London; British Library, London; Guildhall Library, London; Chartered Insurance Institute, London; Aviva Insurers, London; and mostly to Lloyd's for the permission to access their library.

During the formative stages of my research, my ideas were clarified by discussions with Silvia Kristin Karmann, who showed me encouragement and enormous generosity during my research.

I would also like to acknowledge the debt that I owe to all my colleagues and to those whom I had a chance to discuss this subject with over these three years during the chair seminars. Special thanks are due to my CHILE group mates since all their questions have greatly assisted my understanding of the subject.

I am also grateful for the native-speaker (Michael Friedman) proofreading of the text that was made available through the grant funding.

Finally, I would like to express my love and gratitude to my family. Without my sister Selin Ogis, my husband Lorenzo Macchi, my mum Sibel Ogis and my father Mehmet Ali Ogis, this book would undoubtedly have been completed later rather than sooner.

Augsburg, June 2019

### **Summary of Contents**

Chapter 1: Introduction	17
A. State of Research	17
B. Research Question: Offspring or Gradual Convergence?	25
C. Overview	
Part I	
The Historical Development of Insurance	
Chapter 2: Marine Insurance	31
A. Lombard Street in London	32
B. The First Known Marine Insurance Policies	
C. The Book of Orders	
D. The Chamber of Assurances	37
E. An Act Concerning Matters of Insurance Among Merchants	38
F. The Development of Marine Insurance Offices	39
Chapter 3: Life Insurance	
A. First Known Life Insurance Policies	46
B. Bubble Schemes	49
C. The Development of Life Insurance Offices	52
Chapter 4: Fire Insurance	57
A. Barbon's Fire Office 1667	59
B. Corporation of London 1681	61
C. Hand in Hand Mutual Fire Office 1696	62
Chapter 5: Conclusion	65
Part II	
The Doctrinal History of Insurance Law	
Chapter 6: Essential Elements of Insurance Contracts	69
A. Insured and Insurer	69
B. Subject Matter	
C. Duration of Insurance	
D. Risk.	
E. Premium	
F. Conclusion.	125
Chapter 7: Insurable Interest	129
A. The Principle of Indemnity	130
B. Marine Insurance	
C. Life Insurance	

D. Fire Insurance	
E. Conclusion	
Chapter 8: Warranties	161
A. Warranties and Representations	161
B. Marine Insurance	
C. Life Insurance	
D. Fire Insurance	
E. Conclusion	
Part III	
Summary	
Chapter 9: Summary	209
Archival Sources	215
Other Sources	
Bibliography	
Index	

### Contents

Chapter 1: Introduction	1 /
A. State of Research	17
B. Research Question: Offspring or Gradual Convergence?	25
C. Overview	27
Part I	
The Historical Development of Insurance	
Chapter 2: Marine Insurance	31
A. Lombard Street in London	32
B. The First Known Marine Insurance Policies	
C. The Book of Orders	
D. The Chamber of Assurances	
E. An Act Concerning Matters of Insurance Among Merchants	
F. The Development of Marine Insurance Offices	
I. Lloyd's 1688	41
II. Royal Exchange and London Assurance 1720	42
Chapter 3: Life Insurance	45
A. First Known Life Insurance Policies	46
B. Bubble Schemes	
C. The Development of Life Insurance Offices	52
I. The Society of Assurance of Widows and Orphans 1699	53
II. Amicable Society 1706	54
III. Equitable Society 1762	54
Chapter 4: Fire Insurance	57
A. Barbon's Fire Office 1667	59
B. Corporation of London 1681	
C. Hand in Hand Mutual Fire Office 1696	62
Chapter 5: Conclusion	65
Part II	
The Doctrinal History of Insurance Law	
Chapter 6: Essential Elements of Insurance Contracts	69
A. Insured and Insurer	69
I. Development of the terms insured and insurer	
II. Inserting the name of the insured	72

10 Contents

1. Marine insurance	
2. Life insurance	
3. Fire insurance	
III. Conclusion	
B. Subject Matter	77
I. Marine insurance	
II. Life insurance	
III. Fire insurance	
IV. Conclusion.	
C. Duration of Insurance	
I. Marine insurance	
II. Life insurance	
III. Fire insurance	91
IV. Conclusion.	
D. Risk	94
I. Defining the risk	
II. Excluded risks	
III. The risk of fire in marine insurance	
IV. Insuring the lives of mariners	. 106
V. Insuring slaves against the perils of the sea	
E. Premium	
I. Calculating the premium	
II. Payment of the premium	
III. Return of the premium	
F. Conclusion.	
Chapter 7: Insurable Interest	. 129
A. The Principle of Indemnity	
B. Marine Insurance	. 133
I. The position before 1745	. 133
1. The "lost or not lost" clause	. 135
2. The "interest or no interest" clause	. 137
II. The position after 1745	. 139
III. Who has an insurable interest?	. 141
IV. The nature of an insurable interest: pecuniary interest	. 143
C. Life Insurance	. 144
I. The position before 1774	. 144
II. The position after 1774	. 147
1. The 1774 Act and its effect on the case law	
2. The 1774 Act and its effect on the conditions of the insurance offices	149
III. The nature of an insurable interest	150

Contents 11

D. Fire Insurance	. 152
I. An application of the 1774 Act in fire insurance?	. 152 157
E. Conclusion	. 159
Chapter 8: Warranties	. 161
A. Warranties and Representations.  B. Marine Insurance	
I. Warranty of seaworthiness	. 166
The development of the warranty of seaworthiness	. 168 . 169
II. Warranty of non-deviation	. 172
The development of the implied warranty of non-deviation      Deviation due to necessity	. 174
III. Conclusion	. 178
C. Life Insurance	. 178
I. Warranty of good health	. 179
The development of the warranty of good health      Warranty of good health and insuring the life of a third party      Is the warranty as to health related habits a continuing warranty?      Establishing the insured's state of health	. 187 . 188
II. Altering the insured risk by travel	
D. Fire Insurance	. 193
I. Description and classification of the building and goods  II. Proof of loss  III. Altering the insured risk	. 195
Altering the structure of a building, its use or the location of goods      Necessary repairs	
E. Conclusion	. 204
Part III	
Summary	
Chapter 9: Summary	. 209
Archival Sources	
Other Sources	
Bibliography	. 219
Index	. 241

#### **Abbreviations**

A. & E. Adolphus and Ellis

A.C. Appeal Cases, Law Reports

Add. Additional
Anon. Anonymous
App.Cas. Appeal Cases

Art. Article(s)

Atk. Atkyns' Chancery Reports

B. & A. Barnewall & Alderson's King's Bench ReportsB. & C. Barnewall & Cresswell's King's Bench Reports

B. & S. Best & Smith's Queen Bench Reports

Bing. Bingham's Common Pleas Reports

BL British Library

Bl. H. Henry Blackstone's Common Pleas Reports
Bl. W. William Blackstone's King's Bench Reports

Bli. N.S. Bligh's Reports, House of Lords

Bos. & Pul. Bosanquet & Puller's Common Pleas Reports

Bro. P.C. Brown's Parliamentary Cases

Burr. Burrow's Reports

c. Contra

C. & M. Crompton & Meeson's Exchequer Reports

C.B. Common Bench Reports

C.B. (N.S.) Common Bench Reports, New Series

C.P. Common Pleas

Camp. Campbell's Nisi Prius Cases

Car. & P. Carringhton & Payne's Nisi Prius Reports

cf. Confer/ Conferatur (compare)
Ch.D. Chancery Division Law Reports

Co. Company

Co.Inst. Coke's Institutes
Com.Rep. Comyns Reports

#### Abbreviations

Comb. Comberbach's King's Bench Reports

Cowp. Cowper King's Bench Reports
Cranch Cranch's Supreme Court Reports

D. Division

14

Douglas's Reports

E. & B. Ellis & Blackburn's Queen's Bench Reports

E.B. & E. Ellis, Blackburn & Ellis's Queen's Bench Reports

e.g. exempli gratia (for example)

East's Term Reports, King's Bench

ed. / eds. Editor /Editors

edn. Edition

Eq. Cas. Abr. Abridgment of Cases in Equity
Esp. Espinasse's Nisi Prius Reports

Ex. Exchequer Reports

f. following

F. & F. Foster & Finlayson's Nisi Prius Reports

ff. folios following

fn. footnote Geo. George

H. & G. Harris & Gill's Maryland Reports

H. & M. Hemming & Miller's Chancery ReportsH. & N. Hurlstone & Coltman's Exchequer Reports

H.L. House of Lords

H.L.C. Clark & Finnelly's House of Lords Cases

Harl Harleian

Holt's Nisi Prius Reports

i.e. id est (that is)
Ins. Insurance

K. & J. Kay & Johnson's Vice Chancellor's Reports

K.B. Kings Bench

K.B.D. King's Bench DivisionKeny. Kenyon's Notes of Cases

L Lloyd's

Ld.Raym. Lord Raymond's King's Bench and Common Pleas Reports

Abbreviations 15

L.R. Law Reports

L.T. Law Times Reports

Lev. Levinz's King' Bench and Common Pleas Reports

Lloyd's Rep. Lloyd's Law Reports

LMA London Metropolitan Achieves

Lutw. Lutwyche's Entries and Reports, Common Pleas

M. & S.Maule & Selwyn's King's Bench ReportsM. & W.Meeson & Welsby's Exchequer Reports

Man. & G. Manning & Granger's Common Pleas Reports

Mod. Modern Reports

Moo. N.S. Moore's New Series

Mood. & M. Moody and Malkin's Nisi Prius Reports

MS. Manuscript
No. Number

P.Wms. Peere-Williams' Chancery & King's Bench Cases

Pa. Pennsylvania Supreme Court Reports

Park Ins. Park on Insurances

Peak. Add. Cas. Peake's Additional Cases
Peake Peake's Nisi Prius Reports

rev. edn. Revised Edition

Q.B. Queen's Bench Reports
Q.B.D. Queens's Bench Division
s. v. sub vocibus (under the word)
Salk. Salkeld's King's Bench Reports

sec. Section

Show. Shower's Parliamentary Cases
Show. K.B. Shower's King's Bench Reports
Str. Strange's King's Bench Reports
Sty. Style's King's Bench Reports

T.L.R. Times Law Reports

T.R. Durnford & East's Term Reports, King's Bench

Taunt. Taunton's Common Pleas Reports

v. Versus

Vern. Vernon Chancery Reports

vol. Volume

### **Chapter 1: Introduction**

#### A. State of Research

Insurance has a long-standing history. Another term which is often found in English historical materials is that of assurance. In early periods, both terms were used interchangeably. Both a policy of insurance and a policy of assurance signified a note or bill of security or indemnity. However, assurance is the older term. It was first used in marine, life and fire insurance alike. This use of the term is retained in the names of long-established insurance companies, such as the London Assurance Corporation. The first author who drew a distinction between the concepts of assurance and insurance was Charles Babbage (1791–1871) in his "Comparative View of the Various Institutions for the Assurance of Lives", published in 1826. There were other authors such as Cornelius Walford, William Farr and George C. Sprague who also discussed the difference between the two terms. Some preferred the term assurance for life assurance and the term insurance for marine and fire insurance, while others have continued to use the terms indiscriminately. For a historical analysis, the distinction between the two concepts is of no importance.

During the early centuries of its history, insurance had its most common appearance in maritime commerce. J.L. Longnaker illustrates the purpose of marine insurance by reference to a story of two Chinese farmers.<sup>2</sup> They were selling rice at the market of a distant city, located on a river mouth. Each farmer had his own boat, and every year each had to ship his rice down the river to the city. However, both farmers were exposed to the risks of accidents and pirate attacks. In reaction, each farmer loaded half of his rice onto the other farmer's boat in order to share the risk of loss.

This form of risk sharing could be analysed as a form of insurance as it involved two individuals splitting a risk between them.<sup>3</sup> However, many authors do not classify such early forms of risk sharing as insurance.<sup>4</sup> These authors argue that insurance by definition requires the existence of a contractual agreement,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> See *Marshall*, vol. 1 (3<sup>rd</sup> edn., 1823), 290; *Babbage* (1826), vii; *Hopkins* (1867), 47; *Walford*, vol. 1 (1871), 206; *Joyce*, vol. 1 (1897), 37 f.; *Kerr* (1902), 4 f.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> On what follows *Longnaker* (1962), 643.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Abdel-Khalik (2014), 113.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Longnaker (1962), 643.

and early forms of risk sharing, such as in the case of the two Chinese farmers, were not based on any kind of contract.<sup>5</sup>

When arguing on the basis of any definition of insurance – particularly in an analysis of the history of insurance law in England – it has however to be remembered that such a definition did not make an appearance in England until the early seventeenth century. It was only the Act of 1601, the Act Concerning Matters of Assurances amongst Merchants,<sup>6</sup> which defined the concept of insurance. It was only in the eighteenth century that English literature followed in defining insurance.<sup>7</sup> By contrast, the French Guidon de La Mer had defined a contract of insurance already much earlier.<sup>8</sup> The English Act of 1601 stated:

"Whereas it hathe bene tyme out of mynde an usage amongste Merchantes, both of this Realme and of forraine Nacyons, when they make any greate adventure (speciallie into remote partes) to give some consideracon of Money to other psons (which comonlie are in noe small number) to have from them assurance made of their Goodes Merchandizes Ships and Things adventured, or some parte thereof, at suche rates and in suche sorte as the Parties assurers and the Parties assured can agree, whiche course of dealinge is comonlie termed a Policie of Assurance; by means of which Policies of Assurance it hathe come to passe, upon the losse or perishinge of any Shippe there followethe not the undoinge of any Man, but the losse lightethe rather easilie upon many [...]. Provided nevtheles, That noe Comyssioner shall intermeddle in the execucon of any suche Comission, in ay cause or matter of Assurance where hymselfe shalbe either a partie assurer, or assured, in the same Assurance".

In the early seventeenth century, marine insurance contracts could also cover the risk of fire and the risks of the captivity and death of crew members and ship masters. <sup>10</sup> In later centuries these risks were addressed by separate contracts: fire and life insurance contracts. Thus, in the later centuries, when cargo was destroyed by fire and members of the crew were killed, the insured might have had different claims against different insurers based on different types of insurance contracts. Thus, in later centuries there occurred a diversification of the insurance market and of insurance products. For instance, in 1822 the Imperial Insurance Company was established primarily for the purpose of insuring houses and buildings against fire, but it also insured "Goods, Wares, and Merchandizes, and Manufacturing Stock, and Ships, Barges, and other Vessels, in Port or in Dock, and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Hendriks (1851), 121; Longnaker (1962), 643, 645.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> On the Act see pp. 38 ff., below.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Magens (1755), 1; Millar (1787), 2; Park (1789), ii. Park was the first English lawyer who wrote on insurance. Magens was born in Germany; Millar was Scottish.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Chapter 1, Art. 1: "Asseurance est un contract par lequel on promet indemnité des choses qui sont transportées d'un pays en autre, specialement par la mer, et ce par le moyen du prix convenu à tant pour cent, entre l'asseurè qui fait ou fait faire le transport, et l'asseureur qui promet l'indemnité." *Pardessus*, vol. 2 (1831), 377.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> The Statutes of the Realm, vol. 4/2 (1993), 978 f.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> See pp. 94 ff., below.

Goods on-board the same; also, Ships and other Vessels Building or Repairing; also, Barges and other Vessels on Navigable Rivers, Canals, and other Inland Navigations, and Goods on-board thereof, from Loss or Damage by Fire."<sup>11</sup>

Thus, it seems that fire insurance and life insurance were offspring of marine insurance. Against this background it would seem plausible that insurers (in their practice and contract terms) as well as the courts (in their decisions) applied similar principles in cases of life and fire insurance as had been developed in marine insurance. Thus, it would seem plausible that fire insurance law and life insurance law, too, were offspring of marine insurance law. It is the objective of the present study to verify, qualify or rebut this proposition and to examine the exact influence of marine insurance law on the development of life insurance law and fire insurance law in England.

The idea that fire insurance law and life insurance law have simply developed from marine insurance law is shared among English historians, and the notion finds direct support in the rich body of contemporary literature regarding each type of insurance. Already in the eighteenth century, scholars of insurance law had claimed that marine insurance law had influenced the other types of insurance. For instance, James A. Park observed in 1789:

"Policies on lives are equally vitiated by fraud or falsehood, as those on marine insurances; because they are equally contracts of good faith, in which the underwriter, from necessity, must rely upon the integrity of the insured for the statement of circumstances. Indeed, the case of Wittingham v. Thornborough, which we took the occasion to cite in support of the doctrine laid down in the chapter upon fraud in Marine Insurances, was a policy upon a life insurance. – In other case, the principles of fraud were considered as far as it affects this contract." <sup>13</sup>

Park focused on marine insurance, and he gives only a short summary of life and fire insurance. It is not clear why his treatment of life and fire insurance was so short. It might have been that life and fire insurance practices were simply non-existent during the eighteenth century, so that there was nothing for him to analyse. Or Park may have believed that the practices and principles of marine insurance had been applied to life and fire insurance, and for that reason he could

<sup>11</sup> LMA, MS. 15000.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Prior to the eighteenth century, there is no English literature on insurance. *Rossi*, Elizabethan England (2016), 1, gives the following explanation for this: "Before then, the common opinion was – and still largely is – that insurance in England was not really a serious business until (at the very least) the late seventeenth century. Thus, the early history of insurance in England has traditionally received poor attention by legal historians. Over the past decades, however, some studies by non-legal historians have raised some interest in the subjects. Although inevitably not focused on the legal aspects of insurance, they provided important material for legal historians, who recently began to investigate the subject more carefully."

<sup>13</sup> Park (1789), 496 f.