

Table of Contents

| | | |
|--------|---|----|
| 1 | Introduction | 17 |
| 1.1 | Resettlement in the EU context | 17 |
| 1.2 | US resettlement policy as point of reference | 21 |
| 1.3 | Relevance of the topic | 23 |
| 1.4 | Methodology and structure | 26 |
| 2 | The concept of refugee resettlement entrenched in international and EU law | 27 |
| 2.1 | Responsibility sharing through resettlement | 27 |
| 2.1.1 | Responsibility sharing at the international level: left to the discretion of states | 28 |
| 2.1.2 | Responsibility sharing at the EU level: mandatory relocation failed | 30 |
| 2.1.3 | Preliminary conclusion | 32 |
| 2.2 | Defining resettlement | 33 |
| 2.2.1 | The United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees | 33 |
| 2.2.2 | The European Union | 40 |
| 2.2.3 | The United States of America | 43 |
| 2.2.4 | Preliminary conclusion | 44 |
| 2.3 | Historical background and development of resettlement (with focus on the US) | 44 |
| 2.3.1 | The beginning of systematic and organized resettlement | 44 |
| 2.3.2 | Resettlement under the UNHCR | 47 |
| 2.3.3 | Adjustments in US immigration law | 48 |
| 2.3.4 | The Hungarian exodus | 49 |
| 2.3.5 | Towards a more diverse US immigration policy | 51 |
| 2.3.6 | The mechanized resettlement of Vietnamese | 52 |
| 2.3.7 | The 1980 Refugee Act | 54 |
| 2.3.8 | The disintegration of Yugoslavia | 54 |
| 2.3.9 | The decade of voluntary repatriation and reconceptualization of resettlement | 55 |
| 2.3.10 | Convention Plus | 57 |
| | | 11 |

| | | |
|---------|---|----|
| 2.3.11 | The terrorist attacks of 9/11 | 58 |
| 2.3.12 | Harmonization efforts | 58 |
| 2.3.13 | Regained recognition of resettlement | 59 |
| 2.3.14 | The 2015-2016 refugee crisis | 60 |
| 2.3.15 | The Trump administration | 61 |
| 2.3.16 | Afghan mass displacement and the revival of parole power | 64 |
| 2.3.17 | Attempts towards private sponsorship | 66 |
| 2.3.18 | Preliminary conclusion | 67 |
| 2.4 | Functions of and motives behind resettlement | 69 |
| 2.4.1 | Functions | 70 |
| 2.4.2 | US motives | 72 |
| 2.4.3 | EU motives | 74 |
| 2.4.4 | Preliminary conclusion | 75 |
| 2.5 | Actors in the resettlement process | 77 |
| 2.5.1 | States | 77 |
| 2.5.2 | United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees | 79 |
| 2.5.2.1 | Legal basis, mandate and funding | 79 |
| 2.5.2.2 | The UNHCR and the US | 81 |
| 2.5.2.3 | The UNHCR and the EU | 82 |
| 2.5.2.4 | Criticism and shortfalls | 83 |
| 2.5.3 | Other non-state actors | 84 |
| 2.5.3.1 | Voluntary resettlement agencies in the US | 85 |
| 2.5.3.2 | From state-orientation to greater NGO-involvement in Europe | 87 |
| 2.5.4 | Resettlement beneficiaries | 89 |
| 2.5.4.1 | Refugee and subsidiary protection status in the EU | 90 |
| 2.5.4.2 | US refugee definition | 92 |
| 2.5.4.3 | Climate migrants | 93 |
| 2.5.5 | Preliminary conclusion | 94 |
| 3 | The international law framework for resettlement | 95 |
| 3.1 | The relevant human rights and refugee law framework | 95 |
| 3.2 | Extraterritorial application | 96 |
| 3.2.1 | Extraterritorial application of human rights | 97 |
| 3.2.1.1 | Legal standard | 98 |

| | | |
|-----------|--|-----|
| 3.2.1.2 | Relevant ECtHR case law, decisions of other regional courts and UN Treaty bodies | 100 |
| 3.2.2 | Extraterritorial application of refugee law | 109 |
| 3.2.3 | Preliminary conclusion | 111 |
| 3.3 | Substantive rights | 111 |
| 3.3.1 | Non-refoulement | 111 |
| 3.3.1.1 | Human rights | 115 |
| 3.3.1.1.1 | Art 3 para 1 CAT | 115 |
| 3.3.1.1.2 | Arts 6 and 7 ICCPR | 117 |
| 3.3.1.1.3 | Art 37 lit a CRC | 119 |
| 3.3.1.1.4 | Arts 2 and 3 ECHR | 120 |
| 3.3.1.2 | Refugee law | 123 |
| 3.3.1.3 | Concluding remarks | 125 |
| 3.3.2 | Right to leave and to seek asylum | 127 |
| 3.3.2.1 | Human rights | 127 |
| 3.3.2.2 | Refugee law | 130 |
| 3.3.2.3 | Concluding remarks on the right to leave and to seek asylum | 132 |
| 3.3.3 | Procedural rights | 132 |
| 3.3.3.1 | Human rights | 132 |
| 3.3.3.2 | Refugee law | 134 |
| 3.3.3.3 | Concluding remarks | 134 |
| 3.3.4 | Non-discrimination | 135 |
| 3.3.4.1 | Human rights | 136 |
| 3.3.4.2 | Refugee law | 140 |
| 3.3.4.3 | Concluding remarks | 140 |
| 3.3.5 | Reception conditions | 141 |
| 3.3.5.1 | Human rights | 142 |
| 3.3.5.2 | Refugee law | 144 |
| 3.3.5.3 | Concluding remarks | 145 |
| 3.3.6 | Naturalization | 145 |
| 3.3.6.1 | Human rights | 146 |
| 3.3.6.2 | Refugee law | 147 |
| 3.3.6.3 | Concluding remarks | 148 |
| 3.3.7 | Preliminary conclusion | 148 |
| 3.4 | Responsibility for internationally wrongful conduct in relation to resettlement policies | 150 |
| 3.4.1 | Responsibility for complicity with the country of (first) refuge | 151 |

| | | |
|----------|---|-----|
| 3.4.2 | Responsibility for and in connection with international organizations | 156 |
| 3.4.2.1 | Dual attribution | 161 |
| 3.4.2.2 | Derivative responsibility | 162 |
| 3.4.3 | Attribution of conduct of other non-state actors and private actors | 166 |
| 3.4.4 | Preliminary conclusion | 168 |
| 4 | Resettlement to the EU | 170 |
| 4.1 | EU competence and its limits | 170 |
| 4.1.1 | Rules of competence | 174 |
| 4.1.1.1 | Centralized assessment | 175 |
| 4.1.1.2 | Extraterritorial processing | 178 |
| 4.1.1.3 | Cooperation with third countries | 179 |
| 4.1.2 | Principles governing the exercise of EU competences | 181 |
| 4.1.2.1 | Solidarity and fair sharing of responsibility | 181 |
| 4.1.2.2 | A policy in accordance with international refugee law and international and European human rights | 187 |
| 4.1.2.3 | Consistency | 191 |
| 4.1.3 | Preliminary conclusion | 194 |
| 4.2 | Evolution of an EU resettlement policy | 194 |
| 4.2.1 | Intergovernmental rapprochement by three Conventions | 195 |
| 4.2.2 | First attempts on solidarity and responsibility sharing | 198 |
| 4.2.3 | Calling upon resettlement | 200 |
| 4.2.4 | Protection in the region | 202 |
| 4.2.5 | Proposal for extraterritorial processing and third-country partnerships | 204 |
| 4.2.6 | A Joint EU Resettlement Program | 205 |
| 4.2.7 | Global Approach to Migration and Mobility (GAMM) | 206 |
| 4.2.8 | The Lisbon Treaty, mutual trust, and Dublin III | 207 |
| 4.2.9 | The 2015 European Resettlement Scheme | 208 |
| 4.2.10 | EU-Turkey Statement | 210 |
| 4.2.11 | The Proposal for a Union Resettlement Framework | 213 |
| 4.2.11.1 | The legal nature of the Proposal | 214 |
| 4.2.11.2 | Resettlement definition | 215 |
| 4.2.11.3 | Criteria to determine countries of (first) refuge | 215 |
| 4.2.11.4 | Eligibility criteria | 216 |
| 4.2.12 | Current resettlement policy | 218 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| 4.2.13 Preliminary conclusion | 221 |
| 4.3 Institutional involvement in resettlement | 223 |
| 4.3.1 Support through funding | 223 |
| 4.3.2 Support through agencies | 226 |
| 4.3.3 Accountability and legal protection | 232 |
| 4.3.4 Preliminary conclusion | 235 |
| 4.4 Analysis: Status quo of EU resettlement | 236 |
| 4.4.1 Resettlement processing – national or EU level? | 236 |
| 4.4.2 Implementation of the principle of solidarity and fair sharing of responsibilities – discretion or mandatory quota? | 237 |
| 4.4.3 A comprehensive CEAS – protection or migration management tool? | 238 |
| 5 The resettlement process | 243 |
| 5.1 European and US resettlement practice in comparison | 243 |
| 5.2 Selection | 244 |
| 5.2.1 Selection procedures and practices of the UNHCR and EUMS | 244 |
| 5.2.2 US procedure and practice | 251 |
| 5.2.3 Analysis | 255 |
| 5.2.3.1 Referral entities | 256 |
| 5.2.3.2 Status determination | 257 |
| 5.2.3.3 Resettlement of prioritized groups | 259 |
| 5.2.3.4 Family reunification | 260 |
| 5.2.3.5 Potential to integrate | 265 |
| 5.2.3.6 Firm resettlement | 268 |
| 5.2.3.7 Exclusion grounds | 269 |
| 5.2.3.8 Security screening and health checks | 270 |
| 5.2.3.9 Right to appeal the selection decision | 272 |
| 5.2.3.10 Resettlement contract | 273 |
| 5.2.4 Preliminary conclusion | 274 |
| 5.3 Pre-departure, arrival and placement | 275 |
| 5.3.1 Programs of EUMS | 276 |
| 5.3.2 US program and practice | 279 |
| 5.3.3 Analysis | 281 |
| 5.3.3.1 Pre-departure orientation | 282 |
| 5.3.3.2 Placement | 284 |

| | | |
|---------|--|-----|
| 5.3.3.3 | Cooperation with local governments and receiving communities | 286 |
| 5.3.3.4 | Reception conditions | 288 |
| 5.3.4 | Preliminary conclusion | 288 |
| 5.4 | Long-term integration and naturalization | 289 |
| 5.4.1 | EU law and practice of EUMS | 290 |
| 5.4.2 | US law and practice | 297 |
| 5.4.3 | Analysis | 304 |
| 5.4.3.1 | Temporary approach versus long-term integration | 304 |
| 5.4.3.2 | Economic benefits | 305 |
| 5.4.3.3 | Harmonization of permanent residence status | 307 |
| 5.4.3.4 | Naturalization | 309 |
| 5.4.3.5 | Re-resettlement | 309 |
| 5.4.4 | Preliminary conclusion | 311 |
| 6 | Conclusion | 312 |
| | Bibliography | 319 |