

Contents

Introduction — 1

- 0.1 What This Book Is About — 1
- 0.2 Prologue to the First Chapter: A Very Short Introduction to Loisy's Formative Years and Early Comparative Studies — 8

1 Comparative Religion and/as Modernist Theology: *L'Évangile et l'Église* and the *Neuilly Essais* — 16

- 1.1 On the Interpretation of *L'Évangile et l'Église* — 20
- 1.2 Comparative Religion in Adolf von Harnack's *Das Wesen des Christentums* — 26
- 1.3 *L'Évangile et l'Église* — 36
 - 1.3.1 Jesus and Judaism — 39
 - 1.3.2 Pagan Religion and the Development of Christian Doctrine and Cult — 45
 - 1.3.3 *L'Évangile et l'Eglise*: An Intermediate Conclusion — 56
- 1.4 History of Religion or History of Religions? The *Essais* and the Firmin Article "La Religion d'Israël" — 57
- 1.5 The Consequences for Loisy's Position at the *École pratique* — 69

2 An Intricate Piece of Institutional History: The Elections for the Chair of History of Religions at the *Collège de France* (1908–1909) — 75

- 2.1 On the Sources to Study the Elections and on the Election Procedures at the *Collège* — 78
- 2.2 The Complex Methodological and Historical Context — 83
 - 2.2.1 Loisy's Main Rivals — 83
 - 2.2.1.1 George Foucart — 83
 - 2.2.1.2 Jules Toutain — 85
 - 2.2.1.3 Maurice Vernes — 86
 - 2.2.1.4 Marcel Mauss — 87
 - 2.2.2 Loisy's Scientific and Ideological Image in 1908 — 88
 - 2.2.3 From Historicism to Sociology, and the Social Question in Early 20th Century France — 90
- 2.3 The Marquise Arconati-Visconti and Her *Jeudistes* — 96
- 2.4 Loisy's Appointment: Why and How? — 106
 - 2.4.1 Anticlericalism: Trump Card and Stumbling Block — 107
 - 2.4.2 Sociology Equals Socialism... — 120

2.4.3	“M. est israélite”: The Complex Role of Mauss’s Jewishness — 127
2.4.3.1	Salomon Reinach and the <i>Jeudistes</i> — 127
2.4.3.2	Reinach’s Ties with Durkheim and Mauss — 128
2.4.3.3	Philo-Semitism and Anti-Semitism in the Elections — 131
2.5	The Outcome — 138
3	Taking a Stand: Magic, Science, and Religion; History of Religions in the <i>École laïque</i> — 141
3.1	The Programmatic Inaugural Speech at the <i>Collège de France</i> (1909) — 145
3.2	<i>Orpheus</i> and the <i>Bellum Orphicum</i> — 151
3.2.1	Salomon Reinach: A Further Introduction — 152
3.2.2	The Origins of Religion According to <i>Salomon Orpheus</i> — 155
3.2.3	Loisy’s Main Criticisms — 165
3.3	Magic, Science, and Religion, or How Loisy Used Hubert and Mauss to Fight Frazer — 169
3.3.1	Magic and Religion — 171
3.3.2	Magic and Science — 176
3.3.3	Religion and Science: A Narrow Perspective — 178
3.3.4	The Emergence of the <i>Religion de l’Humanité</i> Concept — 182
3.4	History of Religions and the <i>École laïque</i> — 187
4	A Crack in the Historicist Wall: Myth Ritualism as a Weapon against the Christ Myth Theory — 195
4.1	The Christ Myth Theory in the Early 20 th Century — 201
4.1.1	Arthur Drews’s <i>Christus Mythe</i> and the Professional Comparative Study of Early Christianity — 201
4.1.2	Jesus the Mock King: The Theories of Frazer and Reinach — 208
4.2	Loisy’s Historicist Struggle with the Christ Myth — 214
4.2.1	The Mock King Theory: Testimonies from the Loisy–Reinach Correspondence — 215
4.2.2	Fighting the Christ Myth: “Le Mythe du Christ” (1910) — 217
4.2.3	Towards a Theory of Myth: A Glance at Loisy’s Letters to Cumont — 223
4.3	Myth and Ritual in <i>Les Mystères païens et le mystère chrétien</i> (1913–1914) — 228
4.3.1	The Same but Not the Same — 229
4.3.2	Loisy’s Ritualist Theory of Myth: Between Science and Anti-Protestantism — 236

4.4	The Christ Myth Debates and the Professionalization of History of Religions —	248
4.4.1	Paul-Louis Couchoud's Mythological Project and Team —	248
4.4.2	<i>Histoire du christianisme</i> Is Not <i>Histoire des religions</i> : Loisy's Jubilé (1927) —	253
5	Back to the Future: The Religion of Humanity and the History of Sacrifice —	259
5.1	The War: Nationalist Christianities and the Universal Religion of Humanity —	266
5.1.1	The Failures of Christianity: Protestant and Catholic —	268
5.1.2	Christianity Historically Revised —	274
5.2	Religion as Mystical Faith: <i>La Religion</i> (1917) —	277
5.2.1	Faith, Religion, and Morality: An Indissoluble Link —	278
5.2.2	Mysticism Versus Intellectualism and Sociology —	282
5.2.3	The Religious History of Humanity —	288
5.2.4	The Religious Future of Humanity and the Role of Sacrifice —	291
5.3	Hybridity Reigning Supreme: The <i>Essai historique sur le sacrifice</i> (1920) —	294
5.3.1	The Nature and Origin of Sacrifice —	297
5.3.1.1	Loisy's Explicit and Implicit Definition of Sacrifice —	297
5.3.1.2	The Origin of Sacrifice —	309
5.3.1.3	The Way Sacrifice Works (but Actually Doesn't Work) —	315
5.3.2	The History and the Future of Sacrifice —	318
	Conclusion —	324
	Bibliography —	331
	Unpublished sources —	331
	A) Bibliothèque nationale de France. Papiers Alfred Loisy—Correspondence —	331
	B) Bibliothèque de la Sorbonne—Victor Cousin. Correspondence received by the Marquise Arconati-Visconti, born Marie Peyrat —	331
	C) Bibliothèque Méjanes d'Aix-en-Provence. Fonds Salomon Reinach. Correspondence received by Reinach —	332
	D) Kasteel Van Gaasbeek. Correspondence by Marquise Arconati-Visconti —	332
	Published sources —	332

XIV — Contents

Index of Modern Names — 356

Subject Index — 360