

Contents

Abbreviations	17
Introduction	19
Chapter 1: Public Interest Considerations in Competition Law	25
A. Definition of Public Interest Considerations in Competition Law	25
I. The Public Interest in a General Sense: A Multifaceted Concept	25
II. The Public Interest in Competition Law: Another Paradox?	28
1. Core Objectives of Competition Law	29
2. Public Interest Considerations in Competition Law	33
a) A Negative Definition	33
b) Choice of Terminology	34
(1) "Consideration"	35
(2) "Public Interest"	35
(3) "Public Interest Considerations"	38
B. Characteristics and Functions of Public Interest Considerations	39
I. Basic Characteristics	39
1. Openness	39
2. Jurisdiction Specificity	40
3. Time Specificity	40
II. Functions	43
1. Defensive as Shields	43
2. Offensive as Swords	44
3. Dual Functions	45
C. Arguments for/against Taking into Account Public Interest Considerations	46
I. Essence of the Public Interest Dispute	46
II. Arguments against Taking into Account Public Interest Considerations	49
1. Incompatibility with the Core Objectives	50
2. Legal Uncertainty and Unpredictability	51

3. Existence of Other Specialized Rules	53
4. Compliance Cost Disadvantages	54
III. Arguments for Taking into Account Public Interest Considerations	54
1. Competition Law: Merely a Part of the Entire Policy System	55
2. State's Specific Demands beyond the Core Objectives	57
3. Openness and Flexibility	59
4. Coherence with Specialized Rules: An Integrated Approach	61
a) Absence of Specialized Rules	61
b) Side Effects on Public Interest Promotion	63
(1) Harms on Public Interest Promotion	64
(2) Benefits for Public Interest Promotion	66
(3) Developing Countries: Policy-Friendly Texture	69
5. Exaggerated Cost Disadvantages and Overlooked Cost Advantages	70
D. Conclusion of Chapter One	72
Chapter 2: Public Interest Considerations in the Merger Control Regime	75
A. Introduction: Prevalence of Public Interest Considerations	75
B. Typical Public Interest Considerations in Merger Control	79
I. The Public Interest from "Merger": General Public Interest Considerations	79
1. Fear of the Concentration of Economic Power	80
2. Employment Protection	82
3. National Champion Creation	84
II. The Public Interest from "Product": Sector-Based Public Interest Considerations	85
III. The Public Interest from "Nationality": Nationality-Based Public Interest Considerations	87
IV. Observations	91

C. How Public Interest Considerations Taken into Account in Merger Control	92
I. Explicit and Implicit Forms	92
1. Explicit Public Interest Clauses in Legislation and in Enforcement	93
a) Public Interest Considerations: Part of General Substantive Criteria	93
b) Public Interest Considerations: Exceptional Provisions	96
(1) General Public Interest Exceptions	96
(2) Sector-Specific Exceptions/Provisions	97
c) Combinations of Options	97
2. Implicit Public Interest Considerations Applied in Enforcement	99
II. Dual Functions: Shield and Sword	101
D. Institutional Arrangements for Public Interest Considerations	102
I. Single Authority Model	103
II. Dual-Authority Model	103
1. External Intervention Model	104
2. Dual Competence Model	105
E. Conclusion of Chapter Two	106
Chapter 3: Public Interest Considerations in US Merger Control	109
A. Introduction	109
B. Historical Development: Elimination of Public Interest Considerations	111
I. Merger Illegality Test: From A Multivalued Approach to An Economic Approach	112
1. From the 1950 Amendments to the 1960s: A Multivalued Approach	112
a) The 1950 Amendments: Legislative History	112
b) Since <i>Brown Shoe</i> Case: A Multivalued Approach	114
2. In the Mid-1970s: Shift to An Economic Approach	117
II. Merger Justifications: No Public Interest Benefits	120
III. Observations	121

C. Public Interest Considerations in Competition Merger Review	122
I. Types of Public Interest Considerations	122
1. Editorial Independence	122
2. National Security	124
3. National Champion Protection	127
a) <i>Boeing/Douglas</i> : FTC Non-Opposition Decision	128
b) FTC Application of <i>General Dynamics</i> Doctrine	129
II. Legal Instruments	132
1. Substantive Assessment	132
a) The <i>General Dynamics</i> Defence	132
b) The Failing Firm Defence	132
c) Quasi-Exemption for National Security Benefits	134
2. Expeditious Review Procedure	135
III. Institutional Arrangement	137
D. Public Interest Considerations in Other Specialized Reviews	137
I. Railroad Mergers: Exempt from Competition Merger Review	138
II. Bank Mergers: Shared Competences	138
III. Telecommunications mergers: Concurrent Competences	140
IV. Foreign Investment Scrutiny: CFIUS Review as a Last Resort	142
E. Conclusion of Chapter Three	144
 Chapter 4: Public Interest Considerations in EU Merger Control	147
A. Introduction	147
B. EU-Level Public Interest Considerations in EU Merger Control	152
I. Types of EU-Level Public Interest Considerations	152
1. Economic, Social and Territorial Cohesion among Member States	152
2. Industrial Policy	153
3. Data Protection	159
4. Public Security in Foreign Investments	160
5. Financial Stability	165
II. Legal Instruments	166
1. Recital 23	166
2. Substantive Assessment	169
a) As Competition Parameter: Data Protection	169

b) As Potential Competition	170
3. Merger Remedies in Energy Mergers	172
4. Procedural Derogations	174
III. Observations	175
C. Member States-Level Public Interest Considerations in EU Merger Control	177
I. Conditions of Article 21(4)	178
1. Substantive Condition 1: National Legitimate Interests	178
2. Substantive Condition 2: Appropriateness of Measures	182
3. Procedural Condition: Prior Communication Obligation and Stand-still Obligation	183
II. Consequences of Article 21(4)	184
D. Two Mechanisms in EU Merger Control	186
I. EU-Level Public Interest Considerations: The Economic Approaches	187
1. The Pure Economic Approach	187
2. The Mixed Economic Approach	188
II. Member States-Level Public Interest Considerations: The Public Interest Approach	189
1. Public Interest Justifications in EU Free Movement Law	189
2. Link between Article 21(4) and Public Interest Justifications in EU Free Movement Law	190
E. Conclusion of Chapter Four	192
 Chapter 5: Public Interest Considerations in China's Merger Control	195
A. Introduction	195
B. China's Merger Legislation	199
I. Procedural Provisions	200
II. Substantive Provisions	202
III. Enforcement Arrangement	204
IV. Legal Liabilities and Sanctions for Non-Compliance	206
V. Administrative Reconsideration and Judicial Review	207
C. Public Interest Considerations in Merger Legislation	208
I. Non-Competition Legislative Objectives of the AML	208
II. Overall Positive Attitudes towards Mergers	211

III. Public Interest Exemption Clause	213
IV. Non-Competition Factors in Merger Appraisal	213
V. National Security Review Linking Clause	215
VI. Observations	217
D. Public Interest Considerations in Merger Enforcement	217
I. Types of Public Interest Considerations	218
1. Import Security: Food and Materials	218
a) Import Security of Food	218
b) Import Security of Materials	221
2. SOE Reorganization Policy for National Champions	221
a) Chinese SOEs and Restructuring Waves	221
b) Quasi-Exemption under Merger Control	223
c) Substantive Exemption: CSR/CNR Reorganization	226
3. Development of Critical Industries	228
4. Protection of Domestic Small and Medium-Sized Enterprises	232
II. Legal Instruments	234
1. Consultation Procedure	234
2. Appraisal Factor: Development of the National Economy	236
a) Horizontal Chinese Competitors	236
b) Downstream Chinese Customers	237
c) Observations	239
3. Merger Remedies	240
a) Widened Grounds for Imposing Remedies	240
(1) Restriction of Investments	240
(2) Treatment of Non-Acquired Businesses	242
b) Behavioural Remedies with Public Interest Purposes	244
c) Divestitures: Chinese Purchasers	247
E. Conclusion of Chapter Five	250
Chapter 6: A Comparative Analysis of Public Interest Considerations in the US, the EU and China	253
A. Introduction	253
B. Types of Public Interest Considerations	254
I. Convergence	254
1. National Security Interests	254
2. National Champion Creation	255

3. Sector-Based Public Interest Considerations	256
4. Nationality-Based Public Interest Considerations	257
II. Divergence	258
1. Jurisdiction-Specific Grounds	258
2. Divergent Focuses	259
a) The US: On Welfare	259
b) China: On Economic Development	260
c) The EU: On a Balanced Range of EU Objectives	263
C. Institutional Arrangements for Public Interest Considerations	267
I. Convergence: Reliance on Single Authority Arrangement	267
II. Divergent Characteristics	268
1. Merger Enforcement: Administrative Model v. Judicial Model	268
2. Competition Authority: Competence Boundaries	270
3. Judicial Scrutiny	273
D. Manners and Impacts of Public Interest Considerations	273
I. Explicit and Implicit Manners	273
1. Common Reliance on Implicit Manners	274
2. Implicit but Not Invisible: Standards for Finding Implicit Applications of Public Interest Considerations	276
3. Implicit Manners: Positive and Negative Consequences	277
II. Impacts of Public Interest Considerations	280
1. Dimensions of Impacts	280
a) Determination of Jurisdiction	280
b) Review Procedure	281
c) Substantive Appraisal	282
2. Degrees and Directions of Impacts	283
a) Different Degrees of Impacts: Two Peak Situations	283
b) Varied Reliance on Shield and Sword Functions	285
c) Possible Reasons for Divergence	286
E. Conclusion of Chapter Six	288
Chapter 7: Rationalizing Public Interest Considerations in Merger Control	293
A. Introduction	293

B. A Three-Approach Public Interest Consideration Regime	296
I. Core: Three Balancing Approaches	297
1. The Pure Economic Approach	298
2. The Pure Public Interest Approach	299
3. The Mixed Economic Approach	301
II. Element of “How”: Explicit and Implicit Forms	302
III. Element of “What”: Types of Public Interest Considerations	303
1. General Observations	303
2. Links between “What” and the Three Balancing Approaches	305
IV. Element of “Who”: Institutional Arrangements	307
1. General Procedural Principles	307
2. Links between “Who” and the Three Balancing Approaches	309
V. Comparison and Suggestions	311
1. Comparison of the Three Approaches	311
a) The Pure Economic Approach and Its Combined Team	311
b) The Pure Public Interest Approach and Its Combined Team	313
c) The Mixed Economic Approach and Its Combined Team	315
2. Suggestions	316
a) Approach Selection: Specific to Each Public Interest Consideration	316
b) Joint Approaches and Combination Strategy	318
3. Localized Suggestions: China as an Example	319
a) Reduce Dependence on the Mixed Economic Approach	320
b) Activate the Pure Public Interest Approach	321
c) Enhance Transparency	322
C. Judicial Review	323
I. Judicial Scrutiny: Relevance to Public Interest Considerations	323
II. <i>EDEKA/KT</i> and Implications	326
1. Judicial Review of <i>EDEKA/KT</i>	326
2. Challenges and Implications	328

D. International Dimension of Public Interest Considerations	330
I. Public Interest Considerations and Conflicts	330
II. Possible International Cooperation Strategies	333
1. Bilateral Strategy: Negative Comity Principle	333
2. Multilateral Strategy	337
a) Binding Agreements	337
b) Non-Binding Cooperation	338
E. Conclusion of Chapter Seven	340
Conclusion	343
Summary in German	355
Bibliography	369