

# Contents

## **Part I Re-Examining the Role of Education Aid as a Component of the ‘Humanitarian’ Agenda in Conflict-Affected States**

<b>1 Introduction</b>	3
References	20
<b>2 Paradoxes Resulting from the Militarization of Education Aid</b>	21
2.1 Education and Politics (Paradox One)	51
2.1.1 Education as Apolitical and Tolerant	51
2.1.2 The Politicization of Education	52
2.2 Education and Security (Paradox Two)	52
2.2.1 Education as a Benchmark for Security	52
2.2.2 Education as a Benchmark for <i>Lack</i> of Security	52
2.3 Education and Basic Human Rights for Women and Girls (Paradox Three)	53
2.3.1 Education as a Route to Gender Equity	53
2.3.2 Education in the Context of Insecurity as a Facilitator of Gender Inequity	53
2.4 Education and Development (Paradox Four)	53
2.4.1 Education Aid Interventions as the Pathway to Development	53
2.4.2 Aspects of Education Aid Interventions Blocking Development	54
2.5 Education and Militarization (Paradox Five)	54
2.5.1 Education Aid Intervention as Allegedly Non-Partisan	54
2.5.2 The Militarization of Education Aid	54
References	55

## **Part II Attacks on Education: The Scope of the Problem and the Unwitting Complicity of CAFS, their Coalition Allies and the International Aid Community**

<b>3</b>	<b>Schooling as Counter-Terrorist Strategy</b>	<b>59</b>
3.1	The Scope of the Problem of Terror Attacks on Basic Education	65
3.2	On the Issue of Negotiating with the Taliban Regarding Schools as ‘Safe Zones’	66
3.3	Protocol II Additional to the 1949 Geneva Conventions and Its Implications for Protecting Schoolchildren Living in Hot Conflict Zones Within Afghanistan	67
3.3.1	The Applicability of Protocol II Additional to the 1949 Geneva Conventions to the Conflict in Afghanistan Since 2004	68
3.4	Ethical and Legal Obligations Relating to Humanitarian Educational Aid Interventions in the Midst of Ongoing Armed Conflict	69
3.5	“Hearts and Minds” Campaigns in Their Various Forms in Conflict-Affected States: The Role of Humanitarian Aid/Human Rights Organizations	72
3.5.1	Counter-Terrorism as Theatre and the Symbolic Function of Children Attending School Despite the Risk of Targeted Terror Attacks on Education	77
3.6	Monitoring Targeted Terror Attacks on Education	81
3.7	More on Counter-Terrorism Strategies That Include the Basic Education of Schoolchildren as a Component	83
3.8	Performance Indicators for the Implementation of the Right to Education Grounded on Respect for Fundamental Human Rights: Relevance to Education in a Conflict-Affected State	86
	References	93
<b>4</b>	<b>Analysis of UN and NGO Rights Rhetoric in Addressing Terror Attacks on Education: The Implications for Schoolchildren’s Security Interests</b>	<b>95</b>
4.1	Schoolchildren Exploited for Propaganda Purposes: Education Initiatives Framed as a Component in Counterinsurgency Strategy	95
4.1.1	Excerpts of Typical News Reports Regarding Attacks on Girls’ Education in Afghanistan	99
4.1.2	International Aid Organizations and the Promotion of Schooling Across Both Secure and Insecure Zones in Conflict-Affected States	108
4.2	Challenging the Legitimacy of School Attendance and Greater Access to Education as Indicia of Level of Overall Security in States Currently Immersed in the ‘War on Terror’	109
4.3	The February 2010 Mission to Afghanistan of the Special Representative of the UN Secretary General for Children and Armed Conflict: Assessment of Security Issues in Relation to Education	123

4.4 Revisiting the Topic of Community-Based Schools .....	132
References .....	135

### **Part III Attacks on Education: Issues of Accountability for *Both* Sides in the ‘War on Terror’**

<b>5 International Humanitarian Law and the Protection of Education in Conflict-Affected States .....</b>	<b>139</b>
5.1 The Protected Status of Civilian Schools Under International Humanitarian Law .....	139
5.1.1 The Entitlement of Children to ‘Special Protection’ Under IHL and the Implications for the Protection of Civilian Schools from Attack and for the Absolute Prohibition on Their Use for a Military Purpose .....	139
5.1.2 Challenging Status Quo Interpretations of IHL on the Alleged Less Privileged Status of Civilian Schools .....	142
5.1.3 Civilian Schools Used for a Military Purpose: The Intransgressible ‘Principle of Distinction’ Undermined .....	144
5.1.4 The Use of Civilian Schools for Counter-Terrorist Propaganda as a ‘Military Purpose’: Negating the ‘Principle of Distinction’ .....	146
5.1.5 More on the IHL Protection Guarantees for Civilians .....	155
5.1.6 Non-Governmental Actors and Their Potential Culpability Under IHL for Indirectly Facilitating Terror Attacks on Education .....	156
5.1.7 The Privileged Protected Status of Civilian Schools: Safeguarding Tangible and Intangible Cultural Property/Heritage .....	165
5.1.8 Examining the Implications of Articles 52 and 53 of Protocol I Additional to the 1949 Geneva Conventions for the Unqualified Protection of Civilian Schools Against Military Use During Armed Conflict .....	171
5.1.9 The Rome Statute and the Protection of Civilian Schools in Armed Conflict: Interpreting Article 8 .....	177
5.1.10 The Protection of Civilian Schools in Armed Conflict: More on the Implications of Article 53 of Protocol I Additional to the 1949 Geneva Conventions .....	181
5.1.11 Use of Unoccupied Civilian Schools for a Military Purpose and the Issue of ‘Human Shields’ .....	182
5.1.12 Lessons Embedded in Article 52(3) of Protocol I on Whether Unoccupied Civilian Schools May be Lawfully Used for a Military Purpose .....	184
5.1.13 Additional Considerations Regarding IHL and the Prohibition on the Use of Civilian Schools for Military Purposes .....	186

5.1.14	More on Schools as Cultural Objects That Serve Important Humanitarian Purposes .....	189
5.1.15	IHL and the Use of Schools for Propaganda Purposes .....	191
5.1.16	Use of an Occupied or Unoccupied Civilian School for a Military Purpose as Unlawful Under IHL .....	192
5.1.17	The Martens Clause and Its Application to the Issue of Protection of Unoccupied Civilian Schools from Attack or Use for a Military Purpose .....	195
5.1.18	More on the Basic ‘Principle of Distinction’, ‘Military Necessity’ and the Scope of IHL Protection for Civilian Schools .....	198
5.1.19	The IHL Criteria for Military Necessity as Involving Only Lawful Measures .....	200
5.1.20	The Hague Convention Article 56 and Its Implications for the Protection of Civilian Schools .....	204
5.1.21	Further Issues Regarding the Protected Status of Civilian Schools Against Use for a Military Purpose During Armed Conflict .....	206
5.2	Prosecuting Armed Perpetrators of Attacks on Education and Those Who Intentionally Allow Schoolchildren to Become Easy Targets for Terrorists .....	209
5.2.1	The ‘Grave Breaches’ Versus the ‘Serious Violations’ Designation of War Crimes Under IHL: Implications for the Protection of Schools and Schoolchildren .....	211
5.2.2	Individual States’ Handling of Accountability for International Crimes Involving Attacks on Education or Unlawful Use of Civilian Schools for a Military Purpose ....	213
5.2.3	The Worsening Plight of Schoolchildren in Afghanistan ....	215
	References .....	219
<b>6</b>	<b>Schoolchildren Knowingly Placed at Risk of Terror Attack: The Complicity of High Profile Human Rights Gatekeepers .....</b>	<b>221</b>
6.1	The Six Grave Violations of Children’s Fundamental Human Rights During Armed Conflict and a Significant Omission .....	224
6.2	The Response of High Profile Gate-Keepers to Attacks on Education .....	225
6.3	Eric H. Holder, Jr. (Attorney General) et al. v. Humanitarian Law Project et al.: The Question of Potential Culpability of NGOs in Allegedly Facilitating Terrorist Objectives .....	232
6.3.1	Dissenting Opinion of Justice Breyer, with Whom Justices Ginsburg and Sotomayor Join Dissenting .....	234
6.3.2	Analysis of the Dissenting Opinion .....	234
6.4	Humanitarian/Human Rights Rhetoric as a Smokescreen for Non-Humanitarian Objectives? .....	245

6.5 Combined Development-Military Tactics and the Consequences  
for School Security ..... 249

References ..... 253

**7 Concluding Remarks ..... 255**

7.1 A Summary ..... 255

7.1.1 The Organizational Accountability of NGOs, States and the  
UN and Its Organs for Violations of International Law ..... 261

7.2 Final Reflections ..... 267

7.2.1 The Six Grave Violations Against Children Affected  
by Armed Conflict ..... 270

References ..... 275

**Index ..... 277**