

Summary of Contents

| | |
|--|------|
| Preface..... | V |
| Notes on Contributors..... | XVII |
| List of Abbreviations and Acronyms | XXI |
| Introduction | 1 |
| Part I. Economically-dependent Workers in the EU Member States..... | 9 |
| A. Austria..... | 9 |
| B. France..... | 24 |
| C. Germany..... | 44 |
| D. Ireland..... | 64 |
| E. Italy..... | 77 |
| F. The Netherlands | 91 |
| G. Portugal..... | 117 |
| H. Slovenia..... | 135 |
| I. Spain..... | 142 |
| J. Sweden..... | 153 |
| K. Excursus: UK..... | 169 |
| L. Comparative Analysis..... | 188 |
| Part II. Protection of Economically-dependent Workers under International Labour Law..... | 223 |
| A. Economically-dependent Workers: The relevant International Labour Organization Standards | 223 |
| B. The Self-employed Persons under the European Social Charter | 242 |
| Part III. The Recognition of Economically-dependent Workers within EU Law – In Search for a Unicorn?..... | 255 |
| Part IV. ‘Economically-dependent Workers’ as Part of a Decent Economy – Final Conclusions and Proposals for Further Development..... | 277 |
| Bibliography..... | 287 |

Table of Contents

| | |
|--|------|
| Preface | V |
| Notes on Contributors..... | XVII |
| List of Abbreviations and Acronyms | XXI |
| Introduction | 1 |
| I. The aim and the background of the present research project..... | 1 |
| II. Current situation of economically-dependent workers | 3 |
| 1. Legal comparison | 3 |
| 2. International law | 5 |
| 3. European law..... | 6 |
| Part I | |
| Economically-dependent Workers in the EU Member States | |
| A. Austria (Marhold) | 9 |
| I. 'Economically-dependent workers' as a category of work..... | 9 |
| II. The legal position of economically-dependent workers from a labour law perspective.... | 10 |
| III. Social security for economically-dependent workers | 11 |
| 1. Introduction – The development of and the basic principles of the Austrian social security system | 11 |
| 2. The different categories of the insured persons | 12 |
| a) Employees | 12 |
| aa) The term..... | 12 |
| bb) Personal and economic dependency..... | 13 |
| cc) Blue-collar workers (<i>Arbeiter</i>) and white-collar workers (<i>Angestellte</i>)..... | 13 |
| b) The intermediary category of workers (<i>dienstnehmerähnliche Personen</i>)..... | 14 |
| c) The self-employed (<i>Selbstständig Erwerbstätige</i>)..... | 14 |
| 3. Values and interests in the early social security system..... | 15 |
| 4. A shift in the approach..... | 17 |
| 5. Reforms for the extension of the social security protection..... | 18 |
| a) The first wave in 1996..... | 18 |
| aa) The intermediary category of workers (<i>dienstnehmerähnliche Personen</i>) | 18 |
| bb) The real economic nature of the legal relationship | 20 |
| b) Further extension – ASRÄG 1997 | 20 |
| aa) The goals of the reform..... | 20 |
| bb) The inclusion of the 'new self-employed' in the statutory insurance..... | 21 |
| cc) Marginal part-time employees | 22 |
| B. France (Kessler/Big) | 24 |
| I. Introduction..... | 24 |
| II. The category of 'self-employed person'..... | 26 |
| 1. The fundamental binary distinction | 27 |
| 2. A border, but a permeable one | 28 |
| III. Social protection from a labour law perspective | 31 |
| 1. Personal safety..... | 32 |
| a) Occupational safety and the protection of vulnerable groups | 32 |
| b) Discrimination, whistleblowing, and data protection | 33 |
| 2. Economic security | 33 |
| a) Minimum wage and continued payment of remuneration | 34 |
| b) Collective bargaining | 35 |
| aa) A rare example of collective bargaining for the self-employed: the sector of the general insurance agents..... | 35 |

| | |
|--|----|
| bb) Protection of the labour market against social dumping | 36 |
| c) Protection against redundancy | 37 |
| d) Lifelong professional training | 37 |
| IV. Social security for self-employed persons | 37 |
| 1. The coverage of self-employed workers by the national social security system | 38 |
| 2. The financing of the social security system | 39 |
| 3. Complementary health insurance | 40 |
| 4. 'Unemployment benefits' for the self-employed | 41 |
| 5. New normative measures for some 'gig workers': private insurance and social charters | 41 |
| C. Germany (<i>Schubert</i>) | 44 |
| I. Introduction | 44 |
| II. 'Economically-dependent workers' as a category of work | 45 |
| 1. The distinction between employees and economically-dependent workers | 45 |
| 2. The distinction between self-employed persons and economically-dependent workers | 47 |
| a) The general definition of 'employee-like persons' | 47 |
| b) Homeworkers (<i>Heimarbeiter, Hausgewerbetreibende</i>) | 49 |
| c) Single-principal commercial agents (<i>Ein-Firmen-Handelsvertreter</i>) | 50 |
| d) Conclusion | 50 |
| III. The legal position of economically-dependent workers from a labour law perspective.... | 51 |
| 1. Overview of the legal position of economically-dependent workers from a labour law perspective | 51 |
| 2. The social protection of the individual (life, health, physical integrity, and integrity of the person) | 52 |
| 3. The social protection of workers as economic actors | 53 |
| a) Remuneration – contract, collective agreement, statutory minimum standard | 53 |
| b) Continued remuneration | 55 |
| c) Liability for damage | 56 |
| d) Protection against the termination of the contract | 56 |
| 4. Representation of workers | 57 |
| 5. Access to labour courts | 58 |
| 6. Conclusions | 58 |
| IV. Social security for economically-dependent workers | 58 |
| 1. The overview of the inclusion of employee-like persons in the statutory social security system | 58 |
| 2. Health insurance | 59 |
| 3. (Statutory) accident insurance | 60 |
| 4. Pension insurance | 60 |
| a) Employee-like persons as insured persons in the system of pension insurance | 60 |
| b) Sufficiency of the pension | 61 |
| 5. Unemployment insurance | 62 |
| 6. Conclusions | 63 |
| V. Summary | 63 |
| D. Ireland (<i>Doherty</i>) | 64 |
| I. Introduction | 64 |
| II. 'Economically-dependent workers' as a category of work | 65 |
| 1. The legislation | 65 |
| 2. The courts | 66 |
| 3. No 'Third Way' | 68 |
| III. The legal position of economically-dependent workers from a labour law perspective.... | 69 |
| 1. Individual rights | 69 |
| 2. Collective rights | 70 |
| IV. Social security for economically-dependent workers | 74 |
| V. Conclusion | 76 |
| E. Italy (<i>Del Conte/Gramano</i>) | 77 |
| I. 'Economically-dependent workers' as a category of work | 77 |
| 1. The coordinated continuous collaborations | 79 |
| a) The first time co.co.co. were mentioned: a procedural provision | 79 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| b) The first regulatory attempts to protect coordinated and continuous collaborators | 80 |
| c) The major reform of hetero-organised work in 2015 and the new concept of coordination | 81 |
| II. The legal position of economically-dependent workers from a labour law perspective.... | 82 |
| 1. The specific regulation of coordinated and continuous collaborations..... | 82 |
| 2. The general legal regulation of autonomous work (including coordinated and continuous collaborations)..... | 83 |
| 3. The special discipline of platform workers | 86 |
| 4. Autonomous workers' and co.co.co-s' collective rights..... | 87 |
| III. Social security for economically-dependent workers | 87 |
| F. The Netherlands (<i>Houwerzijl</i>) | 91 |
| I. Introduction..... | 91 |
| II. The rise of solo self-employment in the Netherlands..... | 92 |
| III. Inside or outside the Dutch fortress of labour law..... | 95 |
| 1. Comprehensive protection for employees | 95 |
| 2. Meagre protection for solo self-employed workers..... | 96 |
| a) Health and safety; liability for accidents and damage to others | 97 |
| b) Wages/fees..... | 97 |
| c) Protection against dismissal (no longer in effect) | 98 |
| IV. Definitions of 'employee' and 'solo self-employed worker' | 98 |
| 1. Who is an 'employee'? | 99 |
| 2. Who is a 'solo self-employed worker'?..... | 100 |
| 3. The judicial practice of the Supreme Court: the holistic assessment..... | 101 |
| V. Solo self-employed workers under Dutch social security law..... | 103 |
| 1. A certain level of protection for solo self-employed workers under (certain) social security schemes | 103 |
| 2. The notion of 'economically-dependent self-employed workers' | 104 |
| a) Homeworkers | 105 |
| b) Other employee-like persons | 105 |
| c) (De facto) Opting out of employee insurance..... | 105 |
| 3. The quest to provide legal certainty only for the independent solo self-employed..... | 106 |
| VI. The (false) self-employed under Dutch collective labour law and competition law | 108 |
| 1. Collective bargaining and (the representation of) the solo self-employed | 108 |
| 2. The Dutch Competition Authority's assessment of solo self-employed workers..... | 110 |
| 3. Minimum fees for solo self-employed workers who cannot be deemed to be undertakings | 112 |
| 4. Minimum standards for the solo self-employed workers who do qualify as undertakings? | 113 |
| VII. Concluding remarks..... | 115 |
| G. Portugal (<i>Abrantes</i>)..... | 117 |
| I. Introduction..... | 117 |
| 1. Legal dependence | 117 |
| 2. Employment contract and contract for services | 119 |
| a) The system of 'indicator facts' (<i>método indiciário</i>) | 120 |
| b) The 'primacy of facts' | 121 |
| c) The legal presumption provided for in Article 12 of the PLC | 122 |
| d) Bogus self-employment and the measures taken against it..... | 122 |
| II. 'Economically-dependent workers' as a category of work..... | 124 |
| 1. Economically-dependent work – a comparative overview | 124 |
| 2. The Employment Contract Act of 1969 | 125 |
| 3. The approaches in professional literature regarding Article 2 of the Employment Contract Act of 1969 | 126 |
| 4. Law No. 101/2009 | 127 |
| III. The legal position of economically-dependent workers from a labour law perspective.... | 127 |
| 1. General overview | 127 |
| 2. Rights and obligations of the contracting parties | 128 |
| 3. Health and safety at work | 129 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| 4. Professional qualification..... | 129 |
| 5. Remuneration..... | 129 |
| 6. Compensation in the case of the suspension or the reduction of the activity..... | 129 |
| 7. Termination of the contract | 129 |
| 8. Registration of homework..... | 130 |
| 9. Inspection of homework..... | 130 |
| IV. Social security for economically-dependent workers..... | 130 |
| 1. General overview..... | 130 |
| 2. Eventualities and contributions..... | 131 |
| V. Conclusions..... | 131 |
| 1. Economically-dependent workers under Portuguese law | 131 |
| 2. Social protection from a labour law perspective..... | 133 |
| 3. Social security for economically-dependent workers..... | 133 |
| H. Slovenia (Tičar)..... | 135 |
| I. 'Economically-dependent workers' as a category of work..... | 135 |
| II. The legal position of economically-dependent workers from a labour law perspective.... | 135 |
| 1. The definition of 'economically-dependent self-employed person'..... | 135 |
| 2. The scope of labour law protection | 137 |
| 3. The identification of economically-dependent persons..... | 140 |
| III. Social security for economically-dependent workers..... | 140 |
| I. Spain (Todolí-Signes)..... | 142 |
| I. Abstract..... | 142 |
| II. 'Economically-dependent workers' as a category of work..... | 142 |
| 1. A binary system: employees and self-employed persons | 142 |
| 2. A subcategory of self-employed persons: TRADEs as economically-dependent self-employed persons..... | 144 |
| III. The legal position of economically-dependent self-employed persons from a labour law perspective..... | 145 |
| 1. Individual rights | 145 |
| a) Working time..... | 145 |
| b) Remuneration..... | 146 |
| c) Interruption and suspension of the contract, leave of absence | 146 |
| d) Holidays..... | 146 |
| e) Termination of the contract | 146 |
| 2. Collective rights | 147 |
| a) Freedom of association | 147 |
| b) Collective bargaining..... | 148 |
| IV. Social security for economically-dependent self-employed persons..... | 150 |
| V. Health and safety regulations | 151 |
| VI. Jurisdiction | 151 |
| VII. Conclusion: the legislation applicable to economically-dependent self-employed persons is inadequate..... | 151 |
| J. Sweden (Westregård)..... | 153 |
| I. Introduction..... | 153 |
| II. Economically-dependent workers as a category of workers..... | 153 |
| 1. The concept of employee in labour law..... | 153 |
| a) Definition | 153 |
| b) The Swedish concept of employee in relation to the EU concept of worker..... | 155 |
| c) The concept of employee in collective agreements | 156 |
| 2. The concept of employee in social security legislation..... | 156 |
| a) Definition | 156 |
| b) Examples of differences in the assessment of the criteria..... | 157 |
| c) Economically-dependent workers..... | 158 |
| 3. 'Dependent contractor' as a subcategory of 'self-employed' | 158 |
| a) Definition of the concept of dependent contractor..... | 158 |
| b) Legal consequences of being a 'dependent contractor'..... | 158 |
| c) Background and outlook for the future | 159 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| 4. Conclusion | 160 |
| III. The legal position of economically-dependent workers from a labour law perspective.... | 160 |
| 1. Statutory labour legislation | 160 |
| a) The scope of the labour legislation | 160 |
| b) Statutory regulations that extend beyond the employment relationship | 160 |
| 2. Collective agreements | 161 |
| a) Working conditions and minimum wages | 161 |
| b) Collective agreements for economically-dependent workers | 161 |
| 3. Unions and the organisation of economically-dependent workers | 163 |
| 4. The role of the courts | 163 |
| 5. Conclusion | 163 |
| IV. Social security for economically-dependent workers | 164 |
| 1. Social security legislation | 164 |
| a) The scope of the social security legislation | 164 |
| b) Unemployment insurance | 164 |
| c) Sickness benefits, parental benefits, and occupational injury annuity | 165 |
| d) Sickness benefit qualifying income (SGI) for the calculation of sick pay and parental allowance | 166 |
| e) Retirement and old-age benefits | 166 |
| 2. The financing of the social security system | 167 |
| 3. Who is responsible for paying taxes and social contributions? | 167 |
| 4. Conclusion | 168 |
| V. Conclusions | 168 |
| K. Excursus: UK (Davies) | 169 |
| I. Introduction | 169 |
| II. Workers and economically-dependent workers in labour law | 169 |
| 1. 'False' self-employment | 170 |
| 2. 'Worker' in employment legislation | 171 |
| 3. 'Worker' in equality law | 174 |
| 4. 'Worker' in EU law | 175 |
| 5. Economic dependence | 177 |
| 6. Employment rights for workers | 179 |
| 7. Conclusion | 181 |
| III. Workers and economically-dependent workers in social security law | 181 |
| 1. Contributory benefits | 182 |
| 2. Non-contributory benefits | 185 |
| 3. Statutory sick pay | 185 |
| 4. Conclusion | 186 |
| IV. Conclusion | 186 |
| L. Comparative Analysis (Schubert) | 188 |
| I. Introduction | 188 |
| II. 'Economically-dependent worker' as a legal notion | 189 |
| 1. The definition of 'employee' or 'employment contract' as the point of departure regarding social protection | 189 |
| 2. Extending the scope of labour law through a broad notion of 'employment relationship' | 191 |
| 3. 'Economically-dependent worker' as a legal category and its position in the legal systems examined | 193 |
| 4. Criteria for the definition of 'economically-dependent worker' | 194 |
| a) No uniform definition among the countries examined | 194 |
| b) 'Economic dependence' as a legal criterion and the substitutes for it | 195 |
| aa) Austria, Germany, Portugal, Slovenia and Spain | 195 |
| bb) Italy and the UK | 196 |
| cc) The Netherlands | 198 |
| 5. Conclusions | 199 |
| III. Social protection for economically-dependent workers through labour law | 200 |
| 1. Sui generis regulation or the selective extension of labour law | 200 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| 2. The categories of social protection through labour law | 202 |
| 3. The satisfaction of economic needs and/or the removal of or the transfer of economic risks..... | 205 |
| 4. The reconciliation of family life and working life | 207 |
| 5. Health and safety at work | 208 |
| 6. The protection of personal rights..... | 209 |
| 7. Judicial and/or administrative safeguards..... | 210 |
| 8. Collective bargaining and collective agreements as means of autonomous self-help | 210 |
| a) Comparative overview | 210 |
| b) The impact of competition law | 212 |
| 9. Conclusions..... | 214 |
| IV. Social protection for economically-dependent workers through social security law..... | 215 |
| 1. Economically-dependent workers in the national social security systems..... | 215 |
| 2. Benefits from the social security scheme | 216 |
| 3. Contributions to the social security schemes..... | 219 |
| 4. Conclusions..... | 219 |
| V. Final conclusions | 220 |

Part II

Protection of Economically-dependent Workers under International Labour Law

| | |
|--|------------|
| A. Economically-dependent workers: The relevant International Labour Organization Standards (<i>Trebilcock</i>)..... | 223 |
| I. Overview..... | 223 |
| II. Constitutional and policy framework..... | 224 |
| III. Standards on labour market governance and statistical measurement tools..... | 225 |
| 1. Background..... | 225 |
| 2. Instruments on home work | 226 |
| 3. Attempts to regulate 'contract labour' | 227 |
| 4. The Employment Relationship Recommendation..... | 228 |
| 5. Guidance on labour statistics | 229 |
| a) The 2013 ICLS resolution | 229 |
| b) The 2018 ICLS resolution | 230 |
| 6. Recommendation No. 204 addressing the 'informal economy'..... | 231 |
| 7. The 2020 CEACR General Survey | 232 |
| IV. Fundamental principles and rights at work | 233 |
| 1. Freedom of association and collective bargaining | 233 |
| 2. Prohibition of forced labour and elimination of child labour | 236 |
| 3. Elimination of discrimination | 236 |
| V. Standards on social protection | 237 |
| VI. Standards applicable to particular categories of workers who may be economically dependent..... | 239 |
| VII. Conclusion | 240 |
| B. The Self-employed Persons under the European Social Charter (<i>Schlachter</i>)..... | 242 |
| I. The context of worker protection in the European Social Charter | 242 |
| 1. The development of the Charter | 242 |
| 2. The personal scope of the Charter and its Articles..... | 243 |
| II. The means of the interpretation of the Charter..... | 244 |
| III. The interpretation of specific provisions of the Charter..... | 247 |
| 1. Article 3: The right to safe and healthy working conditions | 247 |
| 2. Article 6 paragraph 2: The right to bargain collectively and to conclude collective agreements | 249 |
| 3. Article 7 paragraph 1: The right of children and young persons to protection – setting the minimum age of admission to employment at 15 years..... | 250 |
| 4. Article 8 paragraph 5: The right of employed women to protection of maternity – prohibition of work in underground mining and of all other work of dangerous, unhealthy or arduous nature | 251 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| 5. Article 18 paragraph 3: The right to engage in a gainful occupation in the territory of other Parties – the liberalisation of the regulations governing employment | 252 |
| 6. Article 19 paragraph 10: The protection of self-employed migrant workers..... | 252 |
| IV. Conclusions..... | 253 |

Part III

The Recognition of Economically-dependent Workers within EU Law – In Search for a Unicorn? (*Krause*)

| | |
|---|-----|
| I. Introduction..... | 255 |
| II. Taking stock of EU law..... | 256 |
| 1. Lack of a legal definition of ‘economically-dependent worker’ | 256 |
| 2. Freedom of movement for workers as a point of reference..... | 257 |
| 3. Social protection for self-employed persons..... | 260 |
| 4. Social protection under the ‘worker/employee-umbrella’ | 262 |
| a) Reference to national labour law | 262 |
| b) Broad interpretation of EU law | 264 |
| III. Social protection for economically-dependent workers via new labour legislation..... | 268 |
| 1. The legal bases for future labour law directives..... | 268 |
| 2. The potential content of new labour law directives..... | 271 |
| IV. Collective bargaining and the role of competition law..... | 272 |
| V. Conclusions..... | 274 |

Part IV

‘Economically-dependent Workers’ as Part of a Decent Economy – Final Conclusions and Proposals for Further Development (*Schubert*)

| | |
|---|-----|
| I. Introduction..... | 277 |
| II. ‘Economically-dependent workers’ as a relevant part of a decent economy – the need for the category of ‘economically-dependent workers’ | 278 |
| 1. Bogus self-employment or a separate group of self-employed persons in need of social protection | 278 |
| 2. Alternative regulatory models | 278 |
| 3. Protection against social dumping | 279 |
| III. Improvement of the protection against economic risks – balancing the economic risks | 280 |
| 1. Economically-dependent workers and their underdeveloped protection..... | 280 |
| 2. Collective bargaining for dependent self-employed persons..... | 281 |
| a) A necessary step for the reconciliation of fundamental rights and competition law | 281 |
| b) Restricting the notion of ‘undertaking’ in the context of Article 101 of the TFEU .. | 282 |
| c) Extending the scope of the exemption provided for in Article 101 paragraph 3 of the TFEU..... | 283 |
| d) Separate regulation on allowing collective agreements for economically-dependent workers | 284 |
| 3. Minimum remuneration – legislative standards as a necessary measure | 284 |
| IV. Social protection for economically-dependent workers within a globalised economy | 286 |
| Bibliography | 287 |