

Summary of Contents

Preface	V
Notes on Contributors.....	XVII
List of Abbreviations and Acronyms	XXI
Introduction	1
Part I. Economically-dependent Workers in the EU Member States.....	9
A. Austria.....	9
B. France.....	24
C. Germany	44
D. Ireland	64
E. Italy	77
F. The Netherlands	91
G. Portugal.....	117
H. Slovenia.....	135
I. Spain	142
J. Sweden	153
K. Excursus: UK	169
L. Comparative Analysis.....	188
Part II. Protection of Economically-dependent Workers under International Labour Law.....	223
A. Economically-dependent Workers: The relevant International Labour Organiza- tion Standards	223
B. The Self-employed Persons under the European Social Charter	242
Part III. The Recognition of Economically-dependent Workers within EU Law – In Search for a Unicorn?.....	255
Part IV. 'Economically-dependent Workers' as Part of a Decent Economy – Final Conclusions and Proposals for Further Development.....	277
Bibliography	287

Table of Contents

Preface	V
Notes on Contributors.....	XVII
List of Abbreviations and Acronyms	XXI
Introduction	1
I. The aim and the background of the present research project.....	1
II. Current situation of economically-dependent workers	3
1. Legal comparison	3
2. International law	5
3. European law.....	6
Part I	
Economically-dependent Workers in the EU Member States	
A. Austria (<i>Marhold</i>).....	9
I. 'Economically-dependent workers' as a category of work.....	9
II. The legal position of economically-dependent workers from a labour law perspective....	10
III. Social security for economically-dependent workers	11
1. Introduction – The development of and the basic principles of the Austrian social security system	11
2. The different categories of the insured persons.....	12
a) Employees	12
aa) The term.....	12
bb) Personal and economic dependency.....	13
cc) Blue-collar workers (<i>Arbeiter</i>) and white-collar workers (<i>Angestellte</i>).....	13
b) The intermediary category of workers (<i>dienstnehmerähnliche Personen</i>).....	14
c) The self-employed (<i>Selbstständig Erwerbstätige</i>).....	14
3. Values and interests in the early social security system.....	15
4. A shift in the approach.....	17
5. Reforms for the extension of the social security protection.....	18
a) The first wave in 1996.....	18
aa) The intermediary category of workers (<i>dienstnehmerähnliche Personen</i>)	18
bb) The real economic nature of the legal relationship	20
b) Further extension – ASRÄG 1997.....	20
aa) The goals of the reform	20
bb) The inclusion of the 'new self-employed' in the statutory insurance.....	21
cc) Marginal part-time employees	22
B. France (<i>Kessler/Big</i>).....	24
I. Introduction.....	24
II. The category of 'self-employed person'	26
1. The fundamental binary distinction	27
2. A border, but a permeable one	28
III. Social protection from a labour law perspective	31
1. Personal safety.....	32
a) Occupational safety and the protection of vulnerable groups.....	32
b) Discrimination, whistleblowing, and data protection	33
2. Economic security	33
a) Minimum wage and continued payment of remuneration	34
b) Collective bargaining	35
aa) A rare example of collective bargaining for the self-employed: the sector of the general insurance agents.....	35

bb) Protection of the labour market against social dumping	36
c) Protection against redundancy.....	37
d) Lifelong professional training.....	37
IV. Social security for self-employed persons	37
1. The coverage of self-employed workers by the national social security system.....	38
2. The financing of the social security system	39
3. Complementary health insurance.....	40
4. 'Unemployment benefits' for the self-employed	41
5. New normative measures for some 'gig workers': private insurance and social charters	41
C. Germany (<i>Schubert</i>)	44
I. Introduction.....	44
II. 'Economically-dependent workers' as a category of work.....	45
1. The distinction between employees and economically-dependent workers	45
2. The distinction between self-employed persons and economically-dependent workers	47
a) The general definition of 'employee-like persons'	47
b) Homeworkers (<i>Heimarbeiter, Hausgewerbetreibende</i>).....	49
c) Single-principal commercial agents (<i>Ein-Firmen-Handelsvertreter</i>).....	50
d) Conclusion	50
III. The legal position of economically-dependent workers from a labour law perspective....	51
1. Overview of the legal position of economically-dependent workers from a labour law perspective.....	51
2. The social protection of the individual (life, health, physical integrity, and integrity of the person)	52
3. The social protection of workers as economic actors.....	53
a) Remuneration – contract, collective agreement, statutory minimum standard	53
b) Continued remuneration	55
c) Liability for damage.....	56
d) Protection against the termination of the contract	56
4. Representation of workers.....	57
5. Access to labour courts	58
6. Conclusions.....	58
IV. Social security for economically-dependent workers	58
1. The overview of the inclusion of employee-like persons in the statutory social security system.....	58
2. Health insurance.....	59
3. (Statutory) accident insurance.....	60
4. Pension insurance	60
a) Employee-like persons as insured persons in the system of pension insurance	60
b) Sufficiency of the pension	61
5. Unemployment insurance	62
6. Conclusions.....	63
V. Summary	63
D. Ireland (<i>Doherty</i>)	64
I. Introduction.....	64
II. 'Economically-dependent workers' as a category of work.....	65
1. The legislation	65
2. The courts	66
3. No 'Third Way'	68
III. The legal position of economically-dependent workers from a labour law perspective....	69
1. Individual rights	69
2. Collective rights	70
IV. Social security for economically-dependent workers	74
V. Conclusion	76
E. Italy (<i>Del Conte/Gramano</i>)	77
I. 'Economically-dependent workers' as a category of work.....	77
1. The coordinated continuous collaborations.....	79
a) The first time co.co.co. were mentioned: a procedural provision.....	79

b) The first regulatory attempts to protect coordinated and continuous collaborators	80
c) The major reform of hetero-organised work in 2015 and the new concept of coordination	81
II. The legal position of economically-dependent workers from a labour law perspective....	82
1. The specific regulation of coordinated and continuous collaborations	82
2. The general legal regulation of autonomous work (including coordinated and continuous collaborations)	83
3. The special discipline of platform workers	86
4. Autonomous workers' and co.co.co-s' collective rights	87
III. Social security for economically-dependent workers	87
F. The Netherlands (<i>Houwerzijl</i>)	91
I. Introduction	91
II. The rise of solo self-employment in the Netherlands	92
III. Inside or outside the Dutch fortress of labour law	95
1. Comprehensive protection for employees	95
2. Meagre protection for solo self-employed workers	96
a) Health and safety; liability for accidents and damage to others	97
b) Wages/fees	97
c) Protection against dismissal (no longer in effect)	98
IV. Definitions of 'employee' and 'solo self-employed worker'	98
1. Who is an 'employee'?	99
2. Who is a 'solo self-employed worker'?	100
3. The judicial practice of the Supreme Court: the holistic assessment	101
V. Solo self-employed workers under Dutch social security law	103
1. A certain level of protection for solo self-employed workers under (certain) social security schemes	103
2. The notion of 'economically-dependent self-employed workers'	104
a) Homeworkers	105
b) Other employee-like persons	105
c) (De facto) Opting out of employee insurance	105
3. The quest to provide legal certainty only for the independent solo self-employed	106
VI. The (false) self-employed under Dutch collective labour law and competition law	108
1. Collective bargaining and (the representation of) the solo self-employed	108
2. The Dutch Competition Authority's assessment of solo self-employed workers	110
3. Minimum fees for solo self-employed workers who cannot be deemed to be undertakings	112
4. Minimum standards for the solo self-employed workers who do qualify as undertakings?	113
VII. Concluding remarks	115
G. Portugal (<i>Abrantes</i>)	117
I. Introduction	117
1. Legal dependence	117
2. Employment contract and contract for services	119
a) The system of 'indicator facts' (<i>método indicatório</i>)	120
b) The 'primacy of facts'	121
c) The legal presumption provided for in Article 12 of the PLC	122
d) Bogus self-employment and the measures taken against it	122
II. 'Economically-dependent workers' as a category of work	124
1. Economically-dependent work – a comparative overview	124
2. The Employment Contract Act of 1969	125
3. The approaches in professional literature regarding Article 2 of the Employment Contract Act of 1969	126
4. Law No. 101/2009	127
III. The legal position of economically-dependent workers from a labour law perspective....	127
1. General overview	127
2. Rights and obligations of the contracting parties	128
3. Health and safety at work	129

4. Professional qualification.....	129
5. Remuneration.....	129
6. Compensation in the case of the suspension or the reduction of the activity.....	129
7. Termination of the contract	129
8. Registration of homework.....	130
9. Inspection of homework.....	130
IV. Social security for economically-dependent workers.....	130
1. General overview	130
2. Eventualities and contributions.....	131
V. Conclusions.....	131
1. Economically-dependent workers under Portuguese law	131
2. Social protection from a labour law perspective.....	133
3. Social security for economically-dependent workers	133
H. Slovenia (<i>Tičar</i>).....	135
I. 'Economically-dependent workers' as a category of work	135
II. The legal position of economically-dependent workers from a labour law perspective....	135
1. The definition of 'economically-dependent self-employed person'	135
2. The scope of labour law protection	137
3. The identification of economically-dependent persons.....	140
III. Social security for economically-dependent workers	140
I. Spain (<i>Todoli-Signes</i>).....	142
I. Abstract.....	142
II. 'Economically-dependent workers' as a category of work.....	142
1. A binary system: employees and self-employed persons	142
2. A subcategory of self-employed persons: TRADEs as economically-dependent self-employed persons.....	144
III. The legal position of economically-dependent self-employed persons from a labour law perspective.....	145
1. Individual rights	145
a) Working time	145
b) Remuneration.....	146
c) Interruption and suspension of the contract, leave of absence	146
d) Holidays.....	146
e) Termination of the contract	146
2. Collective rights	147
a) Freedom of association	147
b) Collective bargaining	148
IV. Social security for economically-dependent self-employed persons.....	150
V. Health and safety regulations	151
VI. Jurisdiction	151
VII. Conclusion: the legislation applicable to economically-dependent self-employed persons is inadequate	151
J. Sweden (<i>Westregård</i>).....	153
I. Introduction	153
II. Economically-dependent workers as a category of workers.....	153
1. The concept of employee in labour law.....	153
a) Definition	153
b) The Swedish concept of employee in relation to the EU concept of worker.....	155
c) The concept of employee in collective agreements	156
2. The concept of employee in social security legislation.....	156
a) Definition	156
b) Examples of differences in the assessment of the criteria.....	157
c) Economically-dependent workers.....	158
3. 'Dependent contractor' as a subcategory of 'self-employed'	158
a) Definition of the concept of dependent contractor.....	158
b) Legal consequences of being a 'dependent contractor'.....	158
c) Background and outlook for the future	159

4. Conclusion	160
III. The legal position of economically-dependent workers from a labour law perspective....	160
1. Statutory labour legislation	160
a) The scope of the labour legislation	160
b) Statutory regulations that extend beyond the employment relationship	160
2. Collective agreements	161
a) Working conditions and minimum wages	161
b) Collective agreements for economically-dependent workers	161
3. Unions and the organisation of economically-dependent workers	163
4. The role of the courts	163
5. Conclusion	163
IV. Social security for economically-dependent workers.....	164
1. Social security legislation	164
a) The scope of the social security legislation	164
b) Unemployment insurance	164
c) Sickness benefits, parental benefits, and occupational injury annuity	165
d) Sickness benefit qualifying income (SGI) for the calculation of sick pay and parental allowance.....	166
e) Retirement and old-age benefits	166
2. The financing of the social security system	167
3. Who is responsible for paying taxes and social contributions?.....	167
4. Conclusion	168
V. Conclusions.....	168
K. EXCURSUS: UK (<i>Davies</i>).....	169
I. Introduction.....	169
II. Workers and economically-dependent workers in labour law	169
1. 'False' self-employment.....	170
2. 'Worker' in employment legislation.....	171
3. 'Worker' in equality law	174
4. 'Worker' in EU law	175
5. Economic dependence.....	177
6. Employment rights for workers	179
7. Conclusion	181
III. Workers and economically-dependent workers in social security law.....	181
1. Contributory benefits	182
2. Non-contributory benefits.....	185
3. Statutory sick pay	185
4. Conclusion	186
IV. Conclusion	186
L. Comparative Analysis (<i>Schubert</i>).....	188
I. Introduction.....	188
II. 'Economically-dependent worker' as a legal notion.....	189
1. The definition of 'employee' or 'employment contract' as the point of departure regarding social protection.....	189
2. Extending the scope of labour law through a broad notion of 'employment relationship'	191
3. 'Economically-dependent worker' as a legal category and its position in the legal systems examined.....	193
4. Criteria for the definition of 'economically-dependent worker'	194
a) No uniform definition among the countries examined	194
b) 'Economic dependence' as a legal criterion and the substitutes for it	195
aa) Austria, Germany, Portugal, Slovenia and Spain.....	195
bb) Italy and the UK	196
cc) The Netherlands	198
5. Conclusions.....	199
III. Social protection for economically-dependent workers through labour law.....	200
1. <i>Sui generis</i> regulation or the selective extension of labour law.....	200

2. The categories of social protection through labour law	202
3. The satisfaction of economic needs and/or the removal of or the transfer of economic risks.....	205
4. The reconciliation of family life and working life	207
5. Health and safety at work	208
6. The protection of personal rights	209
7. Judicial and/or administrative safeguards.....	210
8. Collective bargaining and collective agreements as means of autonomous self-help ...	210
a) Comparative overview.....	210
b) The impact of competition law.....	212
9. Conclusions.....	214
IV. Social protection for economically-dependent workers through social security law.....	215
1. Economically-dependent workers in the national social security systems.....	215
2. Benefits from the social security scheme	216
3. Contributions to the social security schemes.....	219
4. Conclusions.....	219
V. Final conclusions	220

Part II

Protection of Economically-dependent Workers under International Labour Law

A. Economically-dependent workers: The relevant International Labour Organization Standards (<i>Trebilcock</i>).....	223
I. Overview.....	223
II. Constitutional and policy framework.....	224
III. Standards on labour market governance and statistical measurement tools.....	225
1. Background.....	225
2. Instruments on home work	226
3. Attempts to regulate 'contract labour'	227
4. The Employment Relationship Recommendation.....	228
5. Guidance on labour statistics	229
a) The 2013 ICLS resolution	229
b) The 2018 ICLS resolution	230
6. Recommendation No. 204 addressing the 'informal economy'	231
7. The 2020 CEACR General Survey	232
IV. Fundamental principles and rights at work	233
1. Freedom of association and collective bargaining	233
2. Prohibition of forced labour and elimination of child labour	236
3. Elimination of discrimination	236
V. Standards on social protection	237
VI. Standards applicable to particular categories of workers who may be economically dependent.....	239
VII. Conclusion	240
B. The Self-employed Persons under the European Social Charter (<i>Schlachter</i>).....	242
I. The context of worker protection in the European Social Charter	242
1. The development of the Charter	242
2. The personal scope of the Charter and its Articles.....	243
II. The means of the interpretation of the Charter.....	244
III. The interpretation of specific provisions of the Charter.....	247
1. Article 3: The right to safe and healthy working conditions	247
2. Article 6 paragraph 2: The right to bargain collectively and to conclude collective agreements	249
3. Article 7 paragraph 1: The right of children and young persons to protection – setting the minimum age of admission to employment at 15 years.....	250
4. Article 8 paragraph 5: The right of employed women to protection of maternity – prohibition of work in underground mining and of all other work of dangerous, unhealthy or arduous nature	251

5. Article 18 paragraph 3: The right to engage in a gainful occupation in the territory of other Parties – the liberalisation of the regulations governing employment	252
6. Article 19 paragraph 10: The protection of self-employed migrant workers.....	252
IV. Conclusions.....	253

Part III

The Recognition of Economically-dependent Workers within EU Law – In Search for a Unicorn? (*Krause*)

I. Introduction.....	255
II. Taking stock of EU law.....	256
1. Lack of a legal definition of ‘economically-dependent worker’.....	256
2. Freedom of movement for workers as a point of reference.....	257
3. Social protection for self-employed persons	260
4. Social protection under the ‘worker/employee-umbrella’	262
a) Reference to national labour law	262
b) Broad interpretation of EU law	264
III. Social protection for economically-dependent workers via new labour legislation	268
1. The legal bases for future labour law directives.....	268
2. The potential content of new labour law directives.....	271
IV. Collective bargaining and the role of competition law.....	272
V. Conclusions.....	274

Part IV

‘Economically-dependent Workers’ as Part of a Decent Economy – Final Conclusions and Proposals for Further Development (*Schubert*)

I. Introduction.....	277
II. ‘Economically-dependent workers’ as a relevant part of a decent economy – the need for the category of ‘economically-dependent workers’	278
1. Bogus self-employment or a separate group of self-employed persons in need of social protection	278
2. Alternative regulatory models	278
3. Protection against social dumping	279
III. Improvement of the protection against economic risks – balancing the economic risks....	280
1. Economically-dependent workers and their underdeveloped protection.....	280
2. Collective bargaining for dependent self-employed persons.....	281
a) A necessary step for the reconciliation of fundamental rights and competition law	281
b) Restricting the notion of ‘undertaking’ in the context of Article 101 of the TFEU ..	282
c) Extending the scope of the exemption provided for in Article 101 paragraph 3 of the TFEU.....	283
d) Separate regulation on allowing collective agreements for economically-dependent workers	284
3. Minimum remuneration – legislative standards as a necessary measure	284
IV. Social protection for economically-dependent workers within a globalised economy	286
Bibliography	287