

Table of Content

Foreword from the Editors.....	V
List of Abbreviations.....	XVII
List of Authors.....	XXIX

INTRODUCTION

CLIMATE CHANGE AS A CHALLENGE FOR GLOBAL GOVERNANCE, COURTS AND HUMAN RIGHTS (Voigt)

I. Introduction: climate change – a global threat	2
II. Challenges (and possibilities) for global governance and international law.....	3
III. The role of courts	7
1. Addressing the causes of climate change	7
2. Addressing the consequences of climate change	12
3. Response measures to climate change	13
IV. Major legal issues	14
V. Potential role for litigation in national courts.....	17

PART 1 FUNDAMENTAL QUESTIONS

A. Liability for climate damages, sustainability and environmental justice

(Kloepfer/Neugärtner)	21
I. Introduction: global warming's spatiotemporal strangeness – “tricky” to imagine	23
II. Random sampling: <i>Lliuya v. RWE</i> – approaching liabilities for climate damages inductively.....	23
1. The case <i>Lliuya v. RWE</i>	23
2. Three exemplary issues: statute of limitations, rivalling <i>Rechtsregime</i> , adequate causation	24
3. Trying to imagine “strange” ‘spaces’, ‘times’ and ‘agents’	26
III. Key frameworks: ‘sustainability’, ‘environmental justice’ – and ‘ecological justice’	26
1. Integrative frameworks for “evaluating environmental decisions”	26
2. First encounters, some basic definitions, some common(?) ground.....	27
3. Some traps: ‘lucid dreams’ of harmony, ‘greenwashing’ and anthropocentrist blind spots	30
4. ‘Ecological justice’ – ‘space’, ‘time’ and ‘agency’ in the Anthropocene	31
IV. Times, spaces (and agents) of global warming.....	33
1. Times of global warming	33
2. Spaces of global warming.....	37
V. Coda: “more time tunnels of different sizes”	43

B. Climate damages and the ‘Polluter Pays’ Principle (Rehbinder)

I. Introduction.....	46
II. Historical development and state of recognition	46
1. Historical development.....	46
2. State of recognition.....	47
III. Legal nature	48
1. Principle or rule?.....	48
2. Legal effects	49
IV. Functions.....	51
1. Diversity of functions	51
2. Internalisation vs. instrumental orientation	52
3. Redistribution of costs vs. material responsibility.....	53

V. Contents and limits.....	54
1. Generalities	54
2. Protected assets.....	54
3. Identification of the polluter (originator).....	55
4. Causation and accountability	56
5. Delimitation from the common burden principle	57
VI. Instruments	58
1. Generalities	58
2. Liability in particular.....	59
VII. Conclusion	60
C. The role of courts in climate protection and the separation of powers (<i>Payandeh</i>)	62
I. Introduction: the judicialization of climate change governance.....	64
II. Analysis: structures of judicial involvement in climate protection.....	66
1. Venues	66
2. Protagonists	69
3. Goals	70
III. Contextualization: factors influencing the role of courts	72
1. Procedural rules and the competences of courts.....	72
2. Substantive law and the legal order in general	73
3. Political and social environment	75
IV. Evaluation: the legitimate functions of courts in climate protection	76
1. Climate change litigation between law and politics.....	76
2. The suitability of judicial engagement with climate change	78
3. The effectiveness of climate change litigation	79
V. Conclusion: potential and limitations of judicial climate protection	80
D. Climate change and duties to protect with regard to fundamental rights (<i>Gross</i>)	81
I. Introduction	82
II. Constitutional foundations.....	83
1. Protection of the environment.....	83
2. Protection of human rights	84
III. The Jurisprudence of the European Court of Human Rights	85
1. The protection against dangerous activities.....	85
2. The protection against natural disasters	87
3. Open questions	87
IV. The legal problems of positive obligations	88
1. Individual rights	88
2. Access to courts	90
3. Causation	91
4. Scope of obligations	92
5. Separation of powers	94
V. Conclusion	95

PART 2 PROCEDURAL ISSUES AND CONFLICT OF LAWS

E. Arbitration proceedings (<i>Lennarz</i>)	97
I. Introduction	98
II. Climate change disputes	99
1. Disputes resulting from material damages.....	99
2. Disputes over natural resources.....	99
3. Disputes resulting from international climate treaties	99
4. Disputes resulting from transformation of the economy	99
5. Climate finance disputes	100
6. Corporate disputes	100
III. Arbitration proceedings	100
1. Arbitration law	101
2. Enforceability	101

3. Arbitration agreement.....	102
4. Confidentiality	102
5. Flexibility of proceedings	103
6. Selection of arbitrators.....	104
7. Involvement of third parties.....	104
8. Involvement of states	104
9. Applicable law.....	105
10. Claims based on tort	105
IV. Suitability of arbitration proceedings for climate change disputes.....	105
1. Political and public law claims	105
2. Claims for damages and for specific performance against companies.....	106
3. Disputes over natural resources.....	106
4. Disputes arising from international climate protection treaties.....	107
5. Disputes resulting from the implementation of international climate treaties.....	108
6. Disputes due to transformation towards Green economy	110
7. Disputes arising from climate finance	111
8. Corporate disputes.....	113
V. Arbitral institutions and climate change.....	114
1. Permanent Court of Arbitration, The Hague.....	114
2. International Court of Arbitration of the ICC, Paris	115
VI. Summary	118
F. Conflicts of jurisdiction and the applicable law in domestic courts' proceedings	
<i>(Kieninger).....</i>	119
I. Introduction.....	120
1. Road map.....	120
2. Cross-border elements giving rise to questions of private international law.....	121
3. No universal rules with respect to jurisdiction and Choice of Law.....	122
II. State immunity and “political question doctrine”	123
1. State immunity	123
2. “Political question doctrine” as a limitation to cross-border proceedings	125
III. Jurisdiction	125
1. Introduction	125
2. Brussels Ibis Regulation and Lugano Convention.....	127
3. EU Member States' autonomous rules on jurisdiction	132
4. United States: Personal jurisdiction of state and federal courts.....	133
IV. Choice of Law.....	138
1. Introduction	138
2. EU: Liability in tort (delict) according to the Rome II Regulation	139
3. Autonomous PIL: Property law	146
4. US conflict of laws	146

PART 3 **STATE LIABILITY UNDER INTERNATIONAL AND EUROPEAN LAW**

G. Environmental liability in international law (Wolfrum).....	149
I. Introduction.....	150
II. Notion – environmental liability – what does it mean and what is the purpose in the context of a liability regime?.....	151
III. Development of a regime on environmental liability: From liability for transboundary harm to genuine international environmental liability	152
1. Introduction – first jurisprudence.....	152
2. Development of the treaty law on civil liability.....	153
3. International treaties on the protection of the environment of international common spaces: A paradigmatic shift?	156
4. Customary international law: Does there exist an international regime on environmental liability?	160
IV. Concluding observations: Necessary features of a regime on international environmental liability.....	161

1. Introduction	161
2. Liability for lawful or only illegal activities.....	161
3. Intensity of harm	163
4. Liability for not establishing precautionary measures or an adequate response system	163
5. The matter of causality.....	164
6. Fault based or strict liability.....	164
7. Calculating the amount of compensation to be paid and limits	165
8. The potential claimant.....	165
H. The international law and policy implications of climate change litigation: sustainable developments in international investment law and policy related to renewable energy, climate change mitigation and adaptation (Cordonier Segger/Arvan/Byron/Srinivas)	166
I. Introduction.....	168
II. International policy & treaty commitments to climate justice & investment in carbon neutral/negative sustainable development	169
III. Climate change litigation guiding investment risk assessment & decision-making	173
IV. Innovations in investment law & policy related to clean energy, climate change and sustainable development	182
1. Treaty & policy developments	183
2. Investment treaty disputes	188
V. Conclusions.....	196
I. The Paris Climate Agreement and liability issues (Franzius/Kling)	197
I. Introduction.....	199
II. The Paris Agreement and the legal nature of its provisions	200
1. The Paris Agreement – binding or not binding?	200
2. Obligations in the main action areas.....	201
3. Compliance and enforcement	207
III. The Paris Agreement in the courtroom.....	208
1. Interplay between the international and national level.....	208
2. The Paris Agreement in domestic litigation	209
3. Rights-based litigation.....	210
4. Adjudication in planning decisions	212
5. Some general remarks: the importance of considering the national context.....	214
IV. Conclusion and outlook.....	215
J. Liability of EU Member States under EU law (Purnhagen/Saurer)	217
I. Introduction.....	218
II. Greenhouse gas reduction obligations of EU Member States under EU law.....	219
III. EU Member State liability within the non-ETS sector: the obligation to purchase surplus allocations from other Member States as financial sanction.....	221
IV. Financial sanctions within the infringement procedure as liability mechanism	223
V. Liability of EU Member States under <i>Francovich</i> doctrine?.....	224
1. The origins, function and reasoning and doctrinal embedding of non-contractual Member State liability as developed by the Court	225
2. The <i>Francovich</i> criteria for state liability and climate law cases.....	226
3. Does the nature of the breach of Union law require a different yardstick in climate law cases?	235
VI. Conclusion	236

PART 4

CLIMATE CHANGE LITIGATION – NATIONAL REPORTS

K. Climate change litigation in the United States (Farber)	237
I. Introduction.....	237
II. Jurisdictional issues.....	238
1. Standing.....	239
2. Personal jurisdiction.....	241
3. Subject matter jurisdiction	242
III. Public law litigation	244

1. Litigation under the Clean Air Act.....	244
2. Litigation over disclosure of climate impacts.....	247
3. Adaptation issues	247
4. Non-statutory claims.....	249
IV. Tort liability.....	250
1. Nuisance law and climate change	250
2. Causation issues	251
3. Litigation prospects	252
V. Conclusion	252
L. Climate change litigation in Canada (<i>Jodoin/McGinn</i>).....	253
I. Introduction.....	254
II. Climate law and governance in Canada	255
III. Litigation relating to the authority of the federal government to address climate change	258
1. Syncrude Canada Ltd. v. The Attorney General of Canada	258
2. The GHG pollution pricing reference cases	259
IV. Litigation relating to the obligation of governments and public bodies to address climate change	262
1. Cases involving a failure of public bodies to adequately consider GHG emissions.....	262
2. Litigation relating to the Kyoto Protocol	264
3. Rights-based climate lawsuits.....	266
V. Conclusion	269
M. Climate change litigation in Brazil (<i>Wedy</i>).....	271
I. Introduction.....	272
II. Climate change law and litigation in Brazil	274
III. Legal remedies which may be used in climate litigation in Brazil.....	279
IV. Climate litigation in Brazil: analyses of cases	281
1. Precedent of the Supreme Federal Court	281
2. Precedents by the Brazilian Superior Court of Justice	283
V. Conclusion	286
N. Climate change litigation in Australia (<i>Bell-James</i>).....	288
I. Introduction.....	289
II. Climate change through the environmental impact assessment process	290
1. Early cases.....	291
2. The Queensland coal mine cases.....	292
3. Adani before the Federal Court.....	296
4. New development – Rocky Hill decision	297
5. Future directions and negative regulatory responses.....	298
III. Emerging avenues for climate change litigation	299
1. Corporate law.....	299
2. Human rights law	301
3. Operators of emissions-intensive industries	302
IV. Conclusion	303
O. Climate change litigation in the United Kingdom (<i>Ohdedar/McNab</i>).....	304
I. Introduction.....	306
1. Background to climate change litigation in the UK	307
2. Early history of climate litigation in the UK: 1990s to the mid-2000s	307
II. Litigating climate targets: holding the government to account	308
1. Plan B takes on the UK climate mitigation target	308
2. Human rights and climate change in the courts	309
3. The path to net zero: winning the political battle, losing the legal battle	310
III. Litigating the transition to a low carbon society: clean energy, airports, and fracking	311
1. Litigation on wind and solar projects	311
2. Anti-fracking cases	315
3. Litigation against airport expansion	316
IV. Criminal prosecution of climate activism: an emerging area of climate litigation	319
V. Conclusions and the future climate litigation in the UK.....	322

P. Climate change litigation in Italy (Butti)	324
I. Introduction	324
II. Regulatory and planning framework on climate change in Italy	325
1. Mitigation measures	325
2. Adaptation measures	328
III. “Giudizio universale” (the last judgment): a high-profile case to be litigated by the first months of 2020	329
IV. Local court cases that are relevant to climate change litigation in Italy	333
V. Conclusion	335
Q. Climate change litigation in France (Epstein/Deckert)	336
I. Introduction	337
II. Climate change litigation in public law	338
1. Available remedies	338
2. Injury	340
3. Illegal act or conduct	341
4. The causal link between the damage and the misconduct	345
III. Climate change litigation in private law	346
1. Making French companies eco-friendly through business law	348
2. Conditions and limits to the engagement of climate change civil liability: analysis of the difficulties and solutions to overcome them	356
R. Climate change litigation in the Netherlands – the Urgenda case and beyond (Van der Veen/De Graaf)	363
I. Introduction	363
II. The Urgenda case	365
1. The District Court judgment	365
2. The Court of Appeal ruling	366
3. The Supreme Court decision	367
4. Analysis and critique	369
III. Other developments in the Netherlands	372
1. Friends of the Earth versus Shell	372
2. The Climate Act	373
3. The Climate Agreement	375
IV. Conclusions	377
S. Climate change litigation in Germany (Weller/Nasse/Nasse)	378
I. Introduction	380
II. The scientific bases of climate change	382
1. The climate system	382
2. Greenhouse effect and greenhouse gases	383
3. Detection and attribution of climate change	385
III. Climate change litigation and private international law	386
IV. International jurisdiction of national courts	387
1. General forum, Art. 4 of Regulation No. 1215/2012	387
2. Special forum of the tort, Art. 7 No. 2 of Regulation No. 1215/2012	388
3. Special forum of the joinder of parties, Art. 8 No. 1 of Regulation No. 1215/2012	391
V. Applicable law	392
1. Scope of the tort statute	392
2. Choice of law, Art. 14 Rome II	392
3. Environmental tort statute, Art. 7 Rome II	392
4. Interim result	398
VI. Liability under German law	398
1. Compensation for already occurred damages	398
2. Protection from future impairments	401
3. Proof of causality as central hurdle of private climate actions	402
VII. Summary	403

PART 5

LIABILITY FOR CLIMATE DAMAGES – GERMANY AS AN INTERNATIONAL PIONEER?	
T. Liability for climate damages under the German law of torts (Wagner/Arntz)	405
I. The German law of non-contractual liability: an overview.....	407
1. Overview	407
2. The law of delict.....	407
3. Nuisance law	408
4. Strict liability.....	409
II. A prominent case in German courts: Saúl Ananías Luciano Lliuya vs. RWE AG	410
III. The law of delict	412
1. Negligence liability, Section 823 (1) BGB.....	412
2. Breach of statutory duty, Section 823 (2) BGB.....	422
3. <i>Actio doli</i> , Section 826 BGB.....	423
IV. Strict liability	423
V. Law of nuisance	423
1. <i>Actio negatoria</i> , Section 1004 BGB.....	423
2. Section 906 (2) cl. 2 BGB and Section 14 cl. 2 BImSchG.....	426
VI. Conclusion	427
U. Liability for climate change damages under the German Environmental Liability Act (Nitsch)	429
I. Introduction.....	430
II. Basic principles of the UmweltHG.....	431
III. Nature of liability	433
IV. Facilities subject to the UmweltHG	434
1. Basic principles	434
2. Annex 1 catalogue.....	434
V. Damages subject to the UmweltHG.....	435
1. Basic principles	435
2. Climate change damages subject to the UmweltHG?.....	436
VI. Environmental impact.....	437
1. Basic principles	437
2. Environmental impact in the form of climate change	438
VII. Causation.....	439
1. Basic principles	439
2. Presumption of causation	442
3. Causation in cases of climate change damages.....	442
VIII. Temporal scope of application	445
IX. Conclusion	446
V. Climate protection and compliance in German corporate law (Habersack/Ehrl)	447
I. Introduction.....	450
1. Climate protection in current accounting and stock corporation law	450
2. The company's external and internal relationships	451
3. Delimiting the object of study	452
II. The perspective of economic analysis and legal functionalism	452
1. The internalization of negative externalities as a guidance objective	452
2. Efficiency of lawfulness and compliance duties for legal enforcement	453
III. Climate protection and current corporate law	455
1. Corporate management and the objectives of stock corporation law	455
2. Duty of lawfulness and compliance responsibility (under stock corporation law), §§ 91 (2), 93, 116 p. 1 AktG.....	456
3. CSR reporting duties.....	459
4. CSR and corporate interest.....	461
IV. Conclusion and prospects	464

W. Investor-led action for climate and business sustainability (Duve/Hamama)	466
I. Introduction.....	469
II. Climate change arrived in the investment community	470
III. Why is investor-led action needed?	471
1. Insufficient political measures.....	471
2. Changing regulatory frameworks	473
3. Need for more sustainable investments	474
4. Business dimension of the investor's-led action for climate.....	474
IV. Time for investor-led action	475
1. Invest responsibly.....	475
2. Divest from non-sustainable businesses	476
3. Stay invested and take action.....	477
V. What can investor-led action achieve?	477
1. Investor's dialogue with management.....	478
2. Corporate decisions and the public arena.....	479
3. Adopting climate change shareholder resolutions	480
4. Insisting on disclosure and climate change reporting.....	481
5. Acting as thought leaders.....	483
6. Taking a seat and action	484
7. Litigating as last resort.....	485
VI. Conclusion	486
X. Liability for climate damages under the Environmental Damage Act (Kahl/Stürmlinger) ..	487
I. Introduction.....	488
II. The concept of environmental damage.....	489
1. Damage to species and natural habitats	489
2. Water damage	490
3. Land damage	491
4. Restriction of the concept of environmental damage	491
5. Climate damages as environmental damages within the meaning of the EDA	492
III. Responsible party	496
1. Category of persons concerned.....	496
2. Direct causation.....	497
3. Responsible party for climate damages within the scope of the EDA	499
IV. Legal effects.....	502
1. Obligations of the responsible party.....	502
2. Powers of the authorities.....	503
3. Selection of disturbers.....	504
4. Bearing of costs	504
V. Conclusion	505
Y. The role of non-governmental organizations for climate change litigation	
(<i>Verheyen/Pabsch</i>)	507
I. Introduction.....	509
1. NGO's as representatives of the environment	509
2. NGO's and climate litigation in practice.....	510
3. Climate litigation in Germany by defendants	512
II. NGO independent access to court as exception to the rule – the German standing rules in a nutshell	513
III. Formal role of NGO's in climate litigation against the state	516
1. Standing in project related actions	516
2. Compliance with climate protection targets or other rules of climate law	516
3. Climate litigation against the state: Climate legislation	523
IV. Passive legal status of NGO's	525
1. Intervention	525
2. Amicus Curiae – “friend of the court”	525
V. Perspective climate litigation to enforce climate law	525
1. Obligations under the EU Governance Regulation.....	526
2. The EU Climate Change Regulation	527

3. National climate protection law	528
4. Actions for adjustment and compensation	530
VI. Conclusion	530
PART 6	
CONCLUSIONS	
LIABILITY FOR CLIMATE DAMAGES –	
SYNTHESIS AND FUTURE PROSPECTS (Kahl/Weller)	
I. Introduction	535
II. Fundamental questions	537
1. Sustainability and environmental justice	537
2. Polluter-pays principle	538
3. The role of the legislature and the judiciary	538
4. Duties of protection	539
III. Procedural issues and Conflict of Laws	540
1. Procedures before civil courts	540
2. Applicable law	541
3. Arbitration proceedings	541
IV. State liability under international and European law	541
V. Climate change litigation: country reports	543
1. USA	543
2. Canada	544
3. Brazil	544
4. Australia	544
5. United Kingdom	545
6. Italy	546
7. France	546
8. Netherlands	548
VI. Liability for climate damages – Germany as an international pioneer?	549
1. Environmental Damage Act	549
2. Role of the NGOs	550
3. Corporate climate responsibility	550
4. Delictual climate change liability	551
VII. Tendencies and prospects	551
1. Primacy of the legislature, supplemental function of the courts	551
2. Basic right or state objective: climate protection in the national constitutions?	552
3. Emission reduction objectives in the constitution?	553
4. Private enforcement	554
5. Conclusion	558
Index	561