

# Contents

|                                                                            |                                                                                                          |           |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------|
| <b>1</b>                                                                   | <b>Introduction</b> . . . . .                                                                            | <b>1</b>  |
|                                                                            | Christian von Hirschhausen, Clemens Gerbaulet, Claudia Kemfert,<br>Casimir Lorenz, and Pao-Yu Oei        |           |
| 1.1                                                                        | Introduction . . . . .                                                                                   | 1         |
| 1.2                                                                        | The Main Ingredients of the Energiewende . . . . .                                                       | 3         |
| 1.3                                                                        | Current State of the Literature . . . . .                                                                | 4         |
| 1.4                                                                        | Structure of the Book . . . . .                                                                          | 6         |
| 1.4.1                                                                      | Part I: Historic Origins: The Energiewende<br>and the Transformation of the German Coal Sector . . . . . | 6         |
| 1.4.2                                                                      | Part II: The Energiewende Underway in the Electricity<br>Sector . . . . .                                | 7         |
| 1.4.3                                                                      | Part III: The German Energiewende in the Context<br>of the European Low-Carbon Transformation . . . . .  | 9         |
| 1.4.4                                                                      | Part IV: Assessment, Lessons, and Perspectives . . . . .                                                 | 11        |
|                                                                            | References . . . . .                                                                                     | 13        |
| <br><b>Part I The Historical Origins and Emergence of the Energiewende</b> |                                                                                                          |           |
| <b>2</b>                                                                   | <b>German Energy and Climate Policies: A Historical Overview</b> . . . . .                               | <b>17</b> |
|                                                                            | Christian von Hirschhausen                                                                               |           |
| 2.1                                                                        | Introduction . . . . .                                                                                   | 17        |
| 2.2                                                                        | Historic Periods and Fuel Choices: Fossil, Nuclear,<br>and Renewables . . . . .                          | 19        |
| 2.2.1                                                                      | 1880s–1945: Coal Is King . . . . .                                                                       | 19        |
| 2.2.2                                                                      | 1950s–1980s: East and West Germany Enter<br>the Nuclear Age . . . . .                                    | 23        |
| 2.2.3                                                                      | 1980s–2010: Wind of Change and the Rise<br>of Renewables . . . . .                                       | 27        |

|          |                                                                                                                     |           |
|----------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------|
| 2.3      | 2010–2011: A Critical Moment of the Energiewende . . . . .                                                          | 34        |
| 2.3.1    | September 2010: An Ambivalent “Energy<br>Concept 2050” . . . . .                                                    | 34        |
| 2.3.2    | The Fukushima Nuclear Accident and the Events<br>of Spring 2011 . . . . .                                           | 36        |
| 2.3.3    | The Objectives of the Energiewende . . . . .                                                                        | 39        |
| 2.4      | Conclusions . . . . .                                                                                               | 41        |
|          | References . . . . .                                                                                                | 43        |
| <b>3</b> | <b>The Transformation of the German Coal Sector from 1950<br/>to 2017: An Historical Overview . . . . .</b>         | <b>45</b> |
|          | Hanna Brauers, Philipp Herpich, and Pao-Yu Oei                                                                      |           |
| 3.1      | Introduction . . . . .                                                                                              | 46        |
| 3.2      | History of Hard Coal in Germany 1950–2017 . . . . .                                                                 | 46        |
| 3.2.1    | Hard Coal as Energy Carrier: Primary Energy<br>Consumption and Electricity Generation . . . . .                     | 47        |
| 3.2.2    | Hard Coal Production and Employment . . . . .                                                                       | 49        |
| 3.3      | History of Lignite in Germany 1950–2017 . . . . .                                                                   | 52        |
| 3.3.1    | Lignite in East Germany’s Energy System . . . . .                                                                   | 53        |
| 3.3.2    | Lignite’s Contribution to the Energy Systems<br>of West Germany and Germany After<br>the Reunification . . . . .    | 55        |
| 3.3.3    | Lignite Production and Employment . . . . .                                                                         | 55        |
| 3.4      | Political Instruments Since the 1950s Until Today . . . . .                                                         | 56        |
| 3.4.1    | The Coal Crisis in 1958 and the First Structural<br>Policy Program of North Rhine-Westphalia (NRW) . . . .          | 57        |
| 3.4.2    | The Oil Crisis 1973 and the Structural Policy<br>Programs of the Ruhr Area . . . . .                                | 59        |
| 3.4.3    | Regionalization of the Structural Policy Since<br>the Mid-1980s . . . . .                                           | 60        |
| 3.4.4    | East Germany’s Reduction in Lignite Production<br>Due to the Reunification . . . . .                                | 61        |
| 3.4.5    | Directional Shift in the Structural Policy and Growing<br>Influence of the EU Since the Turn of the Century . . . . | 64        |
| 3.4.6    | End of Subsidies for Domestic Hard Coal Production . . .                                                            | 66        |
| 3.5      | Lessons Learned from the Past Transformation Process . . . . .                                                      | 68        |
| 3.5.1    | Regional Level . . . . .                                                                                            | 70        |
| 3.5.2    | National and Supranational Level . . . . .                                                                          | 73        |
| 3.6      | Conclusions . . . . .                                                                                               | 76        |
|          | References . . . . .                                                                                                | 77        |

## Part II The Energiewende at Work in the Electricity Sector

|          |                                                                                                           |            |
|----------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| <b>4</b> | <b>Greenhouse Gas Emission Reductions and the Phasing-out of Coal in Germany</b> . . . . .                | <b>81</b>  |
|          | Pao-Yu Oei                                                                                                |            |
| 4.1      | Introduction . . . . .                                                                                    | 82         |
| 4.2      | GHG Emissions Targets and Recent Trends in Germany . . . . .                                              | 83         |
| 4.2.1    | German GHG Emissions Targets for 2050 . . . . .                                                           | 83         |
| 4.2.2    | Ambitious Targets at the Federal State Level<br>in Germany . . . . .                                      | 85         |
| 4.3      | Significant CO <sub>2</sub> Emissions from Hard Coal and Lignite<br>in Germany . . . . .                  | 88         |
| 4.3.1    | Electricity Generation from Hard Coal . . . . .                                                           | 89         |
| 4.4      | Instruments to Accelerate the Coal Phase-out . . . . .                                                    | 92         |
| 4.4.1    | European Level: Reform of the European Emissions<br>Trading System (EU-ETS) . . . . .                     | 92         |
| 4.4.2    | Towards More Specific Climate Instruments . . . . .                                                       | 94         |
| 4.4.3    | National Level: A Variety of Instruments . . . . .                                                        | 98         |
| 4.5      | Effects on Resource Adequacy and Structural Change . . . . .                                              | 106        |
| 4.5.1    | Coal Plant Closures and Resource Adequacy . . . . .                                                       | 106        |
| 4.5.2    | Regional Structural Changes Almost Complete . . . . .                                                     | 110        |
| 4.6      | Conclusion . . . . .                                                                                      | 113        |
|          | References . . . . .                                                                                      | 114        |
| <b>5</b> | <b>Nuclear Power: Effects of Plant Closures on Electricity Markets and Remaining Challenges</b> . . . . . | <b>117</b> |
|          | Friedrich Kunz, Felix Reitz, Christian von Hirschhausen,<br>and Ben Wealer                                |            |
| 5.1      | Introduction . . . . .                                                                                    | 118        |
| 5.2      | The Timetable for Closing Nuclear Power Plants in Germany<br>(2011–2022) . . . . .                        | 119        |
| 5.3      | Energy Economic Effects of Nuclear Power Plant Closures . . . . .                                         | 121        |
| 5.3.1    | Review of Existing Studies . . . . .                                                                      | 121        |
| 5.3.2    | The First Model-Based Network Analysis . . . . .                                                          | 122        |
| 5.3.3    | ... Is Confirmed By Real-world Developments . . . . .                                                     | 122        |
| 5.3.4    | ... and No Shortage to Be Expected After 2022 . . . . .                                                   | 126        |
| 5.4      | Additional Challenges: Dismantling NPPs and Storing Nuclear<br>Waste . . . . .                            | 127        |
| 5.4.1    | Dismantling Nuclear Power Plants Delayed . . . . .                                                        | 128        |
| 5.4.2    | ... and So Is the Search for Long-term Storage . . . . .                                                  | 132        |
| 5.4.3    | Financing of the Process Uncertain . . . . .                                                              | 134        |
| 5.4.4    | Implications for Corporate Strategies . . . . .                                                           | 137        |
| 5.5      | Conclusions . . . . .                                                                                     | 138        |
|          | References . . . . .                                                                                      | 139        |

|          |                                                                                            |     |
|----------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| <b>6</b> | <b>Renewable Energy Sources as the Cornerstone of the German Energiewende</b> . . . . .    | 141 |
|          | Jonas Egerer, Pao-Yu Oei, and Casimir Lorenz                                               |     |
| 6.1      | Introduction . . . . .                                                                     | 141 |
| 6.2      | Renewables as the Core of the Electricity System . . . . .                                 | 142 |
| 6.2.1    | 1990–2015: From a Niche Player to the Main Electricity Supplier . . . . .                  | 142 |
| 6.2.2    | Significant Employment Effects . . . . .                                                   | 145 |
| 6.2.3    | Rising Ambitions Towards 2030 and 2050 . . . . .                                           | 148 |
| 6.3      | A New Era for the Electricity System . . . . .                                             | 151 |
| 6.3.1    | The Merit Order Effect . . . . .                                                           | 151 |
| 6.3.2    | No More Distinction Between “Peak Load” and “Base Load” . . . . .                          | 152 |
| 6.3.3    | Wholesale Electricity Prices in Germany . . . . .                                          | 153 |
| 6.3.4    | Simulations of a Renewable System in Germany in 2030 . . . . .                             | 155 |
| 6.3.5    | Is a New Market Design Required? . . . . .                                                 | 158 |
| 6.4      | What About Costs? . . . . .                                                                | 163 |
| 6.4.1    | Short-Term Private Costs of Renewables: The EEG Surcharge . . . . .                        | 163 |
| 6.4.2    | Dynamic Perspective on Private Costs: Renewables as a Sound Long-Term Investment . . . . . | 166 |
| 6.4.3    | Public Economics Perspective . . . . .                                                     | 166 |
| 6.5      | Conclusions . . . . .                                                                      | 169 |
|          | References . . . . .                                                                       | 170 |
| <b>7</b> | <b>Energy Efficiency: A Key Challenge of the Energiewende</b> . . . . .                    | 173 |
|          | Claudia Kemfert, Casimir Lorenz, Thure Traber, and Petra Opitz                             |     |
| 7.1      | Introduction . . . . .                                                                     | 173 |
| 7.2      | Energy Efficiency Targets and Achievements . . . . .                                       | 174 |
| 7.2.1    | Issues Related to Energy Efficiency . . . . .                                              | 174 |
| 7.2.2    | Efficiency Objectives for Germany . . . . .                                                | 175 |
| 7.2.3    | Achievements to Date: Aggregate Results . . . . .                                          | 176 |
| 7.2.4    | Disaggregated Results . . . . .                                                            | 178 |
| 7.3      | Sectoral Policy Analyses . . . . .                                                         | 180 |
| 7.3.1    | Policies for the Building Sector . . . . .                                                 | 180 |
| 7.3.2    | Policies for Industry . . . . .                                                            | 182 |
| 7.3.3    | Policies for the Transport Sector . . . . .                                                | 183 |
| 7.4      | Energy Efficiency Policies Going Forward . . . . .                                         | 183 |
| 7.4.1    | The National Action Plan on Energy Efficiency (NAPE) . . . . .                             | 183 |
| 7.4.2    | Conflicts Between Targets and Policy Options . . . . .                                     | 185 |
| 7.5      | Conclusion . . . . .                                                                       | 189 |
|          | References . . . . .                                                                       | 190 |

|          |                                                                                                                                                        |            |
|----------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| <b>8</b> | <b>The Role of Electricity Transmission Infrastructure . . . . .</b>                                                                                   | <b>193</b> |
|          | Clemens Gerbaulet                                                                                                                                      |            |
| 8.1      | Introduction . . . . .                                                                                                                                 | 194        |
| 8.2      | Transmission Planning and Incentives . . . . .                                                                                                         | 195        |
| 8.2.1    | Network Planning Before the Energiewende . . . . .                                                                                                     | 195        |
| 8.2.2    | 2011: A Renewed Institutional Framework<br>for Network Planning . . . . .                                                                              | 196        |
| 8.2.3    | Remaining Inefficiencies and Investment Incentives . . . .                                                                                             | 198        |
| 8.3      | Overview of Network Development Plans . . . . .                                                                                                        | 200        |
| 8.3.1    | Projected Future Network Development . . . . .                                                                                                         | 200        |
| 8.3.2    | Onshore and Offshore Development Plans . . . . .                                                                                                       | 202        |
| 8.4      | Network Expansion During the Energiewende . . . . .                                                                                                    | 204        |
| 8.4.1    | Aggregate Network Investment in Germany . . . . .                                                                                                      | 204        |
| 8.4.2    | Implementation of Network Development Plans . . . . .                                                                                                  | 205        |
| 8.4.3    | Levels of Congestion, Redispatch, and Ancillary<br>Services . . . . .                                                                                  | 209        |
| 8.5      | Effects from Splitting up Germany into Bidding Zones . . . . .                                                                                         | 210        |
| 8.5.1    | A Controversial Debate . . . . .                                                                                                                       | 210        |
| 8.5.2    | Bidding Zones in Germany Would Have Minor<br>Effects . . . . .                                                                                         | 211        |
| 8.6      | Transmission Planning and Climate Targets: An Important<br>New Link . . . . .                                                                          | 212        |
| 8.7      | Conclusions . . . . .                                                                                                                                  | 214        |
|          | References . . . . .                                                                                                                                   | 215        |
| <b>9</b> | <b>Sector Coupling for an Integrated Low-Carbon Energy<br/>Transformation: A Techno-Economic Introduction<br/>and Application to Germany . . . . .</b> | <b>217</b> |
|          | Jens Weibezahn                                                                                                                                         |            |
| 9.1      | Introduction . . . . .                                                                                                                                 | 217        |
| 9.2      | The Basic Idea of “Sector Coupling” . . . . .                                                                                                          | 218        |
| 9.3      | Sectors . . . . .                                                                                                                                      | 221        |
| 9.3.1    | Transportation . . . . .                                                                                                                               | 221        |
| 9.3.2    | Heating and Cooling . . . . .                                                                                                                          | 225        |
| 9.3.3    | The Electricity Sector in the Core of Interdependencies . . .                                                                                          | 228        |
| 9.4      | Some Model-based Evidence . . . . .                                                                                                                    | 231        |
| 9.4.1    | Electrification is Key . . . . .                                                                                                                       | 232        |
| 9.4.2    | “Efficiency First” . . . . .                                                                                                                           | 233        |
| 9.4.3    | Role of Synthetic Fuels Uncertain . . . . .                                                                                                            | 233        |
| 9.4.4    | Digitalization and Smart Infrastructure . . . . .                                                                                                      | 234        |
| 9.4.5    | Other Issues: Fossil Gas, Transportation, and Market<br>Design . . . . .                                                                               | 235        |
| 9.5      | Conclusion . . . . .                                                                                                                                   | 236        |
|          | References . . . . .                                                                                                                                   | 236        |

### **Part III The German Energiewende in the Context of the European Low-Carbon Transformation**

|                                                                                                                                     |     |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| <b>10 The Electricity Mix in the European Low-Carbon Transformation: Coal, Nuclear, and Renewables</b>                              | 241 |
| Roman Mendelevitch, Claudia Kemfert, Pao-Yu Oei,<br>and Christian von Hirschhausen                                                  |     |
| 10.1 Introduction                                                                                                                   | 242 |
| 10.2 European Energy (and Climate) Policies Since 1951                                                                              | 243 |
| 10.2.1 The Past: 1951 to Today                                                                                                      | 243 |
| 10.2.2 Objectives Moving Forward: 2030 and 2050                                                                                     | 248 |
| 10.3 Coal and the Pervasive Search for Carbon Capture, Transport,<br>and Storage (CCTS)                                             | 258 |
| 10.3.1 Coal-Producing Member States Seek Coal-Based<br>“Decarbonization”                                                            | 258 |
| 10.3.2 No CCTS Demonstration Projects to Date                                                                                       | 259 |
| 10.4 Nuclear Power in the European Electricity Mix                                                                                  | 264 |
| 10.4.1 Development of Nuclear Power in Europe                                                                                       | 264 |
| 10.4.2 Costs of Nuclear Energy Prohibitively High                                                                                   | 266 |
| 10.4.3 Renaissance of Nuclear Power in EU Scenarios<br>Not Plausible                                                                | 270 |
| 10.5 Renewables: Potential Underestimated                                                                                           | 273 |
| 10.5.1 Increase in Renewables Since the 1990s                                                                                       | 273 |
| 10.5.2 The Breakthrough of Renewables is Now Occurring<br>on the Global Level                                                       | 273 |
| 10.5.3 ... But Has Been Systematically Ignored in the EU<br>Reference Scenarios                                                     | 275 |
| 10.6 Comparing Alternative Low-Carbon Scenarios                                                                                     | 277 |
| 10.7 Conclusions                                                                                                                    | 278 |
| References                                                                                                                          | 280 |
| <b>11 Energy Infrastructures for the Low-Carbon Transformation<br/>in Europe</b>                                                    | 283 |
| Franziska Holz, Jonas Egerer, Clemens Gerbaulet, Pao-Yu Oei,<br>Roman Mendelevitch, Anne Neumann, and Christian von<br>Hirschhausen |     |
| 11.1 Introduction                                                                                                                   | 284 |
| 11.2 Infrastructure and Low-Carbon Development                                                                                      | 285 |
| 11.2.1 Macroeconomic Perspective: Development<br>by Infrastructure Oversupply or Shortage?                                          | 285 |
| 11.2.2 Yet Another Perspective: “Cables for Carbon”?                                                                                | 287 |
| 11.2.3 Recent Empirical Evidence: Is “Big Really<br>Beautiful”?                                                                     | 289 |

|           |                                                                                                                       |            |
|-----------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| 11.3      | Electricity Transmission . . . . .                                                                                    | 292        |
| 11.3.1    | Initial Conception: Supergrids . . . . .                                                                              | 292        |
| 11.3.2    | From Supergrid Projects Towards a More Regional<br>and Local Approach . . . . .                                       | 294        |
| 11.4      | Natural Gas Infrastructure . . . . .                                                                                  | 299        |
| 11.4.1    | Uncertain Perspectives for Natural Gas<br>and Its Infrastructure Requirements . . . . .                               | 299        |
| 11.4.2    | EU Natural Gas Sector Resilient Against Supply<br>Shocks . . . . .                                                    | 303        |
| 11.5      | CO <sub>2</sub> Pipelines . . . . .                                                                                   | 309        |
| 11.5.1    | Early Expectations for a European-wide CO <sub>2</sub><br>Pipeline Network . . . . .                                  | 309        |
| 11.5.2    | Current Status: The Network That Did Not Become<br>a Reality . . . . .                                                | 311        |
| 11.6      | Conclusions . . . . .                                                                                                 | 312        |
|           | References . . . . .                                                                                                  | 313        |
| <b>12</b> | <b>Cross-Border Cooperation in the European Context: Evidence<br/>from Regional Cooperation Initiatives . . . . .</b> | <b>319</b> |
|           | Casimir Lorenz, Jonas Egerer, and Clemens Gerbaulet                                                                   |            |
| 12.1      | Introduction . . . . .                                                                                                | 319        |
| 12.2      | Different Cooperation Schemes . . . . .                                                                               | 321        |
| 12.3      | Regional Cooperation Patterns in European Electricity . . . . .                                                       | 322        |
| 12.3.1    | “Regional Groups” and Similar Ongoing Activities . . . . .                                                            | 322        |
| 12.3.2    | Pentalateral Energy Forum (PLEF) . . . . .                                                                            | 326        |
| 12.3.3    | North Sea Countries Offshore Grid<br>Initiative (NSCOGI) . . . . .                                                    | 327        |
| 12.3.4    | Baltic Energy Market Interconnection<br>Plan (BEMIP) . . . . .                                                        | 328        |
| 12.3.5    | Trilateral Cooperation for the Expansion of Pumped<br>Storage Plants: Switzerland, Austria, Germany . . . . .         | 328        |
| 12.4      | Case Study (I): A Joint Balancing Market in the Alpine<br>Region . . . . .                                            | 329        |
| 12.4.1    | An Important Market Segment . . . . .                                                                                 | 329        |
| 12.4.2    | ... Can Be Beneficial for Regional Cooperation . . . . .                                                              | 332        |
| 12.5      | Case Study (II): North and Baltic Sea Cooperation . . . . .                                                           | 334        |
| 12.5.1    | Welfare Economic Analysis of Development<br>Scenarios . . . . .                                                       | 335        |
| 12.5.2    | Focus on Transmission Cooperation Among<br>the Baltic Countries . . . . .                                             | 339        |
| 12.6      | Conclusions . . . . .                                                                                                 | 342        |
|           | References . . . . .                                                                                                  | 343        |

|                                                                                                                                  |            |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| <b>13 Modeling the Low-Carbon Transformation in Europe: Developing Paths for the European Energy System Until 2050 . . . . .</b> | <b>345</b> |
| Konstantin Löffler, Thorsten Burandt, Karlo Hainsch, Claudia Kemfert, Pao-Yu Oei, and Christian von Hirschhausen                 |            |
| 13.1 Introduction . . . . .                                                                                                      | 346        |
| 13.2 Model and Data . . . . .                                                                                                    | 348        |
| 13.2.1 General Model Description . . . . .                                                                                       | 348        |
| 13.2.2 Model Setup and Data . . . . .                                                                                            | 351        |
| 13.3 Scenario Definition . . . . .                                                                                               | 356        |
| 13.4 Results and Discussion . . . . .                                                                                            | 358        |
| 13.4.1 Emission Pathway: 2 Degrees . . . . .                                                                                     | 358        |
| 13.4.2 Emission Pathway: Business as Usual . . . . .                                                                             | 365        |
| 13.4.3 Emission Pathway: 1.5 Degrees . . . . .                                                                                   | 366        |
| 13.4.4 Comparison of Emission Pathways . . . . .                                                                                 | 367        |
| 13.4.5 Discussion . . . . .                                                                                                      | 369        |
| 13.5 Conclusion . . . . .                                                                                                        | 371        |
| References . . . . .                                                                                                             | 372        |

## **Part IV Assessment, Perspectives, and Conclusions**

|                                                                                                                                                                 |            |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| <b>14 General Conclusions: 15 Lessons from the First Phase of the Energiewende . . . . .</b>                                                                    | <b>377</b> |
| Claudia Kemfert, Pao-Yu Oei, and Christian von Hirschhausen                                                                                                     |            |
| 14.1 Introduction . . . . .                                                                                                                                     | 377        |
| 14.2 Lessons from the Long-term Trends: The Energiewende in the Context of Long-term Energy and Climate Policies in Germany . . . . .                           | 378        |
| 14.2.1 Lesson I: The Energiewende Has Challenged the Traditional Modus Operandi of Energy Policy in Germany . . . . .                                           | 378        |
| 14.2.2 Lesson II: The Energiewende Corresponds to a Certain Extent to the “Soft Path” <u>Not</u> Taken in the 1970s . . . . .                                   | 379        |
| 14.2.3 Lesson III: The Energiewende Is a Long-term Project, and It Is a Political and Societal Revolution as Much as It Is a Technological Revolution . . . . . | 380        |
| 14.2.4 Lesson IV: The Energiewende Has not Changed the Cross-Subsidization of Energy-Intensive Consumers by Small Businesses and Household Consumers . . . . .  | 380        |
| 14.2.5 Lesson V: Methodology Matters: Polycentric Approaches Are Superior to Monocentric (“One-Size-Fits-All”) Approaches . . . . .                             | 381        |

- 14.3 The Ongoing Energiewende in Germany: Lessons from the “Engine Room” . . . . . 382
  - 14.3.1 Lesson VI: The Energiewende Is the German Version of Low-Carbon Transformation that Focuses Specifically on Renewables . . . . . 382
  - 14.3.2 Lesson VII: Some Targets of the Energiewende Were “Low-Hanging Fruits” and Have Already Been Reached. . . . . 382
  - 14.3.3 Lessons VIII: . . . But Carbon Emission Reduction and Energy Efficiency Have Not . . . . . 382
  - 14.3.4 Lesson IX: Technologies Needed for the Energiewende in the Electricity Sector to Succeed by 2050 Are Already Available . . . . . 383
  - 14.3.5 Lesson X: The Electricity Sector Is Relatively Easy to Decarbonize, Whereas the Transportation, Industry, and Household Sectors Are Not . . . . . 384
  - 14.3.6 Lesson XI: The Economic Benefits of the Energiewende Surpass the Costs, So the Energiewende Is Economically Efficient . . . . . 384
- 14.4 Lessons from a European Perspective: The Energiewende in Germany and Low-Carbon Transformation in Europe . . . . . 385
  - 14.4.1 Lesson XII: The European Low-Carbon Transformation Is a Mosaic of National Strategies, Many of Which Include Substantial Shares of Coal and Nuclear Energy. . . . . 385
  - 14.4.2 Lesson XIII: . . . Yet the German Energiewende Can Benefit from Regional and Europe-wide Cooperation . . . 385
  - 14.4.3 Lesson XIV: Infrastructure Is an Important Element of the European Low-Carbon Transformation, But Does Not Constitute a Bottleneck for Decarbonization . . . . . 386
  - 14.4.4 Lesson XV: The Low-Carbon Energy Transformation Needs Strong European Energy and Climate Policies . . . 386
- 14.5 Conclusions . . . . . 387