

Contents

A. Introduction	1
I. Context	1
II. Objectives and Research Approach	7
III. Structure	10
B. Overarching Principles of Tax Policy	15
I. Preliminary Remarks	15
II. Equity	16
1. Dimensions of Equity	16
2. Inter-Nation Equity	17
a. Fundamental Concept	17
b. Significance for the Subject under Investigation	20
3. Inter-Taxpayer Equity	21
a. Fundamental Concept	21
b. Significance for the Subject under Investigation	24
III. Neutrality	25
1. Fundamental Concept	25
2. Capital Export Neutrality	27
3. Capital Import Neutrality	28
4. Capital Ownership Neutrality	29
5. Significance for the Subject under Investigation	30
IV. Efficiency	30
1. Fundamental Concept	30
2. Significance for the Subject under Investigation	32
V. Certainty and Simplicity	32
1. Fundamental Concept	32

2. Significance for the Subject under Investigation	34
VI. Effectiveness and Fairness	35
1. Fundamental Concept	35
2. Significance for the Subject under Investigation	36
VII. Flexibility	36
1. Fundamental Concept	36
2. Significance for the Subject under Investigation	37
C. Fundamentals of the Taxation of Permanent Establishments	39
I. Historical Development of the PE Concept	39
1. Origins of the PE Concept	39
2. Adoption of the PE Concept in International Tax Treaties	40
3. The Emergence of the OECD Model Tax Convention	42
4. The BEPS Project and Its Implications for the PE Concept	43
II. Rationale and Justification Underlying the PE Concept	44
III. PE Definition under German Tax Law	47
1. Conceptual Foundation	47
2. Essential Characteristics of a PE under Section 12 GFC	49
a. Place of Business or Facility	49
(1) Physical Presence	49
(2) Right of Disposal	50
b. Fixed Nature	51
c. Serving the Business of the Enterprise	53
(1) General Elements	53
(2) Presence of Personnel	54
3. Positive List Indicating a PE	55
4. Special PE Cases	56
a. Building Sites or Constructions or Installation Projects	56
b. Server PE	57
c. Service PE	60
5. Permanent Representative	61
IV. PE Definition under Tax Treaty Law	62
1. Conceptual Foundations of Tax Treaty Law	62
a. Relation of Tax Treaty Law and German Domestic Law	62

b. Objective of the PE Definition under Treaty Law	64
c. Relevance of the OECD MC Commentary	65
(1) Rational and Use	65
(2) Relations with Previous Versions	66
2. Structure of Article 5 OECD MC	67
3. Essential Characteristics of a PE under Article 5	
OECD-MC	69
a. Place of Business	69
(1) Physical Presence	69
(2) Right of Disposal	69
b. Fixed Nature	71
c. Carrying on Business of the Enterprise	72
(1) General Elements	72
(2) Presence of Human Beings	73
4. Positive List Indicating a PE	75
5. Preparatory or Auxiliary Activities	76
a. Conceptual Approach	76
b. Changes through the BEPS Project	77
c. Deviations of German National Law from OECD	
Approach	79
6. Special PE Cases	80
a. Building Sites or Constructions or Installation	
Projects	80
(1) Conceptual Approach	80
(2) Changes through the BEPS Project	81
(3) Deviations of German National Law	
from OECD Approach	82
b. Server PE	83
(1) Conceptual Approach	83
(2) Changes through the BEPS Project	87
(3) Deviations of German National Law	
from OECD Approach	88
c. Agent PEs	88
(1) Conceptual Approach	88
(2) Changes through the BEPS Project	90
(3) Deviations of German National Law	
from OECD Approach	93
d. Service PE	94
7. Implementation of BEPS Action 7 Outcomes via MLI . . .	96

a.	Purpose of the MLI	96
b.	Implementation Process of the MLI	98
c.	German MLI Position	101
V.	Interim Conclusion	102
D.	The Attribution of Profits to Permanent Establishments	107
I.	The Attribution of Profits to PEs under Tax Treaty Law	107
1.	Specifics of Profit Attribution in the PE Context	107
2.	Methods of Profit Attribution	108
a.	Preliminary Remarks	108
b.	Direct Method	109
c.	Indirect Method	110
3.	Interpretation of Article 7 OECD MC (pre-2010 version)	112
a.	Relationship between Article 7(2) and Article 7(3) OECD MC	112
b.	Interpretation of the Term ‘Profits of an Enterprise’	114
(1)	Preliminary Remarks	114
(2)	Relevant Business Activity Approach	114
(3)	Functionally Separate Entity Approach	115
4.	Implementation of the Authorised OECD Approach	116
a.	Development of the Authorised OECD Approach	116
(1)	PE Report 2008 and its Implications for Article 7 OECD MC	116
(2)	Overview of the Modifications to Article 7 OECD MC	118
b.	The 2-Step Approach of the AOA	120
(1)	Conceptual Approach	120
(2)	Step 1: Hypothesising the PE as a Separate and Independent Enterprise	122
(3)	Step 2: Pricing of Dealings	157
5.	Documentation Requirements	179
a.	Preliminary Remarks	179
b.	Three-Tiered Approach to Transfer Pricing Documentation	181
(1)	Master File	181
(2)	Local File	182
(3)	Country-by-Country Reporting	183

c.	Evaluation of the Documentation Requirements	188
II.	The Attribution of Profits to PEs under National Tax Law	192
1.	Need for National Implementation of the AOA Approach	192
2.	Implementation of the AOA Approach in Section 1 ETRA	193
a.	Conceptual Approach	193
b.	Extension of the Scope of Application of Section 1 ETRA to PEs	193
c.	Hypothesising the PE as a Separate and Independent Enterprise	195
3.	The 2-Step Approach According to Section 1(5) Sentence 3 and 4 ETRA in conjunction with the Provisions of the BsGaV	196
a.	Preliminary Remarks	196
b.	Step 1: Hypothesising the PE as a Separate and Independent Enterprise	197
(1)	Attribution of People Functions	197
(2)	Attribution of Assets	205
(3)	Attribution of an Enterprise's Business Transactions	221
(4)	Attribution of Opportunities and Risks	225
(5)	Attribution of Free Capital	229
(6)	Attribution of Remaining Liability Items and Financing Expenses	238
c.	Step 2: Recognition and Pricing of Dealings	247
(1)	Recognition of Dealings	247
(2)	Determination of Transfer Prices for PE's Business Relations	253
d.	Interim Conclusion	262
4.	Restricted Applicability of the German AOA Principles	266
a.	Issues Arising from Divergent German Tax Treaty Network	266
b.	Classification of the German Tax Treaty Network	266
(1)	Tax Treaties Following the Wording of Article 7 OECD MC 2010	266
(2)	Interpretation of the Different Tax Treaties	268
c.	The Escape Clause	270

(1) Background	270
(2) Requirements for the Application of the Escape Clause	274
(3) Application with Respect to Non-Tax Treaty States	282
d. Interim Conclusion	282
5. Documentation Requirements under German National Law	284
a. Evolution of Documentation Requirements in Germany	284
(1) Landmark Decision of the German Federal Tax Court	284
(2) Additional Documentation Requirements for Dealings	285
(3) Modifications through BEPS Action 13	285
b. The Obligation to Prepare Auxiliary and Ancillary Accounts	287
c. Documentation Requirements in Accordance with Section 90(3) GFC	288
(1) Local File	288
(2) Master File	291
(3) Submission Requirements and Penalties	292
d. CbC Reporting	294
(1) Obligation to Submit a CbC Report	294
(2) Required Information	296
(3) Treatments of PEs in the CbC Report	297
(4) Submission Requirements and Penalties	299
(5) Comparison to the OECD Approach	300
e. Evaluation of the Documentation Requirements	306
E. Digitalisation of the Economy and Its Implications for the PE Concept	309
I. Tax Challenges Arising from the Digitalisation of the Economy	309
1. Preliminary Remarks	309
2. Common Characteristics of Digitalised Business Models and their Tax Implications	312
3. Classification of Digitalised Business Models	315
4. Value Creation in the Digital Economy	319

II.	BEPS Action Points Affecting Taxation of PE's	322
1.	Preliminary Remarks	322
2.	BEPS Action 7: Prevention of the Avoidance of the PE Status	325
3.	BEPS Actions 8–10: Aligning Transfer Pricing Outcomes with Value Creation	328
4.	BEPS Action 3: Designing Effective CFC Rules	330
5.	Evaluation of the Effectiveness of the BEPS Actions	331
III.	Case Studies Illustrating the Challenges Arising from the Digitalisation of the Economy for the PE Concept	334
1.	Case Study 1: Online Retailer	334
a.	Facts of the Case	334
b.	Nexus in Market Jurisdiction	335
c.	Profit Attribution to Market Jurisdiction	338
d.	Evaluation	340
2.	Case Study 2: Online Advertiser	341
a.	Facts of the Case	341
b.	Nexus in Market Jurisdiction	342
c.	Profit Attribution to Market Jurisdiction	347
d.	Evaluation	347
IV.	Taxing the Digitalised Economy	348
1.	The Underlying Problem	348
2.	Different Views by the Members of the Inclusive Framework	350
3.	Unilateral Actions Introduced by Countries	351
4.	The Need for a Common Approach	357
F.	Adapting the International Corporate Tax System to the Digitalisation of the Economy	361
I.	Where Do We Stand in the Ongoing Debate	361
II.	Overview of Pillar One Blueprint	366
1.	Conceptual Foundation	366
2.	New Taxing Right (Amount A)	368
a.	Scope	368
b.	Nexus	370
c.	Revenue Sourcing Rules	371
3.	New Profit Allocation Rules (Amount A and B)	372
a.	Amount A	372

(1) Overview	372
(2) Tax Base Determination	372
(3) The Formula to Determine the Quantum of Amount A	373
(4) Elimination of Double Taxation	374
b. Amount B	375
4. Tax Certainty	376
III. Assessment of Pillar One Blueprint in Light of the Overarching Principles of Tax Policy	377
1. Preliminary Remarks	377
2. Equity	378
a. Inter-Nation Equity	378
(1) Scope and Nexus	378
(2) Profit Allocation Rules	381
(3) Interim Conclusion	383
b. Inter-Taxpayer Equity	385
(1) Scope and Nexus	385
(2) Profit Allocation Rules	386
(3) Interim Conclusion	388
3. Neutrality	389
a. Scope and Nexus	389
b. Profit Allocation Rules	391
c. Interim Conclusion	392
4. Efficiency	393
a. Scope and Nexus	393
b. Profit Allocation Rules	394
c. Interim Conclusion	395
5. Certainty and Simplicity	395
a. Scope and Nexus	395
b. Profit Allocation Rules	398
c. Interim Conclusion	400
6. Effectiveness and Fairness	401
a. Scope and Nexus	401
b. Profit Allocation Rules	403
c. Interim Conclusion	407
7. Flexibility	408
a. Scope and Nexus	408
b. Profit Allocation Rules	408
c. Interim Conclusion	410

8. Overall Evaluation	410
IV. Recommendations for Remaining Work	413
1. Scope of Amount A	413
2. New Nexus Rule under Amount A	415
3. Tax Base Determination	417
4. Revenue Sourcing Rules	418
5. Segmentation Framework	419
6. Implementation and Administration	420
G. Conclusion	423
Annex	429
References	471