

Table of Contents

Tables	17
Abbreviations	19
List of WTO/GATT cases cited	21
Introduction	27
Chapter 1: Judicial decision-making at the WTO (and elsewhere) – a conceptual outline	35
1. Judicial decision-making in the face of the indeterminacy of the law: a debate revisited	37
2. Factors determining the outcome of cases in the face of the indeterminacy of the law	49
2.1. Courts as strategic actors	50
2.2. Fostering judges' legal or non-legal preferences and attitudes	55
2.3. Mandate and procedural rules	58
3. Judicial styles in the face of the indeterminacy of the law	60
3.1. Judicial styles in the face of the indeterminacy of the law – general insights	60
3.2. Lasser's work on judicial styles as part of a judicial system	73
3.3. Additional factors influencing judicial styles	79
4. Hypotheses on judicial decision-making within the WTO	81
4.1. The WTO dispute settlement system and its law	82
4.1.1. The dispute settlement system: a judicial mechanism?	83
4.1.2. The degree of indeterminacy of WTO law	87
4.2. The Appellate Body as described by its (former) Members	91
4.3. Characteristics of the WTO dispute settlement system relevant for style and outcome	97
4.3.1. The dispute settlement system: a (relatively) new and contested mechanism	97
4.3.2. Mandate and procedural rules	100

4.4. Additional factors relevant for the substantive outcome of WTO cases	106
4.4.1. Maintaining and expanding judicial power	106
4.4.2. Judges' legal or non-legal preferences	116
4.5. Additional factors relevant for the style of the Appellate Body	119
4.6. Conclusion: hypotheses	121
5. Methodology	124
5.1. Methods for analysing court decisions – and their limits	124
5.2. Substance: cases and norms to be considered	129
5.3. Judicial style: issues to be considered	134
5.3.1. Issues from the analysis by Summers/Taruffo	136
5.3.2. Lessons from discussions on judicial activism	138
5.3.3. Conclusions on judicial style	143
5.4. Overview: research approach to chapters 2 and 3	146
Chapter 2: Substance: The case law on justification norms	148
1. Art. XX GATT and XIV GATT	149
1.1. Overarching issues	151
1.1.1. Protection of extraterritorial resources	151
1.1.2. Applicability of Art. XX GATT under other WTO agreements	153
1.2. Sub-paragraphs of Art. XX GATT	157
1.2.1. Art. XX (a) GATT	157
1.2.2. Art. XX (b) GATT	166
1.2.3. Art. XX (d) GATT	177
1.2.4. Art. XX (g) GATT	187
1.3. Art. XIV (a) GATS	196
1.4. Chapeau of Art. XX GATT and XIV GATS	199
1.5. Discussion of case law on GATT and GATS	217
1.5.1. Unclear structure and content of the necessity test	218
1.5.2. Logical inconsistencies in the case law	224
1.5.3. Incorrect use of earlier case law	226
1.5.4. Lack of justification and clarification	228
1.5.5. A role for precaution?	231
1.6. Assessment	233
1.6.1. Applicability of Art. XX GATT	234
1.6.2. Clause on regulatory objectives	235

1.6.3. Clauses on the link between measures and regulatory objectives	238
1.6.4. Chapeau	243
1.6.5. Summary	247
2. SPS Agreement	248
2.1. Art. 5.1-5.3, 5.7, 2.2 SPS	250
2.1.1. Art. 5.1 - 5.3 SPS	251
2.1.2. Art. 2.2 SPS	270
2.1.3. Art. 5.7 SPS	273
2.2. Art. 5.6 SPS	282
2.2.1. Identification of the appropriate level of protection	283
2.2.2. Not more trade-restrictive than required	285
2.3. Art. 5.5, 2.3 SPS	290
2.3.1. Art. 5.5 SPS	290
2.3.2. Art. 2.3 SPS	297
2.4. Art. 3 SPS	299
2.4.1. Relationship between Art. 3.1, 3.2, 3.3 SPS	299
2.4.2. Interpretation of certain clauses in Art. 3.1, 3.2 SPS	302
2.5. Discussion of case law on the SPS Agreement	303
2.5.1. The concepts of science, risk, and risk assessment	303
2.5.2. Problems with the “appropriate level of protection”	312
2.5.3. The role of precaution	321
2.6. Assessment	326
3. TBT Agreement	331
3.1. Art. 2.2 TBT	333
3.2. Art. 2.4 TBT	340
3.3. Discussion and assessment	345
4. Conclusions	348
4.1. Summary of the findings	349
4.2. Relating the results to existing research	351
4.3. Relating the results to the conceptual framework	364
Chapter 3: Judicial style and justification	366
1. Methods of interpretation	369
1.1. Textual interpretation	372
1.2. The context in contextual interpretation	380
1.3. The objectives in teleological interpretation	384
1.4. Supplementary means of interpretation	387

1.5. The role of WTO Members' intention in interpretation	388
1.6. Beyond interpretive methods: The use of international law	390
1.6.1. The basics	392
1.6.2. Sources of international law used and legal basis for using them	394
1.6.3. Ways of using international law in WTO dispute settlement – the (relatively) clear part	396
1.6.4. The role of non-WTO international law – how far do the adjudicators go?	403
1.6.5. Summary on the use of international law in WTO dispute settlement	410
1.7. Discussion	412
1.7.1. Transparency about methods of interpretation	412
1.7.2. The methods of interpretation used	415
1.7.3. Struggling with the role of non-WTO international law	421
1.8. Assessment	430
2. Standard of review and deference to decisions taken in the political realm	439
2.1. Standard of review concerning non-trade measures by WTO Members	441
2.2. Dealing with gaps in the text	453
2.3. The use of the decisions of WTO political bodies	456
2.4. Discussion	461
2.4.1. Standard of review	462
2.4.2. Dealing with gaps and political decisions by WTO political bodies	468
2.5. Assessment	471
3. To decide or not to decide – precedents and avoidance techniques	473
3.1. Precedents	476
3.2. Avoidance techniques (and their opposites)	485
3.3. Discussion	497
3.4. Assessment	501
4. The use of substantive principles and balancing	506
4.1. The use of unwritten (substantive) principles	509
4.2. Balancing	517
4.3. Assessment	523

5. Other stylistic features of the WTO dispute settlement reports	531
5.1. Length and tone of reports	532
5.2. Appeasement techniques	534
5.3. Making different interpretive options invisible	539
5.4. Assessment	543
6. Conclusion: Judicial style of the WTO dispute settlement bodies	548
6.1. Characterizing the judicial style of the WTO dispute settlement bodies	548
6.1.1. Using the (adapted) Summers/Taruffo table	548
6.1.2. Other aspects of judicial style	557
6.1.3. Assessments of the WTO judicial style in the literature	558
6.2. Making sense of the judicial style of the WTO dispute settlement bodies	561
Chapter 4: Conclusions and outlook	564
1. The success of the WTO dispute settlement system – the evidence	566
1.1. (Re)-appointment of Members of the Appellate Body	567
1.2. Legislative overturn of judicial decisions	570
1.3. Attempts at changing the functioning of the dispute settlement bodies	572
1.4. (Non)compliance with dispute settlement decisions	575
1.5. Non-use of the dispute settlement system	577
1.6. An alternative explanation: do WTO Members not care (enough)?	579
1.7. Conclusions	581
2. The literature: How has the WTO dispute settlement system successfully generated legitimacy?	583
3. My own version: (How) have the adjudicators managed to create legitimacy?	588
4. Outlook	594
References	599