

Contents

A Comparative Law	1
I. Frame of Reference: Germany's Principle of Strict Separation	1
1) Historical Setting: "Only Soldiers Can Fight Democrats"	2
a) The German Confederation	2
b) The German Reich	3
c) After the First World War	5
d) The Third Reich	6
e) 1945–1948 and the Following Period	6
2) General Conscription	7
3) Present Division of Labour and Federal Structures	8
a) Bundeswehr	8
aa) National Defence	10
bb) Contribution to Systems of Mutual Collective Security	11
cc) Regional Disaster Relief	12
dd) National Disaster Relief	12
ee) National Emergency	13
ff) Internal State of Emergency	13
gg) Administrative Aid	13
hh) Police-Related and Other Missions to Avert Dangers	14
ii) Defence Policy Guidelines	14
jj) White Paper	15
kk) Mandated Missions	16
b) Military Police	17
c) Police	17
aa) Preventive Action	18
bb) Repressive Actions	19
d) Federal Police and the Late Federal Border Police	19
aa) Historical Development and Original Mission	20
bb) Present Mission	22
cc) Additional Mission: International Police Operations	23

e) Other Forms of Cooperation Between Police and Armed Forces and Exceptions	26
II. Separation Within Europe	26
1) The Division of Labour	26
a) European Union Member States	27
aa) Austria	27
aaa) Armed Forces	27
bbb) Police Forces	28
ccc) Cooperation	29
bb) Belgium	29
aaa) Armed Forces: “Modes d’Engagement Opérationnels”	29
bbb) Police Forces	31
ccc) Cooperation	32
cc) Bulgaria	33
aaa) Armed Forces	33
bbb) Gendarmerie	33
ccc) Police Forces	34
dd) Cyprus	34
aaa) Armed Forces	34
bbb) Gendarmerie	34
ccc) Police Forces	35
ee) Czech Republic	35
aaa) Armed Forces	35
1) Combat Operations	36
2) Non-combat Operations	36
A) Non-combat Operations of the ACR Within the National Territory	37
B) Non-combat Operations of ACR Outside the National Territory	38
bbb) Police Forces	40
ff) Denmark	41
aaa) Armed Forces	41
bbb) Home Guard	42
ccc) Police Forces	42
gg) Estonia	43
aaa) Armed Forces	43
bbb) Defence League	45
ccc) Combined Border Guard and Police Forces	45
ddd) Cooperation	46
hh) Finland	47
aaa) National Military Defence Forces	47
bbb) Border Guard	48
ccc) Police	49

	ddd) Cooperation	50
ii)	France	50
	aaa) Armed Forces	51
	bbb) Gendarmerie Nationale	52
	ccc) Police Nationale	57
	ddd) Cooperation	59
jj)	Greece	59
	aaa) Armed Forces	59
	bbb) Police Forces	61
	ccc) Border Guards	61
kk)	Hungary	61
	aaa) Armed Forces	61
	bbb) Border Guard	62
	ccc) Police Forces	64
ll)	Ireland	65
	aaa) Armed Forces	65
	bbb) National Police	66
	ccc) Civil Defence	67
mm)	Italy	67
	aaa) Armed Forces	67
	1) Arma di Carabinieri	69
	2) Guardia di Finanza	70
	bbb) Police Forces	71
	1) Polizia di Stato	71
	2) Polizia di Penitenziaria	71
	3) Corpo Forestale dello Stato	71
	4) Polizia Provinciale and Polizia Municipale	71
	ccc) Cooperation and Combined Operations	72
nn)	Latvia	73
	aaa) National Armed Forces	73
	bbb) National Guard	74
	ccc) Police Forces	75
	1) State Police	76
	2) Security Police	76
	ddd) State Border Guard	77
	eee) Cooperation	77
oo)	Lithuania	77
	aaa) Armed Forces	77
	bbb) Police	79
	ccc) Other Security Services	80
	ddd) Cooperation	80
pp)	Luxembourg	81
	aaa) Armed Forces	81
	bbb) Police Grand Ducale	82

qq)	Malta	82
	aaa) Armed Forces	82
	bbb) Malta Police Forces	83
	ccc) Cooperation	83
rr)	Netherlands	84
	aaa) Armed Forces	84
	bbb) Royal Constabulary: Koninklijke Marechaussée ..	85
	ccc) Police Forces	86
	ddd) Cooperation	86
ss)	Poland	87
	aaa) Armed Forces	87
	bbb) Police Forces	89
	ccc) Other Security Forces	90
	ddd) Cooperation	90
tt)	Portugal	93
	aaa) Armed Forces	93
	bbb) National Republican Guard	96
	ccc) Police Forces	98
	1) Public Security Police	99
	2) Criminal Police	100
	3) Other Civil Security Forces	100
	ddd) Cooperation	101
uu)	Romania	101
	aaa) Armed Forces	101
	bbb) Gendarmerie	102
	ccc) Border Police	102
	ddd) Police Forces	102
vv)	Slovakia	103
	aaa) Armed Forces	103
	bbb) Police Forces	104
	ccc) Cooperation	104
ww)	Slovenia	105
	aaa) Armed Forces	105
	bbb) Police Forces	105
	ccc) Cooperation	106
xx)	Spain	107
	aaa) Armed Forces	107
	bbb) Security Forces	109
	1) Guardia Civil	109
	2) Policia Nacional	110
	3) Policia Local, Policia Urbana	111
	4) Mossos d'Esquadra	111
	5) Ertzaintza	112
	6) Miqueletes	113

ccc) Cooperation	113
yy) Sweden	113
aaa) Armed Forces	113
bbb) Home Guard	116
ccc) Police Forces	117
ddd) Coast Guard	118
eee) Cooperation	119
zz) United Kingdom	121
aaa) Armed Forces	121
bbb) Police	123
ccc) Cooperation	124
b) European Gendarmerie Force	127
c) Bi- and Multinational Joint Forces	130
d) Intermediate Result	131
2) The Mission of European Security Forces	131
a) The Need for Separation	132
aa) Relevant Examples of Military Intervention in Domestic Politics: From Ceausescu to Berisha	133
bb) “Mutual Checks and Balances” of a Modern Democracy	135
cc) Integration into a Democratic Political System	136
b) The Mission of the Armed Forces	137
aa) Defining the Military Force	138
aaa) External-Defensive Functions	140
bbb) Means-Based Approach	144
ccc) Organisational Structure: Top-Down	146
ddd) Legal Accountability	147
eee) Military and Police Ethos	148
fff) Characteristic Dilemmata	150
1) Force	150
2) Centralisation	151
3) Castellatation and Formalisation	152
ggg) Norm-Derivative Approach	153
hhh) Preliminary Finding: Norm-Derivative with a Twist	154
bb) Defining the Mission	155
aaa) Defence of the National Territory	157
bbb) Crisis Management	157
ccc) Humanitarian Missions	158
ddd) States of Emergency	159
eee) Natural Catastrophes	161
cc) Preliminary Findings	162
c) Police Forces	163
aa) Defining the Police	163

aaa) Inherently Political	163
bbb) Bottom-Up Organisation	165
bb) Defining the Mission	166
aaa) Policing at Home	166
1) Community Policing	166
2) Law Enforcement	168
bbb) Policing Abroad	171
d) Paramilitary Forces	172
aa) Border Control	173
bb) Peace-Support Operations	175
cc) Fight Against Terrorism	176
e) Cooperation Within the Particular Mission	177
aa) Within National Territory	177
bb) Within PSO	178
f) The Problem of Homogenisation	179
g) Intermediary Results	182
3) Defining the Assignments	183
a) Missions Defined by Constitutional Law	184
b) Missions Defined by Statute	185
c) Missions Defined by Executive Authority	186
III. Preliminary Findings: Security Forces in Categories	186
B Operational and Institutional Consequences	189
I. Reflections of the Principle of Separation	189
1) A European Perspective	189
2) A German Perspective	191
II. The German Legal Ambiguity During Joint Operations Abroad ...	193
III. Reappraisal of Assignment: Pitfalls and Potentials	195
1) Exemplary Paragons	198
a) U.S. Constabulary	198
b) Multinational Specialised Units	199
2) Repercussions on the Bundeswehr	200
a) The Choice of Force	201
aa) Stabilising Forces of the Army	201
bb) Military Police	203
b) Training and Equipment	203
3) Possible Strategies for the Bundeswehr	206
a) Transformation	206
b) Retreat from PSO	206
c) Successive Combination	207
4) Repercussions on the Police	207
a) Pro: Conceptual and Operational Advantages	209
aa) Experience	209
bb) Easing the Transition to Civil Security Structures	209

- cc) Expenditures: Personnel Costs 211
 - dd) Multiple Assignments 212
 - ee) Flexibility 213
 - b) Contra: Legal and Institutional Impediments 214
 - aa) Parliamentarian Participation 214
 - bb) Public Services Law 215
 - cc) Inconsistent Development of the Federal Police 216
 - dd) National Balances and the Lack of
Operational Standards 217
 - ee) Fragmentation of Auspice and Competence 219
 - ff) Insufficient Training and Equipment 220
 - gg) Expenditures: Material and Training 223
 - c) Action Alternative 223
- 5) Intermediary Findings 224
 - a) Findings: Doctrinal shift 224
- C Conclusion 227**
- Bibliography 233**