

Table of Contents

List of Abbreviations	13
Introduction	15
Part 1: Fundamentals and Relation of the Human Right to Health and the WTO	21
Chapter 1: Basis and Content of the Human Right to Health	21
A. Legal Basis of the Right to Health	21
I. International Codifications	22
1. United Nations Charter-Based System	22
2. Universal Declaration of Human Rights	22
3. Treaty-Based Protection	23
a. International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	23
b. International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	25
c. Other Conventions	26
II. Regional Protection	26
1. Europe	26
2. Americas	27
3. Asia	28
4. Africa	28
III. General International Law	28
1. Customary International Law	28
a. State Practice	29
b. <i>Opinio Juris</i>	32
2. General Principles	33
B. Content and Scope of the Human Right to Health	34
I. The Legal Relevance of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	34
II. The Principle of Progressive Realization	35
III. Obligations of Conduct and Result	36
IV. Freedoms and Entitlements	37
V. Availability, Accessibility, Acceptability, and Quality	38
VI. Levels of Protection	39
VII. Justifying Non-Compliance with Economic Constraints	41
C. Interim Conclusions	42
Chapter 2: The Dichotomy of Human Rights and International Trade Law	42
A. Background to WTO Law	44
I. History	44
II. Baseline Concepts	45
1. Economic Rationale	45

a.	Absolute and Comparative Cost Advantage . . .	46
b.	The Heckscher-Ohlin Model	47
c.	New and Strategic Trade Theories	50
2.	International Relations Theory	53
a.	Realism	54
b.	Institutionalism	55
c.	Constructivism	57
i.	Basic Concepts	57
ii.	The Embedded Liberalism Compromise . . .	59
iii.	The Role of Ideas and the Evolution of the International Trade System	60
iv.	Constructivism's Relevance for Legal Interpretation	63
B.	The WTO: Core Legal Concepts	64
I.	Stimuli towards Market Liberalization	64
II.	Non-Discrimination	65
1.	Most-Favoured-Nation Principle	66
2.	National-Treatment	68
III.	Exceptions: Measures Necessary to Protect Human Health	70
IV.	TRIPS Specific Obligations	71
1.	Intellectual Property Protection Relevant for the Human Right to Health	71
a.	Patents	73
b.	Trademarks	74
2.	Human Rights Protection of Intellectual Property: Art. 15(1)(c) ICESCR and General Comment No. 17	75
a.	'Author'	77
b.	Protection of Inventors	78
c.	Protection of Trademark Holders	78
d.	'Moral and Material Interests'	79
V.	TRIPS Flexibilities	79
1.	Exceptions to Rights Conferred: Art. 30 TRIPS . . .	80
2.	Compulsory Licenses: Art. 31 TRIPS	80
3.	Exception to Trademark Protection: Art. 17 TRIPS	81
C.	Conflict between the WTO Agreements and the ICESCR . . .	81
I.	Principles for Determining Conflict	84
II.	Which Treaty Prevails	87
1.	Hierarchy of Norms	88
a.	Art. 103 UN Charter	89
b.	<i>Jus Cogens</i> Norms	89
c.	<i>Erga Omnes</i> Obligations	90
2.	Art. 30 VCLT: <i>Lex Posterior</i>	93
3.	General Maxims	93
a.	<i>Lex Prior</i>	93
b.	<i>Lex Specialis</i>	94
4.	'Conflict of Laws' Approach	95

D. Interim Conclusions	97
Chapter 3: Human Rights in the WTO Dispute Settlement	99
A. The Different Tasks of International Trade and Human Rights Fora	99
B. Jurisdiction of the Dispute Settlement Bodies	101
C. The Applicability of Human Rights Treaties in WTO Dispute Settlement	102
I. Art. 7 DSU: Terms of Reference of Panels	102
II. Art. 11 DSU: Function of Panels	104
III. Art. 3.2 DSU: General Provisions	105
IV. Good Faith and Estoppel Arguments for Application	106
V. Problems of Multilateral Treaties	108
VI. Coherence of the International Trade Order	110
D. Human Rights as Interpretational Aids of WTO Law: Art. 31 VCLT	111
I. 'Applicable in the Relations between the Parties'	112
II. 'Relevant Rules of International Law'	113
E. Jurisprudence on Non-WTO Law in WTO Dispute Settlement	113
F. Interim Conclusions	118
Part 2: The Application of Trade Law from a Right to Health Per- spective	120
Chapter 4: Invoking the Human Right to Health at the Violation Stage	120
A. Rules on Non-Discrimination	121
I. Trade in Goods: National-Treatment Principle	121
1. Likeness	121
2. Less Favourable Treatment	122
3. Relationship to Art. XX(b) GATT	124
II. Trade in Services: Most-Favoured-Nation Principle	125
1. Governmental Authority	126
2. Services not Supplied on a Commercial Basis	128
3. Services not Supplied in Competition with Other Service Suppliers	130
B. SPS Agreement	132
C. Regulatory Autonomy of Members in the TRIPS	133
I. Discrimination between Different Areas of Technology, Art. 27.1 TRIPS	133
II. Exclusion from Patentability for Pharmaceuticals	135
1. Art. 27.2 TRIPS	135
2. Art. 27.3(a) TRIPS	136
III. Patents on Uses	137
IV. Parallel Imports	137
1. Economic Background	137
2. Human Rights Demands for International Co-opera- tion	139

3. Procedural Aspects	140
V. Regulation of Trademarks	141
D. Interim Conclusions	141
Chapter 5: The Human Right to Health as an Exception to Trade in Goods and Services	143
A. The General Exception Clauses in the GATT and GATS . . .	143
I. Policy Objective 'Human Health'	144
1. Definition of Human Health	144
2. Policies Designed 'to Protect' and Risk Assessment .	145
II. Necessity Test	146
1. Contribution to the Policy Goal	146
2. Least Trade Restrictive Measure	147
III. Chapeau	149
B. Export Restraints and the Art. XI:2(a) GATT Defence	150
I. Temporarily Applied	151
II. Essential Products	151
III. Critical Shortage	151
C. TBT Agreement	152
D. Interim Conclusions	153
Chapter 6: TRIPS Flexibilities on Patents and Trademarks	154
A. Limited Exceptions to Patent Rights	154
I. Limited	154
II. Normal Exploitation of the Patent	155
III. No Unreasonable Prejudice of Legitimate Interests . . .	157
B. Compulsory Licensing of Patents	159
I. Substantive Requirements	160
1. Grounds for Granting Compulsory Licences	160
2. 'Failure to Work' and 'Local Working' Requirements	161
II. Technical Requirements	163
1. Individual Merits	163
2. Prior Negotiations	163
a. The Reasonability Requirement	163
b. Waiver of the Negotiations Requirement	164
i. National Emergency	164
ii. Public Non-Commercial Use	165
3. Adequate Remuneration	165
4. Review of the Decision	166
III. Scope of the Rights under Compulsory Licences	167
1. Limited by the Purpose	167
2. Non-Exclusive, Non-Assignable	167
3. Supply of the Domestic Market	167
a. 'Predominantly'	168
b. Exporting Pharmaceuticals to Members Lacking Production Capacities	169
i. Remedy of Anti-Competitive Practices	169

ii. Compulsory Licences in the Exporting Member	170
iii. Limited Exceptions in the Exporting Member	172
iv. Evaluation	172
C. Revocation of Patents	173
D. Limitations on the Right to Use Trademarks	173
I. Exceptions to Trademarks	173
II. Encumbrance with Special Requirements	175
E. The Doha Agenda	176
I. The Doha Declaration	176
1. Content	176
2. Legal Status	177
3. Evaluation	179
II. The Decision of 30 August 2003	180
1. Content	180
2. Legal Status	181
3. Evaluation	181
III. Amendment of the TRIPS Agreement	182
1. Content	182
2. Evaluation	182
F. Interim Conclusions	182
Part 3: Strengthening the Individual Dimension of the Human Right to Health in the Trade Context	184
Chapter 7: Human Rights Impact Assessment, Options for Treaty Amendment and Institutional Co-operation	184
A. Human Rights Impact Assessment for the Evaluation of Trade Policies	184
I. Integral Steps	185
1. Mapping	185
2. Defining Indicators	186
3. Assessment	188
II. Possible Fora	189
III. Relevance of Outcomes	190
B. Treaty Amendment and Co-operation Agreements	191
C. Interim Conclusions	193
Conclusion	194
Summary of Arguments	195
Deutsche Zusammenfassung	202
Bibliography	211
Index	237