

Contents

1	Introduction	1
	References	7
2	The Current Legal Status of the Right to Water	9
2.1	The Right to Water in Europe	9
2.1.1	The Right to Water in National Law of European States	9
2.1.1.1	The Right to Water in Germany	10
2.1.1.2	The Right to Water in Belgium	19
2.1.1.3	The Right to Water in France	25
2.1.1.4	Comparison of the Three European Approaches	30
2.1.2	The Right to Water in European Law	32
2.1.2.1	The Right to Water in the Law of the European Union	33
2.1.2.2	The Right to Water in the ECHR and the ESC	36
2.1.3	Conclusion and Analysis	37
2.2	The Right to Water Outside of Europe	39
2.2.1	The Right to Water in South African Law	40
2.2.1.1	Protection of the Right to Water through South African Legislation	41
2.2.1.2	Protection of the Right to Water through South African Courts	43
2.2.1.3	Analysis of the Protection of the Right to Water in South Africa	46
2.2.2	The Right to Water in Indian Law	50
2.2.2.1	The Protection of the Right to Water through Indian Laws	50
2.2.2.2	The Protection of the Right to Water through Indian Courts	51
2.2.2.3	Analysis of the Protection of the Right to Water in India	53
2.2.3	Comparative Analysis of the South African and Indian Approaches	55

2.3	A Human Right to Water in International Law	56
2.3.1	Protection of the Right through International Conventions and Treaties	57
2.3.2	Interpretations of Treaties through Courts and Quasi-Courts	62
2.3.2.1	General Decisions of International Courts and Quasi-Courts	62
2.3.2.2	General Comment No. 15	64
2.3.3	Protection of the Right to Water through International Custom	75
2.3.3.1	Millennium Development Goal Number 7	77
2.3.3.2	The UNGA Resolution on “The Human Right to Water and Sanitation”	78
2.3.3.3	The HRC Resolution “Human Rights and Access to Safe Drinking Water and Sanitation”	82
2.3.3.4	Renewal of the Mandate of the Independent Expert as Special Rapporteur	83
2.3.3.5	Assessment of the Current Situation	84
2.3.4	Protection of a Human Right to Water through General Principles of Law	86
2.4	Conclusion	87
	References	88
3	Philosophical and Conceptual Approaches to a Human Right to Water	95
3.1	The “Water” Element of the Term “Human Right to Water”	96
3.1.1	Objection: We Cannot Hold a Right to a Tangible Thing	96
3.1.2	Objection: The Time to Accept Water as a Right Is Not “Now”	97
3.1.3	Conclusion	98
3.2	The “Right” Element of the Term “Human Right to Water”	98
3.2.1	The Concept of a Right	99
3.2.2	Objection: We Cannot Accept a Right Without Choice	99
3.2.3	Objection: There Is No Added Value of a Right to Water	100
3.2.4	Objection: There Cannot Be a Right, if it Cannot Be Enforced	101
3.2.5	Objection: We Cannot Accept Rights Whose Realization Is “Impossible”	103
3.2.6	Conclusion	104
3.3	The “Human” Element of the Term “Human Right to Water”	105
3.3.1	The Identifiable Schools of Human Rights	105
3.3.2	Water as a Human Right According to the Different Schools	107
3.3.3	Conclusion	108

3.4 The Shape of a Right to Water: Combining Existing Approaches	108
3.4.1 A Self-Standing Right or a Derived Right?	109
3.4.2 Deriving from What? Plea for a More Integrated Approach	112
3.4.2.1 Antiquated Understanding of the Right to Life	115
3.4.2.2 Over-Categorization of Rights as Either Civil–Political or Socio-Economic	117
3.4.2.3 False Fear of Creating Unforeseeable State Obligations	118
3.4.2.4 Summary	119
3.4.3 Contouring the Right: Water and Sanitation—One or Two Rights?	120
3.4.4 Different Legal Levels of Protection—Relationship of Constitutional Rights to Water and a Human Right to Water	123
3.4.4.1 The Relationship of Different Legal Orders After the Kadi-Case	125
3.4.4.2 National Level of Protection Exceeding International Level of Protection	127
3.4.4.3 International Level of Protection Exceeding National Level Protection	128
3.4.4.4 Avoiding the Dilemma: Human Rights as Minimum, Not Uniform Standards	129
3.5 Conclusion	130
References	131
4 Implementation: Independent Monitoring, Enforcement Against the Private Sector, and International Realization	135
4.1 Independent Monitoring: The Case of the UN Special Rapporteur on the Human Right to Water and Sanitation	136
4.1.1 The Monitoring Role of Experts	136
4.1.2 Analysis of the Mandate's Undertaken Monitoring Efforts	138
4.1.2.1 Country Visits	138
4.1.2.2 Issues in Focus	141
4.1.3 Conclusion and Remaining Problems	143
4.2 Enforcing the Right in the Private Sector: The Case of Water Privatization	145
4.2.1 Preface: Conceptual Problems with the Right to Water and Privatization	146
4.2.1.1 Market Principles Incompatible with Services to Fulfill Basic Needs?	147
4.2.1.2 Non-existence of Competitive Water Markets?	148
4.2.1.3 Water as a Non-private Good?	149

4.2.1.4	Current Dynamics of Supply and Demand: Increasing Water Prices?	151
4.2.1.5	Conclusion: Compatibility of the Right to Water and Privatization	151
4.2.2	Case Studies: The ICSID-Jurisdiction on Water Privatization	152
4.2.2.1	Compania de Aguas de Aconquija v. Argentine Republic	152
4.2.2.2	Azurix Corporation v. Argentine Republic	155
4.2.2.3	Aguas del Tunari v. Republic of Bolivia	158
4.2.3	The Right to Water as Solution for Challenges of Water Privatization	163
4.2.3.1	Consideration of the Right to Water in the Concession Contract	163
4.2.3.2	Requirement of Monitoring and Control	164
4.2.3.3	Inclusion of Procedural Rights	165
4.2.3.4	The Right to Water as Mandatory Component of Judicial Review	167
4.2.4	Conclusion and Remaining Problems	169
4.3	Realization by International Means: The Case of International Obligations Deriving from a Right to Water	170
4.3.1	International Water Obligations: The Philosophical Background	170
4.3.1.1	A Liability Model Approach to the International Obligation to Fulfill	171
4.3.1.2	Some Kantian and Consequentialist Approaches	171
4.3.1.3	Rawlsian-Influenced Approaches	172
4.3.1.4	A Water-Specific Approach to International Water Assistance: Hugo Grotius	173
4.3.1.5	The Idea of Common Ownership of the Earth	175
4.3.1.6	Conclusion: A Compelling Philosophical Case for International Water Assistance?	176
4.3.2	International Water Assistance: Existing Legal Implications	177
4.3.2.1	International Obligations in Human Rights Instruments	178
4.3.2.2	Assessment of Existing International Water Obligations	178
4.3.3	International Water Obligations Under an Accepted Right to Water	179
4.3.3.1	International Obligations to <i>Respect</i> the Human Right to Water	179
4.3.3.2	International Duties to <i>Protect</i> the Human Right to Water	181
4.3.3.3	International Obligations to <i>Fulfill</i> the Human Right to Water	182

4.4 Conclusion and Remaining Problems	184
4.4.1 Necessary Consent of Host State for International Assistance	185
4.4.2 The Problem of “Conditionality”	186
4.4.3 Conditions of Withdrawal and Suspension of International Water Assistance	187
References	189
5 Conclusion	195
List of Documents	203
Bibliography	217
Index	231