

# Table of Contents

Israel Gilead, Michael D Green and Bernhard A Koch

## **General Report: Causal Uncertainty and Proportional Liability: Analytical and Comparative Report — 1**

- I. Introduction — 1**
  - 1. Meaning and Definition of Proportional Liability in the Project — 1**
  - 2. Causal Proportional Liability Contrasted with Proportional Liability Among Multiple Tortfeasors Based on Contributory (Comparative) Negligence — 3**
  - 3. The Aim of This Project — 4**
  - 4. Structure — 8**
- II. Categories of Proportional Liability — 10**
  - 1. Why Categorize? — 10**
  - 2. Category A – Uncertain Causes of Past Harm — 12**
    - A. Sub-category A1 – ‘alternative liability’ – indeterminate tortfeasors — 12**
    - B. Sub-category A2 – ‘market-share liability’ – causally unrelated tortfeasors and victims — 13**
    - C. Sub-category A3 – ‘pollution or drug cases’ – indeterminate victims — 13**
    - D. Sub-category A4 – ‘The hard case’ — 14**
    - E. Sub-category A5 – ‘lost chances’ — 14**
  - 3. Category B – Indeterminate Parts of Harm — 15**
    - A. Sub-category B1 – all parts of P’s harm were caused by liable Ds — 15**
    - B. Sub-category B2 – some parts of P’s harm were caused by other factors — 16**
  - 4. Category C – Unrealized Risks with Potential for Future Harms — 16**
  - 5. Category D – ‘Combination Cases’ — 17**
- III. Policy Considerations — 17**
- IV. Burden and Standard of Proof — 20**

**V. Category A – Uncertain Causes of Past Harm — 22**

1. Sub-category A1 – ‘Alternative Liability’ – Indeterminate Tortfeasor — **23**
  - A. Analysis — **23**
  - B. A1 cases in comparison — **25**
2. Sub-category A2 – ‘Market-share Liability’ – Causally Unrelated Tortfeasors and Victims — **26**
  - A. Analysis — **26**
  - B. A2 cases in comparison — **30**
3. Sub-category A3 – ‘Pollution or Drug Cases’ – Indeterminate Victims — **31**
  - A. Analysis — **31**
  - B. A3 cases in comparison — **34**
4. Sub-category A4 – ‘The Hard Case’ — **35**
  - A. Analysis — **35**
  - B. A4 cases in comparison — **38**
5. Sub-category A5 – The ‘Lost Chance’ Doctrine — **39**
  - A. Analysis — **39**
  - B. A5 cases in comparison — **43**

**VI. Category B – Indeterminate Parts of Harm — 44**

1. Sub-category B1 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Tortious Actors — **45**
  - A. Analysis — **45**
  - B. B1 cases in comparison — **47**
2. Sub-category B2 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Non-tortious Factors — **48**
  - A. Analysis — **48**
  - B. B2 cases in comparison — **49**

**VII. Category C – Risks of Future Harm — 50**

1. Sub-category C1 – Future Harm Uncertain Entirely — **51**
  - A. Analysis — **51**
  - B. C1 cases in comparison — **52**
2. Sub-Category C2 – Extent of Future Harm Uncertain — **54**
  - A. Analysis — **54**
  - B. C2 cases in comparison — **55**

**VIII. Category D – ‘Combination Cases’ — 56**

1. On the meaning of combination cases — **56**
2. How to cope with ‘combination cases’ — **57**

**IX. Summary and Conclusions — 58**

1. How to Approach CPL Issues? — 59
2. The Relevant Factual Effects of CPL — 59
3. Normative Considerations — 61
4. On the Cautious Monitored Development of CPL — 62
5. On the Comparative Landscape — 64
6. On Future Developments — 66

**Categories of Proportional Liability — 69****Category A – Uncertain Causes of Past Harm — 69**

Sub-category A1 – ‘Alternative Liability’ – Indeterminate Tortfeasor — 69

Sub-category A2 – ‘Market-share Liability’ – Causally Unrelated Tortfeasors and Victims — 69

Sub-category A3 – ‘Pollution or Drug Cases’ – Indeterminate Victims — 70

Sub-category A4 – ‘The Hard Case’ — 70

Sub-category A5 – The ‘Lost Chance’ Doctrine — 71

**Category B – Indeterminate Parts of Harm — 71**

Sub-category B1 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Tortious Actors — 71

Sub-category B2 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Non-tortious Factors — 72

**Category C – Risks of Future Harm — 72**

Sub-category C1 – Future Harm Uncertain Entirely — 73

Sub-category C2 – Extent of Future Harm Uncertain — 73

**Category D – ‘Combination Cases’ — 73****Country Reports**

Bernhard A Koch

**Causal Uncertainty and Proportional Liability in Austria — 77****I. Standard of Proof — 77****II. The Discussion of Proportional Liability in Austria — 79****A. The Starting Point – Multiple Tortfeasors under the ABGB — 79****B. Alternative Causes — 80****1. Alternative External Causes — 80****2. Alternative External Causes Competing with Risks within the Victim’s own Sphere — 83**

C.	Other Instances of Causal Uncertainty —	<b>87</b>
1.	Alternative Victims —	<b>87</b>
2.	Minimal Causation —	<b>88</b>
3.	Loss of a Chance —	<b>88</b>
4.	Market-Share Liability —	<b>90</b>
D.	The Two Drafts of a Tort Law Reform – One Step Forward and Two Steps Back —	<b>90</b>
III.	The Case Hypotheticals from an Austrian Perspective —	<b>92</b>
A.	Category A – Uncertain Causes of Past Harm —	<b>92</b>
1.	Sub-category A1 – ‘Alternative Liability’ – Indeterminate Tortfeasor —	<b>92</b>
2.	Sub-category A2 – ‘Market-share Liability’ – Causally Unrelated Tortfeasors and Victims —	<b>92</b>
3.	Sub-category A3 – ‘Pollution or Drug Cases’ – Indeterminate Victims —	<b>93</b>
4.	Sub-category A4 – ‘The Hard Case’ —	<b>93</b>
5.	Sub-category A5 – The ‘Lost Chance’ Doctrine —	<b>93</b>
B.	Category B – Indeterminate Parts of Harm —	<b>94</b>
1.	Sub-category B1 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Tortious Actors —	<b>94</b>
2.	Sub-category B2 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Non-tortious Factors —	<b>95</b>
C.	Category C – Risks of Future Harm —	<b>95</b>
D.	Category D – ‘Combination Cases’ —	<b>96</b>
IV.	Summary —	<b>96</b>

Luboš Tichý and Jiří Hrádek

## **Causal Uncertainty and Proportional Liability in the Czech Republic — 99**

I.	Definition of Proportional Liability —	<b>99</b>
A.	Introduction —	<b>99</b>
B.	Legal Provisions of Substantive Law —	<b>99</b>
1.	Provisions on Multiple Tortfeasors —	<b>99</b>
2.	Causation —	<b>101</b>
3.	Provisions on Proportional Liability —	<b>104</b>
II.	Policy Consideration —	<b>105</b>
III.	Burden of Proof —	<b>106</b>
A.	Legal Provisions —	<b>106</b>
B.	Possible Changes —	<b>108</b>

- IV. Category A – Uncertain Causes of Past Harm — **110**
  - 1. Sub-category A1 – ‘Alternative Liability’ – Indeterminate Tortfeasor — **110**
  - 2. Sub-category A2 – ‘Market-share Liability’ – Causally Unrelated Tortfeasors and Victims — **111**
  - 3. Sub-category A3 – ‘Pollution or Drug Cases’ – Indeterminate Victims — **111**
  - 4. Sub-category A4 – ‘The Hard Case’ — **113**
  - 5. Sub-category A5 – The ‘Lost Chance’ Doctrine — **113**
- V. Category B – Indeterminate Parts of Harm — **114**
  - 1. Sub-category B1 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Tortious Actors — **114**
  - 2. Sub-category B2 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Non-tortious Factors — **115**
- VI. Category C – Risks of Future Harm — **116**
  - 1. Sub-category C1 – Future Harm Uncertain Entirely — **116**
  - 2. Sub-category C2 – Extent of Future Harm Uncertain — **116**

Andreas Bloch Ehlers and Vibe Ulfbeck

**Causal Uncertainty and Proportional Liability in Denmark — 117**

Ken Oliphant

**Causal Uncertainty and Proportional Liability in England and Wales — 121**

- I. Introduction — **121**
  - Meaning of ‘Proportional Liability’ — **121**
- II. Proportional Liability: The *Fairchild* Exception — **122**
  - A. Starting Points — **122**
  - B. Orthodox Approach to Alternative Causes — **123**
  - C. *Fairchild* and beyond — **124**
- III. The Categories of Proportional Liability — **128**
  - A. Alternative Liability (Unidentified Tortfeasor) — **128**
  - B. ‘Market-Share Liability’ (A Closed Set of Tortfeasors and Victims) — **128**
  - C. Pollution and Drug Cases (Unidentified Victim) — **129**
  - D. Increased Risk — **130**
  - E. The ‘Lost Chance’ Doctrine — **131**
  - F. Certain Causation – Uncertain Extent (Only Tortious Causes) — **134**
  - G. Certain Causation – Uncertain Extent (Tortious and Non-Tortious Causes) — **135**
  - H. Causal Uncertainty as to Future Harm — **136**
- IV. Concluding Remarks — **139**

Olivier Moréteau

**Causal Uncertainty and Proportional Liability in France — 141**

- I. Introduction — **141**
- II. Burden and Standard of Proof — **141**
- III. Category A – Uncertain Causes of Past Harm — **143**
  - 1. Sub-Category A4 – A5: The ‘Hard Case’ and Lost Chances — **143**
  - 2. Sub-category A1 – ‘Alternative Liability’ – Indeterminate Tortfeasor — **144**
  - 3. Sub-category A3 – ‘Pollution or Drug Cases’ – Indeterminate Victims — **147**
  - 4. Sub-category A2 – ‘Market-share Liability’ – Causally Unrelated Tortfeasors and Victims — **147**
- IV. Category B – Indeterminate Parts of Harm — **148**
- V. Category C – Risks of Future Harm — **150**
  - 1. Sub-category C1 – Future Harm Uncertain Entirely — **151**
  - 2. Sub-category C2 – Extent of Future Harm Uncertain — **151**

Ulrich Magnus

**Causal Uncertainty and Proportional Liability in Germany — 153**

- I. Definition of Proportional Liability — **153**
- II. Categories of Proportional Liability — **155**
- III. Policy Considerations — **155**
  - 1. Deterrence — **156**
  - 2. Justice/Fairness — **157**
  - 3. Reduction of Administrative Costs — **158**
  - 4. Further Policy Considerations — **158**
- IV. Burden of Proof — **158**
  - 1. In General — **158**
  - 2. Standard of Proof — **159**
- V. Category A – Uncertain Causes of Past Harm — **160**
  - 1. Sub-category A1 – ‘Alternative Liability’ – Indeterminate Tortfeasor — **160**
  - 2. Sub-category A2 – ‘Market-share Liability’ – Causally Unrelated Tortfeasors and Victims — **161**
  - 3. Sub-category A3 – ‘Pollution or Drug Cases’ – Indeterminate Victims — **162**
  - 4. Sub-category A4 – ‘The Hard Case’ — **162**
  - 5. Sub-category A5 – The ‘Lost Chance’ Doctrine — **163**

VI. Category B – Indeterminate Parts of Harm —	163
1. Sub-category B1 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Tortious Actors —	163
2. Sub-category B2 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Non-tortious Factors —	164
VII. Category C – Risks of Future Harm —	164
1. Sub-category C1 – Future Harm Uncertain Entirely —	164
2. Sub-category C2 – Extent of Future Harm Uncertain —	164
VIII. Category D – ‘Combination Cases’ —	165
IX. Conclusions —	165
1. In General —	165
2. The Relevant Factual Effects of Proportional Liability —	165
(a) Gainers and Losers —	165
(b) Effect on Incentives —	166
(c) Number of Suits —	167
(d) Costs of Suits —	167
(e) Informational Difficulties —	168
(f) Distribution of Probabilities —	168
(g) Degree of Fault —	168
(h) Degree of Uncertainty —	168
3. Policy Considerations —	168
Eugenia Dacoronía	
<b>Causal Uncertainty and Proportional Liability in Greece —</b>	<b>171</b>
I. Introduction —	171
General Definition —	171
II. Policy Considerations —	173
III. Burden and Standard of Proof —	173
IV. Category A – Uncertain Causes of Past Harm —	174
1. Sub-category A1 – ‘Alternative Liability’ – Indeterminate Tortfeasor —	174
2. Sub-category A2 – ‘Market-share Liability’ – Causally Unrelated Tortfeasors and Victims —	175
3. Sub-category A3 – ‘Pollution or Drug Cases’ – Indeterminate Victims —	176
4. Sub-category A4 – ‘The Hard Case’ —	177
5. Sub-category A5 – The ‘Lost Chance’ Doctrine —	178

- V. Category B – Indeterminate Parts of Harm — 179**
  - 1. Sub-category B1 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Tortious Actors — **179**
  - 2. Sub-category B2 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Non-tortious Factors — **179**
- VI. Category C – Risks of Future Harm — 180**
  - 1. Sub-category C1 – Future Harm Uncertain Entirely — **180**
  - 2. Sub-category C2 – Extent of Future Harm Uncertain — **181**

Boaz Shnoor and Israel Gilead

**Causal Uncertainty and Proportional Liability in Israel — 183**

- I. Introduction — 183**
- II. The *Malul* Case — 183**
- III. Burden and Standard of Proof — 185**
- IV. Categorisation — 186**
- V. Policy Considerations — 187**
- VI. Category A – Uncertain Causes of Past Harm — 188**
  - 1. Sub-category A1 – ‘Alternative Liability’ – Indeterminate Tortfeasor — **188**
  - 2. Sub-category A2 – ‘Market-share Liability’ – Causally Unrelated Tortfeasors and Victims — **189**
  - 3. Sub-category A3 – ‘Pollution or Drug Cases’ – Indeterminate Victims — **190**
  - 4. Sub-Categories A4 and A5 – ‘Hard Cases’ and ‘Lost Chances’ — **191**
    - Sub-category A5 – The ‘Lost Chance’ Doctrine — **192**
    - Sub-category A4 – ‘The Hard Case’ — **193**
- VII. Category B – Indeterminate Parts of Harm — 194**
  - 1. Sub-category B1 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Tortious Actors — **194**
  - 2. Sub-category B2 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Non-tortious Factors — **195**
- VIII. Category C – Risks of Future Harm — 196**
- IX. Concluding Remarks — 197**



Giovanni Comandé and Luca Nocco

**Proportional Liability in Uncertain Settings: Is it Precautionary? Italian Insights and Comparative Policy Considerations — 199**

- I. In Search of a Definition for Proportional Liability — 199
  - A. Introduction — 199
  - B. The Standard of Proof — 201
  - C. Reasons to Introduce a Rule of Proportional Liability and Policy Related Implications — 203
- II. In Search of Instances for Proportional Liability — 206
  - A. The First Category of Proportional Liability (and Tools Aiming to Achieve Similar Objectives): Uncertainty Regarding the Link Between Defendant's Conduct and Harm. — 206
    1. Sub-category A1 – 'Alternative Liability' – Indeterminate Tortfeasor — 206
    2. Sub-category A2 – 'Market-share Liability' – Causally Unrelated Tortfeasors and Victims — 211
    3. Sub-category A3 – 'Pollution or Drug Cases' – Indeterminate Victims — 212
    4. Sub-category A4 – 'The Hard Case' — 212
    5. Sub-category A5 – The 'Lost Chance' Doctrine — 213
  - B. Some Insights on Proportional Liability and Uncertainty — 215
  - C. The Second Category of Proportional Liability: Indeterminate Parts of Harm — 219
  - D. The Third Category of Proportional Liability: Uncertain Materialisation of Risk — 220
- III. In Search of a Reasonable Proportional Liability Rule for Uncertain Settings — 223

Anne LM Keirse

**Going Dutch: How to Address Cases of Causal Uncertainty — 227**

- I. Preface — 227
- II. An All-or-Nothing External Liability Paired with an Internal Proportional Apportionment — 228
- III. The Reversal of the Burden of Proof — 232
- IV. The Theory of the Loss of a Chance: A Step Closer towards Accepting Proportional Liability — 232
- V. Proportional Liability: No Longer an 'Internal Matter' — 235
- VI. Proportional Liability Confirmed — 240

VII. Follow-up case law — **242**

VIII. Concluding Remarks — **245**

Annex: Short answers to the cases from a Dutch perspective — **246**

Bjarte Askeland

**Causal Uncertainty and Proportional Liability in Norway — 249**

Existing Solutions to the Various Categories — **251**

Ewa Bagińska

**Causal Uncertainty and Proportional Liability in Poland — 253**

I. Introduction — **253**

II. General Remarks on Causation and Burden of Proof in Polish Law — **254**

A. Causation — **254**

B. Burden of Proof — **256**

III. The Way to the Coronation of the Rule of Joint and Several Liability in Polish Law — **259**

A. The Rise and Fall of Proportional Liability in Polish Law — **259**

B. The Main Characteristics of Joint and Several Liability — **261**

IV. Possible Application of Proportional Liability – Specific Categories — **262**

A. Category A – Uncertain Causes of Past Harm — **262**

1. Sub-category A1 – ‘Alternative Liability’ – Indeterminate Tortfeasor — **262**

2. Sub-category A2 – ‘Market-share Liability’ – Causally Unrelated Tortfeasors and Victims — **264**

3. Sub-category A3 – ‘Pollution or Drug Cases’ – Indeterminate Victims — **265**

4. Sub-category A4 – ‘The Hard Case’ — **266**

5. Sub-category A5 – The ‘Lost Chance’ Doctrine — **268**

B. Category B – Indeterminate Parts of Harm — **270**

1. Sub-category B1 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Tortious Actors — **270**

2. Sub-category B2 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Non-tortious Factors — **273**

C. Category C – Risks of Future Harm — **274**

D. Category D – Combination Cases — **276**

V. Final Observations — **278**

Johann Neethling

## **Causal Uncertainty and Proportional Liability in South Africa — 283**

- I. Category A – Uncertain Causes of Past Harm — **283**
  - A. Sub-category A1 – ‘Alternative Liability’ – Indeterminate Tortfeasor — **283**
  - B. Sub-category A2 – ‘Market-share Liability’ – Causally Unrelated Tortfeasors and Victims — **285**
  - C. Sub-category A3 – ‘Pollution or Drug Cases’ – Indeterminate Victims — **286**
  - D. Sub-category A4 – ‘The Hard Case’ — **287**
  - E. Sub-category A5 – The ‘Lost Chance’ Doctrine — **288**
- II. Category B – Indeterminate Parts of Harm — **289**
  - A. Sub-category B1 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Tortious Actors — **289**
  - B. Sub-category B2 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Non-tortious Factors — **290**
- III. Category C – Risks of Future Harm — **292**
  - A. Sub-category C1 – Future Harm Uncertain Entirely — **292**
  - B. Sub-category C2 – Extent of Future Harm Uncertain — **292**

Miquel Martín-Casals and Josep Solé

## **Causal Uncertainty and Proportional Liability in Spain — 295**

- I. Introduction — **295**
  - A. The proof of causation under Spanish Law — **295**
  - B. Procedural means to overcome uncertainty — **296**
  - C. The notion of ‘proportional liability’ in current Spanish law — **297**
  - D. Policy considerations in the Spanish debate — **299**
- II. Categories of proportional liability — **300**
  - A. Uncertainty about past harm — **300**
    1. Indeterminate tortfeasors (‘alternative liability’) — **300**
    2. Causally unrelated tortfeasors and victims (‘market-share liability’) — **304**
    3. Indeterminate Victim (‘Pollution or Drug Cases’) — **306**
    4. The ‘Hard Case’ category — **306**
    5. The ‘Loss of Chance’ Doctrine — **309**
  - B. Indeterminate Parts of Harm — **312**
    1. All the parts of the harm were caused by a group of tortious defendants — **312**
    2. Part of the harm caused by contributory negligence of the victim or by a non-tortious factor — **314**

- C. Unrealised risks of future harm — **315**
- D. Combination cases — **317**
- III. Final remarks — **318**

Pierre Widmer and Bénédict Winiger

**Causal Uncertainty and Proportional Liability in Switzerland — 323**

- I. Definition of Proportional Liability — **323**
- II. Categories of Proportional Liability — **325**
- III. Policy Considerations — **326**
- IV. Burden and Standard of Proof — **328**
- V. Category A – Uncertain Causes of Past Harm — **330**
  - 1. Sub-category A1 – ‘Alternative Liability’ – Indeterminate Tortfeasor — **330**
  - 2. Sub-category A2 – ‘Market-share Liability’ – Causally Unrelated Tortfeasors and Victims — **331**
  - 3. Sub-category A3 – ‘Pollution or Drug Cases’ – Indeterminate Victims — **332**
  - 4. Sub-category A4 – ‘The Hard Case’ — **333**
  - 5. Sub-category A5 – The ‘Lost Chance’ Doctrine — **333**
- VI. Category B – Indeterminate Parts of Harm — **336**
  - 1. Sub-category B1 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Tortious Actors — **336**
  - 2. Sub-category B2 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Non-tortious Factors — **337**
- VII. Category C – Risks of Future Harm — **337**
  - 1. Sub-category C1 – Future Harm Uncertain Entirely — **337**
  - 2. Sub-category C2 – Extent of Future Harm Uncertain — **338**
- VIII. Category D – Combination Cases — **339**
- IX. Conclusions — **340**

Michael D Green

**Causal Uncertainty and Proportional Liability in the US — 343**

- I. Burden and Standard of Proof — **343**
- II. The Meaning of Proportional Liability — **343**
- III. Scholarly Treatment of Proportional Liability in the US — **344**
- IV. Policy Considerations — **351**
- V. The Categories of Proportional Liability — **353**

- A. Category A – Uncertain Causes of Past Harm — **353**
  - 1. Introduction — **353**
  - 2. Sub-category A1 – ‘Alternative Liability’ – Indeterminate Tortfeasor — **356**
  - 3. Sub-category A2 – ‘Market-share Liability’ – Causally Unrelated Tortfeasors and Victims — **357**
  - 4. Sub-category A3 – ‘Pollution or Drug Cases’ – Indeterminate Victims — **357**
  - 5. Sub-category A4 – ‘The Hard Case’ — **360**
  - 6. Sub-category A5 – The ‘Lost Chance’ Doctrine — **362**
- B. Category B – Indeterminate Parts of Harm — **365**
  - 1. Sub-category B1 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Tortious Actors — **365**
  - 2. Sub-category B2 – Indeterminate Parts of Harm Caused by Non-tortious Factors — **367**
- C. Category C – Risks of Future Harm — **368**
  - 1. Sub-category C1 – Future Harm Uncertain Entirely — **368**
  - 2. Sub-category C2 – Extent of Future Harm Uncertain — **369**

**List of Contributors — 371**

**Index — 373**