

Contents

Part I Overview

1 Present and Future Perspectives for Medical Malpractice, Responsibility, and Liability	3
S. Davide Ferrara, Guido Viel and Rafael Boscolo-Berto	
References	9

Part II Historical Background

2 Historical Overview of Medical Liability	13
Maurizio Rippa Bonati and Fabio Zampieri	
2.1 Introduction	14
2.2 Cases.	17
2.2.1 Case I. The Doctor–Patient Relationship Between “Ethics” and “Cunning”: Gabriele Zerbi.	17
2.2.2 Case II. Melchiorre Guilandino and the Strange Cure.	25
2.2.3 Case III. A Healthcare Commission and Reason of State: Even Luminaries Make Mistakes	29
2.2.4 Case IV. The Cynical Doctor: Alessandro Knips Macoppe.	37
2.3 Conclusion.	46
References	47
3 Praxis et Mala-Praxis Medica	51
Ivone Cacciavillani	
3.1 Introduction	52
3.2 Primary Sources	53
3.2.1 Law and Norms	53

3.3	Secondary Sources	54
3.3.1	Consuetudo (Customs)	55
3.3.2	Behavioral Codes	55
3.3.3	Practice	56
3.4	The Medical Profession	57
3.4.1	The Professional Work Contract	57
3.4.2	The Therapeutic Protocol	57
3.4.3	The Work Contract and Employment Relationship	58
3.5	Medical Practice	59
3.5.1	The Structural Practice	60
3.5.2	The Professional Practice (Publicity)	61
3.6	Function of Healthcare Practices	62
3.6.1	Worker's Exemption	62
3.6.2	The User's Trust	62
3.7	Bad Healthcare, Bad Practice, and Insurance Coverage	63
3.7.1	In Private Healthcare	63
3.7.2	In Public Health	64
3.7.3	Bad Healthcare and Bad Practice	64
3.7.4	Lack of Responsibility of Insurance Companies	65
	References	66

Part III Legislative and Juridical Background

4	European Legislative and Juridical Overview	69
	Paola Frati and Matteo Gulino	
4.1	Introduction	70
4.2	Medical Liability in Western Europe Between Civil Law and Common Law	72
4.2.1	Fault	74
4.2.2	Contractual and Extra-Contractual Responsibility	74
4.2.3	Standard of Care	76
4.2.4	Burden of Proof	77
4.3	The Key Role of Mediation in Medical Responsibility	78
4.3.1	Court Systems	79
4.3.2	Administrative Systems	79
4.4	Scandinavian Countries: Models	80
4.5	The French Experience and the "Loi Kouchner": <i>The Aléa Thérapeutique</i>	82
4.6	The English Experience of the NHS Authority Litigation and the Key Role of Mediation	86

4.7	Medical Responsibility in Eastern Europe: Bulgaria, Czech Republic, Slovakia, Russia, and Lithuania	87
4.8	Conclusion	88
	References	91
5	Causal Value and Causal Link	93
	S. Davide Ferrara	
5.1	Principles of Truth and Cause	94
5.2	Juridical Construction, Evidence, and Medicine	97
5.3	“Conditio Sine Qua Non” and Scientific Laws.	99
5.4	From the Theory to the Practice of Specific Causality.	101
	References	106
 Part IV Major European Countries and/or Areas		
6	Medical Responsibility and Liability in German-Speaking Countries: Austria, Germany, and Switzerland	111
	Thomas Bajanowski, Walter Rabl and Tony Fracasso	
6.1	Judicial and Normative Overview	112
6.2	Judicial and Extra-Judicial Institutions and Operative Roles	113
6.3	Ascertainment Methodology.	115
	6.3.1 Living	115
	6.3.2 Fatalities	116
6.4	Evaluation Criteria	119
	6.4.1 Identification of any Injury, Dysfunction, Invalidity, or Cause of Death	120
	6.4.2 Analysis of Medical Treatment.	121
	6.4.3 Relationship Between Injury/Death and Medical Malpractice	124
6.5	Future Perspectives	125
	References	126
7	Medical Responsibility and Liability in the United Kingdom	129
	Peter Vanezis	
7.1	Overview	130
	7.1.1 The Medical Acts and the General Medical Council	130
	7.1.2 The Common Law System.	131
	7.1.3 Type of Enquiries	131
	7.1.4 Recent Trends in the Number of Claims Made	132
7.2	Judicial and Extra-Judicial Institutions and Operative Roles	132

7.2.1	Doctors and Others Undertaking Assessment of Alleged Medical Negligence Cases	134
7.2.2	The Judicial System Procedures	135
7.2.3	No-Fault Compensation	136
7.2.4	Civil Procedure Rules 1998	137
7.3	Ascertainment Methodology	137
7.3.1	Living and Deceased Persons	137
7.4	Evaluation Methodology	138
7.4.1	Standard of Care, Causation and the Development of Clinical Guidelines	138
7.4.2	Causation	139
7.5	The Future	142
	References	142
8	Medical Responsibility and Liability in France	145
	Eric Baccino	
8.1	Introduction	146
8.2	Epidemiological Data	146
8.3	Juridical Procedures	147
8.3.1	Penal Jurisdiction	147
8.3.2	Civil Jurisdictions	148
8.3.3	Administrative Jurisdictions	150
8.4	Non-Juridical Procedures Intervening in Medical Responsibility	151
8.4.1	Council of the Order of Medical Doctors	151
8.4.2	Commission Régionale de Conciliation et D'Indemnisation des Accidents Medicaux	152
8.5	Nomination of Experts	154
8.6	Expertise Regarding Medical Responsibility	155
8.6.1	Premise	155
8.6.2	Phases of Expert Examination	156
8.6.3	Access to Medical Documentation	157
8.7	How is Medical Error Evaluated?	158
8.8	Conclusions and Prospects	159
	References Suggested by the Editors	160
9	Medical Responsibility and Liability in Spain	161
	María Castellano Arroyo and Ricardo de Ángel Yáguez	
9.1	Judicial and Normative Overview and Judicial and Extra-Judicial Institutions and Operative Roles	162
9.1.1	Introductory Note on the Terminology	162
9.1.2	The Complex Regime of Healthcare Liability in Spain	163

9.1.3	Mala Praxis is Attributed to a Doctor or Other Healthcare Professional Acting as “Free Professionals”	163
9.1.4	Mala Praxis is Attributed to a Doctor, or Other Healthcare Professional, Who Acts in a Private Healthcare Institution	164
9.1.5	The Defendant is a Healthcare Centre	165
9.1.6	Events Occurring in the Framework of Healthcare Provided by a Public Authority	165
9.1.7	Out-of-Court Settlement of the Claims.	166
9.1.8	General Considerations	166
9.1.9	Criminal Medical Liability	169
9.1.10	Statistical Data	171
9.2	Ascertainment Methodology	173
9.2.1	Cases Calling for Expert Ascertainment in Professional Liability	173
9.2.2	Ascertainment Methodology	176
9.3	Evaluation Criteriology	184
9.3.1	Evaluation Criteria in Living Patients	184
9.3.2	Evaluation Criteria in Cadavers	185
9.3.3	Evaluation of the Sequelae	186
9.4	Future Perspectives	186
	References	187
10	Medical Responsibility and Liability in Portugal	189
	Vera Lúcia Raposo and Duarte Nuno Vieira	
10.1	Introduction	190
10.2	Epidemiological Data	190
10.3	Judicial and Normative Overview	191
10.3.1	Civil Medical Responsibility	193
10.3.2	Criminal Medical Responsibility	198
10.3.3	Judicial and Extra Judicial Institutions and Operative Roles	200
10.4	Ascertainment Methodology	201
10.5	The Medico-Legal Council	205
10.6	Conclusions	206
	References	206
11	Medical Responsibility and Liability in Italy	209
	Pietrantonio Ricci, Francesco Ausania and Paolo Arbarello	
11.1	Introduction	210
11.1.1	The Physician’s Responsibility as “Contractual Liability”	210

11.1.2	Liability for Healthcare Defects Outside the Professional Activity of a Doctor or Other Health Professional.	210
11.2	Epidemiological Data	211
11.2.1	Increase in Professional Liability Cases in Italy . . .	211
11.2.2	Mistake in the Diagnostic, Prognostic or Therapeutic Phases and Percentage of Mistakes According to the “Court of the Patient” and Data GISDI.	212
11.3	Normative and Judicial Overview	213
11.3.1	Criminal Medical Responsibility.	213
11.3.2	Civil Medical Responsibility	215
11.4	<i>Nomofilattica</i> and Professional Medical Liability	217
11.5	Methods of Ascertainment and Evaluation Criteria	219
11.6	Future Perspectives	225
	References	226
12	Medical Responsibility and Liability in Lithuania, Latvia and Estonia	227
	Alvydas Pauliukevičius, Marija Caplinskienė, Romas Raudys, Ojars Teteris, Grigorijs Vabel and Marika Väli	
12.1	Medical Responsibility and Liability in Lithuania.	229
12.1.1	Judicial and Normative Overview	229
12.1.2	Judicial and Extra-Judicial Institutions and Operative Roles	229
12.1.3	Ascertainment Methodology	230
12.1.4	Evaluation Criteria	231
12.1.5	Future Perspectives	232
12.2	Medical Responsibility and Liability in Latvia	233
12.2.1	Legislation Governing the Medical Practitioner’s Liability	233
12.2.2	Extra-Legal Activity in Latvia	235
12.2.3	Ascertainment Methodology	237
12.2.4	Evaluation Criteria	237
12.2.5	Future Perspectives	238
12.3	Medical Responsibility and Liability in Estonia	239
12.3.1	Judicial and Normative Overview	239
12.3.2	Judicial and Extra-Judicial Institutions and Operative Roles	240
12.3.3	Ascertainment Methodology	241
12.3.4	Evaluation Criteria	242
12.3.5	Future Perspectives	242
	References	243

Part V Consensus Document: European Guidelines

13 Medico-Legal Methods of Ascertainment and Criteria of Evaluation in Medical Responsibility and Liability 247

S. Davide Ferrara, Eric Baccino, Thomas Bajanowski,
Rafael Boscolo-Berto, Maria Castellano Arroyo,
Ricardo De Angel Yagüez, Alvydas Pauliukevičius,
Pietrantonio Ricci, Peter Vanezis,
Duarte Nuno Vieira, Guido Viel and Enrique Villanueva

13.1 Itemisation of Guidelines 251

13.2 Expert Definition and Essential Expertise 252

13.3 Methods of Ascertainment on Living Persons. 252

13.3.1 Step 1: Collection and Examination of Clinical and Documentary Data 253

13.3.2 Step 2: Consultation with Specialist 256

13.3.3 Step 3: Clinical Examination 257

13.3.4 Step 4: Further Instrumental Diagnostic Exams. 257

13.3.5 Step 5: Clinical Synthesis. 258

13.4 Methods of Ascertainment on Cadavers. 258

13.4.1 Step 1: Collection and Examination of Clinical and Documentary Data 258

13.4.2 Step 2: Consultation with Specialist 259

13.4.3 Step 3: Pre-Autopsy Examinations 259

13.4.4 Step 4: Autopsy 259

13.4.5 Step 5: Choice and Execution of Further Diagnostic Procedures 262

13.5 Evaluation Criteria 262

13.5.1 Step 1: Comparative Evaluation of Data 262

13.5.2 Step 2: Identification of Pathological Features 263

13.5.3 Step 3: Damage Identification. 263

13.5.4 Step 4: Reconstruction of Physiopathological Pathways and Ideal Medical Conduct 263

13.5.5 Step 5: Reconstruction of the Real Medical Conduct. 264

13.5.6 Step 6: Reconstruction and Verification of Real Conduct of Medical and Healthcare Personnel 264

13.5.7 Step 7: Identification of Error/Non-Observance. 266

13.5.8 Step 8: Classification of Error/Non-Observance 267

13.5.9 Step 9: Error Evaluation—Ex-Ante: Possible Causes of Justification 267

13.5.10 Step 10: Causal Value and Causal Link Between Error and Event 268

13.5.11 Step 11: Universal Law, Statistical Law or Criterion of Rational Credibility 268

13.5.12 Step 12: Identification of the Degree of Probability of Causal Value and Causal Link 268

13.5.13 Step 13: Damage Estimation 269

13.6 Conclusions 270

Appendixes: Flow Charts 271

References 275

Part VI Final Statements

14 Requirements and Final Recommendations 279

S. Davide Ferrara, Rafael Boscolo-Berto and Guido Viel

14.1 Recommendation 1: Essential Expertise and Competence of the Medico-Legal Expert 280

14.2 Recommendation 2: Essential Expertise and Competence of the Consultant 280

14.3 Recommendation 3: Collection and Examination of Clinical Data 281

14.4 Recommendation 4: Clinical Examination of the Living 281

14.5 Recommendation 5: Instrumental Diagnostic Exams in the Living 282

14.6 Recommendation 6: Ascertainment on Cadavers. 282

14.7 Recommendation 7: Identification of Pathological Features. 282

14.8 Recommendation 8: Reconstruction of the Ideal Medical Conduct 283

14.9 Recommendation 9: Reconstruction of the Medical Conduct. 283

14.10 Recommendation 10: Identification and Classification of Error/Non-Observance 284

14.11 Recommendation 11: Evaluation of the Error/Non-Observance 284

14.12 Recommendation 12: Evaluation of the Causal Value of the Error 284

14.13 Recommendation 13: Damage Estimation 285

Part VII Iconography

**15 Historical Iconography from the “Vincenzo Pinali”
Antique Medical Library 289**
S. Davide Ferrara, Guido Viel and Rafael Boscolo-Berto

Glossary 351

Index 359