

CONTENTS

| | |
|--|----|
| <i>Preface</i> | ix |
| <i>Acknowledgements</i> | xi |
| Introduction | 1 |
| I. Common Professional Standards for Defence Lawyers before the ICC | 1 |
| II. Concepts of Professional Conduct, Professional Responsibility and Professional Ethics | 2 |
| III. The Various Types of Enforcement Mechanisms in Counsel Regulation | 4 |
| Chapter 1 The UN International Criminal Tribunals: ICTY, ICTR and SCSL | 6 |
| I. The UN Tribunals: Criminal Justice Steps onto the International Arena Again | 6 |
| A. The General Context of the UN Tribunals | 7 |
| B. The Defence before the UN Tribunals | 9 |
| II. Misconduct before the International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia | 11 |
| A. The Legal Sources of the ICTY on Counsel Misconduct | 11 |
| B. The ICTY's Practice | 14 |
| i. Disciplinary Proceedings | 14 |
| ii. Contempt of the Tribunal | 16 |
| iii. Other Decisions by the Chambers | 25 |
| iv. The Registrar | 26 |
| v. The Association of Defence Counsel Practising before the ICTY | 27 |
| C. The Assessment of the ICTY's Regime in Scholarship | 28 |
| i. Critique of Contempt in Particular | 28 |
| ii. Comments on the Code of Conduct and the other Aspects of the Disciplinary Regime | 32 |
| D. Analysis of the ICTY Regime | 33 |
| III. Misconduct before the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda | 37 |
| A. The Legal Sources of the ICTR on Counsel Misconduct | 37 |
| B. The ICTR's Practice | 38 |
| i. Disciplinary Proceedings | 38 |
| ii. Contempt of the Tribunal | 39 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| iii. Other Decisions by the Chambers | 40 |
| iv. The Registrar | 42 |
| v. The Defence Lawyers' Association at the ICTR | 43 |
| C. Assessment of the ICTR's Regime in Scholarship | 44 |
| D. Analysis of the ICTR Regime | 44 |
| IV. Misconduct before the Special Court For Sierra Leone | 46 |
| A. The Legal Sources of the SCSL on Counsel | 46 |
| B. The SCSL's Practice | 46 |
| i. Disciplinary Proceedings | 46 |
| ii. Contempt of the Special Court | 47 |
| iii. Other Measures by the Chambers | 47 |
| iv. Appointment and Withdrawal of Counsel | 48 |
| C. Analysis of the SCSL Regime | 48 |
| V. Conclusion on the UN Tribunals: Lessons to Learn | 49 |
| Chapter 2 The National Models: Germany and the United States | 51 |
| I. The Two National Models: Commonalities and Differences | 51 |
| A. Criminal Defence in Germany | 52 |
| B. The German Approach to the Regulation of Counsel | 54 |
| C. Criminal Defence in the United States | 55 |
| D. The US Approach to the Regulation of Counsel | 56 |
| II. Legal Responses to Misconduct: Germany | 59 |
| A. The General Layout of the German System | 59 |
| B. Specific Measures against Counsel Misconduct | 61 |
| i. Professional Discipline | 61 |
| ii. Criminal Law | 67 |
| iii. Other Measures as Institutional Controls | 73 |
| iv. Liability Controls as an Indirect Measure | 84 |
| v. Conclusion | 85 |
| C. The Procedure for the Various Measures | 86 |
| i. Disciplinary Procedure | 86 |
| ii. Criminal Procedure | 88 |
| iii. The Procedure for Other Measures | 88 |
| iv. Analysis of the Applicable Procedures | 92 |
| D. The Relationship of the Various Measures | 93 |
| i. Multiple Proceedings for the Same Facts | 93 |
| ii. Proceedings in Other Jurisdictions and Transnational Work | 97 |
| E. Defence Rights and their Impact on the Regulation of Counsel | 100 |
| i. Constitutional Guarantees | 100 |
| ii. Delineating the Permissible from the Impermissible | 101 |
| F. Conclusion on the German Model | 105 |
| III. Legal Responses to Misconduct: United States | 106 |
| A. The General Layout of the US System | 106 |
| B. Specific Measures Against Counsel Misconduct | 114 |

| | | |
|------|--|-----|
| i. | Professional Discipline | 114 |
| ii. | Criminal Offences | 124 |
| iii. | Other Measures as Institutional Controls | 130 |
| iv. | Liability Controls | 139 |
| v. | Conclusion | 141 |
| C. | Comparison of the Procedure for the Various Measures | 142 |
| i. | Disciplinary Procedure | 142 |
| ii. | Procedure for Criminal Offences | 145 |
| iii. | Procedure for Contempt | 147 |
| iv. | Other Procedures | 150 |
| v. | Analysis | 154 |
| D. | The Relationship of the Various Measures | 155 |
| i. | General Connections | 155 |
| ii. | Multiple Proceedings for the Same Facts within the Same Jurisdiction | 158 |
| iii. | Proceedings in Separate Jurisdictions | 162 |
| E. | Defence Rights and their Impact on the Regulation of Counsel | 163 |
| i. | Chilling Effect and Zealous Advocacy | 163 |
| ii. | The Engrained Tension | 165 |
| F. | Conclusion on the US Model | 166 |
| IV. | A Comparative Assessment | 166 |
| | Chapter 3 The International Criminal Court's System | 170 |
| I. | The General Layout of the ICC System of the Regulation of Counsel | 170 |
| A. | Introduction to the ICC's Legal Instruments in General | 170 |
| B. | The Bases for Disciplining Counsel in Particular | 173 |
| i. | The Statute and the Rules of Procedure and Evidence | 173 |
| ii. | The Code of Conduct for Counsel and the Rules of Procedure and Evidence of the Disciplinary Board and the Disciplinary Appeals Board | 173 |
| iii. | The Regulations of the Court and the Registry | 176 |
| II. | Specific Measures against Counsel Misconduct | 177 |
| A. | The Disciplinary System of the ICC | 177 |
| i. | An Overview of the ICC Code | 178 |
| ii. | The Nature of Professional Discipline under the ICC Code and the Burden of Proof in particular | 179 |
| iii. | The Jurisdictional Scope of the Code and other Issues of Applicability | 185 |
| iv. | The Definition of Misconduct for the Purpose of Disciplinary Proceedings | 193 |
| v. | The Disciplinary Procedure | 208 |
| vi. | Conclusion | 234 |
| B. | Criminal Offences under the ICC Statute | 237 |

| | | |
|---|---|-----|
| i. | Offences in Connection with the Administration of Justice | 237 |
| ii. | Offences on Specific Professional Duties or Pertaining to Financial Irregularities | 243 |
| iii. | Legal Consequences of Criminal Offences | 244 |
| iv. | The Procedure for Criminal Offences | 249 |
| v. | Conclusion on Criminal Offences | 251 |
| C. | Other Measures as Institutional Controls | 252 |
| i. | Institutional Controls and Inherent Powers | 252 |
| ii. | Article 71 of the Statute | 256 |
| iii. | Other Measures by Chambers | 263 |
| iv. | Registry Measures against Misconduct | 266 |
| v. | General Ethics Advice | 269 |
| D. | Liability Controls: Individual Action against Misconduct | 272 |
| E. | Self-governing Professional Bodies | 274 |
| III. | A Comparison and Analysis of the Various Measures | 274 |
| A. | The Available Measures and their Scope with regard to Counsel Misconduct | 274 |
| B. | The Differences in Procedure | 278 |
| IV. | Defence Rights and their Impact on the Regulation of Counsel | 279 |
| V. | Assessment of the ICC Regime | 283 |
| Chapter 4 The Relationships between the Different Regimes | | 286 |
| I. | The Concurrence of the ICC and National Jurisdictions | 286 |
| A. | The Multiplicity of Applicable Regimes | 286 |
| B. | The Conflict of Professional Rules in particular | 287 |
| C. | Criminal Offences | 289 |
| II. | Enforcing Professional Discipline | 291 |
| A. | The ICC Disciplinary Procedure vis-a-vis National Disciplinary Procedures | 291 |
| i. | The Nature of Article 38 Complementarity | 291 |
| ii. | The Application of Article 38 Complementarity | 295 |
| B. | International Cooperation for ICC Disciplinary Proceedings | 297 |
| C. | Reciprocal Discipline | 298 |
| III. | Criminal Proceedings | 300 |
| A. | ICC Proceedings for Offences under Article 70 of the Statute | 300 |
| B. | International Cooperation for ICC Criminal Proceedings | 302 |
| C. | National Criminal Prosecutions | 306 |
| IV. | The Relationships of Sanctions within the ICC Regime | 307 |
| A. | Concurrence Issues between the ICC's Enforcement Mechanisms | 307 |
| B. | The Relationship of Article 70 Proceedings to Article 71 | 308 |
| C. | The Relationship of Professional Discipline towards Article 70 and Article 71 Sanctions | 308 |

Contents

| | |
|---|-----|
| Conclusions on International Counsel and Misconduct | 311 |
| I. A Summary of the Study | 311 |
| II. Sanctioning Counsel and the Various Types of Enforcement Mechanisms | 313 |
| III. Misconduct and the Double Role of Counsel | 316 |
| <i>Bibliography</i> | 319 |
| <i>Index</i> | 341 |