

Inhaltsverzeichnis

List of Abbreviations	17
Introduction	21
I. Conceptual Clarifications	25
1. “ <i>Legislative ...</i> ”	25
2. “ <i>... Remedies ...</i> ”	26
3. “ <i>...before Human Rights Courts</i> ”	28
II. Methodological Clarifications	30
1. <i>Identifying Legislative Measures: the Special Case of Legislative Remedies before the ECtHR</i>	31
2. <i>Comparing the Three Regional Human Rights Courts</i>	35
III. Structure and Overview	36
Chapter 1: The Concept of Legislative Remedies	39
I. Obligations to Legislate under Human Rights Treaties	40
1. General Obligations to Legislate	41
2. Specific Obligations to Legislate	45
a) <i>Obligations to legislate in order to protect specific rights</i>	45
b) <i>Obligations to legislate in order to protect specific groups</i>	46
c) <i>Obligations to legislate in order to prevent and punish specific acts</i>	47
d) <i>Obligations to modify or repeal domestic laws</i>	49
3. Implicit Obligations to Legislate	50
4. From Obligations to Legislate to Legislative Remedies: Is There a Victims’ Right to Legislative Reforms?	52
II. The Review of Legislation by Human Rights Courts	54
1. The Competence to Request a Review of Legislation before Human Rights Courts	56
a) <i>The ‘victim requirement’ before human rights courts</i>	57
b) <i>Exceptions to the victim requirement</i>	58
i. Potential and possible victims before the ECtHR	60
ii. Self-executing laws before the IACtHR	62
	9

iii. The absence of a victim requirement before the ACtHPR	64
2. The Advisory Review of Legislation	69
3. From the Review of Legislation to Legislative Remedies	75
III. Legislative Remedies and the Constitutionalisation of Human Rights Law	77
1. Regional Human Rights Courts as International ‘Constitutional’ Courts?	80
a) Diverging constitutional elements of regional human rights courts	82
b) Individual vs. constitutional justice before human rights courts	85
2. Legislative Remedies as a Sign of Increased Constitutionalisation	88
3. The Differences between Legislative Remedies in Constitutional and International Settings	90
a) The effects on the domestic legal order	90
b) The predominantly positive nature of legislative remedies before human rights courts	92
c) The moment of the legislative process for issuing remedies	93
4. Legislative Remedies and the Sovereignty of States	94
a) The increased intrusiveness of legislative remedies	95
b) The legitimacy of legislative remedies	96
c) Legislative remedies and the efficiency of human rights courts	99
Interim Conclusion: Domestic Laws in Three Stages of Human Rights Adjudication	100
Chapter 2: Legislative Remedies and General International Adjudication	103
I. The Remedial Practice of the International Court of Justice	105
1. The Legal Basis for the ICJ’s Remedial Competence	107
2. The Precedent at the PCIJ: <i>Factory at Chorzów</i>	108
II. A Categorisation of Remedies in General International Law	109
1. Cessation	112
a) Cessation in the ICJ’s case law	113

b) Legislative reforms as cessation	115
2. Restitution	117
a) Restitution in the ICJ's case law	117
b) Legislative reforms as restitution	120
3. Compensation	121
a) Compensation in the ICJ's case law	122
b) Legislative reforms as compensation	124
4. Satisfaction	125
a) Satisfaction in the ICJ's case law	126
b) Legislative reforms as satisfaction	127
5. Guarantees of Non-Repetition	128
a) Guarantees of non-repetition in the ICJ's case law	128
b) Legislative reforms as guarantees of non-repetition	131
Interim Conclusion: The Particular Functions of Remedies in General International Adjudication as a Barrier for Legislative Measures	132
Chapter 3: The Special Nature of Remedies in International Human Rights Adjudication	137
I. A Remedial <i>Lex Specialis</i> in International Human Rights Law?	137
1. The ARSIWA <i>vis-à-vis</i> the UN Basic Principles	139
2. The Special Function of Remedies in International Human Rights Adjudication	143
3. The Regulation of the Human Rights Courts' Remedial Competence	146
a) The ECHR's limited remedial provision	147
b) The ACHR's expansive remedial provision	150
c) The ACHPR's concise yet wide remedial provision	152
4. The Specialty of Remedies According to Human Rights Courts	153
Interim Conclusion: The Progressive Specialisation of Remedies before Human Rights Courts	155
II. The Remedial Practice of Human Rights Courts	155
1. The Evolution of the Human Rights Courts' Remedial Practice	156
a) The evolution of the ECtHR's remedial practice	157
b) The evolution of the IACtHR's remedial practice	162

c) The evolution of the ACtHPR's remedial practice	165
2. The Current Remedial Landscape before Human Rights Courts	166
a) The remedial landscape before the European Court of Human Rights	167
b) The remedial landscape before the Inter-American Court of Human Rights	169
c) The remedial landscape before the African Court of Human and Peoples' Rights	170
3. A Classification of Remedies before Human Rights Courts	171
a) Restitution	172
b) Compensation	175
c) Satisfaction	176
d) Rehabilitation	178
e) Guarantees of Non-Repetition	178
III. Legislative Remedies in the Case Law of Human Rights Courts	180
1. The Special Case of Legislative Remedies before the ECtHR	183
2. Human Rights Courts: Positive or Negative Legislators?	190
3. Legislative Remedies as Guarantees of Non-Repetition?	192
Interim Conclusion: The Self-Understanding of International Courts in Light of their Remedial Practice	195
Chapter 4: A Categorisation of Legislative Remedies	199
I. Common Categories of Legislative Remedies	200
1. The Protection of Vulnerable Groups	201
a) Indigenous communities	205
b) Children	206
c) Prisoners	208
d) Women	211
e) Persons with disabilities	213
2. The Right to a Fair Trial	214
a) The right to an independent and impartial tribunal established by law	215
i) The independence of judges and prosecutors	216
ii) Restrictions to the military jurisdiction	218
b) The right to be judged within a reasonable time	220
c) The right to appeal before a higher court	222

d) The enforcement of domestic judgments	224
e) Other due process rights	226
3. Property Rights	227
a) Property rights in the context of transitions to democracy	229
b) Property rights in the context of state succession	231
c) Property rights in post-conflict situations	233
d) Property rights of indigenous communities	234
4. Electoral Rights	235
a) The incompatibility of electoral laws before the ACtHPR	236
b) Prisoners' voting rights before the ECtHR	238
c) Political participation and the rights of elected officials before the IACtHR	239
5. Nationality Rights	240
a) Statelessness in the context of state succession	241
b) Deprivation of citizenship in the context of migration	242
6. Freedom of Expression	243
a) The offences of libel, slander and defamation	244
b) The regulation of public access to information	245
c) Other freedom of expression-related issues	246
7. Amnesty Laws	247
8. Mandatory Death Penalty	251
9. Constitutional Issues	253
10. Codification of Criminal Offences	256
11. Others	257
II. Different Intensities in the Use of Legislative Remedies	258
Interim Conclusion: A Common Understanding with Different Priorities	262
Chapter 5: Remedial Deference and Domestic Legislatures	265
I. Deference and Human Rights Remedies	266
1. An Increased Remedial Deference for Legislators	268
a) Judicial review of legislation and parliamentary sovereignty	269
b) The additional complexity of the international judicial review of legislation	272
2. Deference and Democratic Conditions	273
3. A 'Margin of Deliberation'	276

II. The Human Rights Courts' Deference Mechanisms <i>vis-a-vis</i> the Legislatures	278
1. The ECtHR's Margin of Appreciation Doctrine <i>vis-à-vis</i> the Legislature	279
2. The IACtHR's Conventionality Control Doctrine <i>vis-à-vis</i> the Legislature	282
III. The Specificity of Legislative Remedies	285
1. The Varying Nature of Legislative Measures	288
a) Negative legislative remedies and the specification of a provision	288
b) Positive legislative remedies and the specification of an outcome	290
c) Neutral legislative remedies and the attached discretion	292
2. The Human Rights Courts' Approaches to Remedial Specificity	294
a) The European approach: prescribing the introduction of a domestic remedy	295
b) The Inter-American approach: referrals to the reasoning	298
c) The African approach: prioritising legislative incompatibilities	300
Interim Conclusion: A Margin of Deliberation for Legislative Remedies	302
Chapter 6: The Consequences of Legislative Remedies	305
I. Legislative Remedies and Backlash Against Human Rights Courts	306
1. Legislative Remedies and Individual Instances of Backlash	310
a) Resisting the ECtHR	310
b) Limiting access to the ACtHPR	313
c) Exiting the ACHR	318
2. Legislative Remedies and Collective Instances of Backlash	322
a) The 'Interlaken Process' in Europe	323
b) The 'Five Presidents Declaration' in the Americas	326
II. Legislative Remedies and Compliance	328
1. Empirical Studies on Compliance with Legislative Remedies	329

2. The Reasons for the Low Rates of Compliance with Legislative Remedies	334
3. Impact beyond Compliance	336
III. The Reaction of Human Rights Courts	345
1. Changes in the Use of Legislative Remedies	346
2. Lowering of Compliance Requirements	348
Interim Conclusion: System-Dependent Consequences of Legislative Remedies	350
Concluding Remarks	355
I. Main Findings	355
II. Normative Assessment	359
Bibliography	367
List of Sources	397