

Table of Contents

Abbreviations	17
Introduction	21
A. Problem statement	21
I. The importance of the oceans and of a healthy marine environment	21
II. Marine pollution as a threat to the marine environment	22
III. The development of treaties of international law relating to marine pollution (ILMP)	22
IV. The importance of compliance and of means to ensure compliance	24
V. Collective compliance mechanisms as an effective means to ensure compliance with ILMP	26
B. Present Study	28
I. Aims of the study	28
II. Current state of research	29
III. Structure and scope of the study	32
Part 1: The notion of compliance with obligations of ILMP treaties	35
A. ILMP treaties and the obligations' common characteristics	35
I. The notion and scope of ILMP	35
1. Marine pollution	35
2. Scope of ILMP	37
II. Treaties of ILMP	38
1. Part XII UNCLOS – The framework for marine environmental protection	40
2. Comprehensive regional seas conventions	42
3. Source-specific global treaties	45
a) London dumping regime	45
b) IMO Conventions	45
c) Part XI, XII UNCLOS	48
4. Other agreements	49

Table of Contents

III. The characteristics of ILMP treaty obligations	51
1. States as rule addressees	51
2. Nature of required action	52
a) Horizontal obligations	52
b) Vertical obligations – national implementation and enforcement	53
3. Multilateral interests in performance	55
B. Compliance with ILMP obligations	61
I. The general notion of compliance with international treaties	61
II. The notion of compliance with ILMP treaties	62
1. Horizontal and vertical action	62
2. Formal and substantive compliance	65
III. The different notion of effectiveness	65
C. Possible reasons for states' non-compliance in international law	66
 Part 2: Compliance mechanisms and the need for collective compliance mechanisms in ILMP	 71
A. Compliance mechanisms in international law	71
I. Decentralised nature of international law	71
II. The general notion of compliance mechanisms and the activities involved	72
1. Objective to 'ensure' compliance	72
2. Elements and activities for ensuring compliance	74
3. Typical characteristics of compliance mechanisms and its actions	75
a) Individual compliance mechanisms / collective compliance mechanisms	75
b) Routine action / ad hoc action	77
c) Confrontational action, facilitative action	78
B. Individual compliance mechanisms and their limitations for ILMP	78
I. Means of general international law	79
1. The law of state responsibility	79
a) Individual states specially affected by non-compliance	79
b) Individual states other than the specially affected state acting as agents of the community	81

Table of Contents

2. The law of treaties	82
a) Individual states specially affected by non-compliance	82
b) Individual states other than a specially affected acting as agents of the community	83
3. Inter-state dispute settlement procedures	84
a) Individual states affected by non-compliance	85
b) Individual states other than a specially affected acting as agents of the community – ‘actio popularis’	85
II. Assessment of individual compliance mechanisms of international law with respect to ILMP	87
C. Collective compliance mechanisms in international environmental law	93
I. The development of collective compliance mechanisms	93
1. In international law in general	93
2. In international environmental law in particular	95
II. Typical collective compliance mechanisms in MEAs and their elements	96
1. Routine reporting procedures and ad hoc non-compliance procedures	96
2. Legal basis	101
a) Explicit and specific competence assignments to treaty bodies	101
(1) Provisions for routine reporting procedures	102
(2) Enabling clauses for ad hoc NCPs	103
b) General competence assignments to treaty bodies	105
(1) Competence to ‘review the implementation of a treaty’	105
(2) Sufficient legal basis?	106
c) Competent treaty bodies	110
(1) Plenary treaty bodies	110
(2) Secretariats	111
(3) Subsidiary “compliance bodies”	111
3. Initiation	113
a) Routine reporting procedures	113
b) Ad hoc NCPs	113
4. Gathering of information	115
a) Routine reporting obligations	115

Table of Contents

b) Further sources of information and ad hoc means for verification	118
(1) Information gathered by monitoring	119
(2) Information requested by treaty bodies	120
(3) Information submitted by other state parties and other entities	121
5. Assessment and outcome	123
a) Routine reporting procedures	123
b) Ad hoc NCPs	126
6. Reactions to cases of non-compliance and follow up measures	130
a) Routine reporting procedures	130
b) Ad hoc NCPs	131
III. Evaluation of collective compliance mechanisms of MEAs	134
1. Role of routine reporting procedures for ensuring compliance with MEAs and challenges faced	134
2. Role of ad hoc NCPs for ensuring compliance with MEAs and recent developments	136
D. The suitability and advantages of collective compliance mechanisms in ILMP	138
 Part 3: Collective compliance mechanisms in ILMP - the current landscape	 141
A. Part XII UNCLOS	141
I. Part XII UNCLOS and its obligations	141
1. General principles	142
a) Substantive obligations	142
b) Procedural obligations	143
2. Allocation of prescriptive and enforcement jurisdiction	144
a) Prescriptive implementation measures	144
(1) International level	145
(2) National level	146
b) National enforcement measures	149
3. Summary of the obligations of Part XII UNCLOS	149
II. Collective compliance mechanisms?	151
1. Legal basis - Competence assignments and competent bodies	151
a) Explicit and specific competence assignments?	151

Table of Contents

b) General competence assignments	152
(1) Art 319 (2) UNCLOS	152
(a) Interpretation of 319 (2) UNCLOS	153
(b) Practice of SG UN and SPLOS	157
(2) Practice of the General Assembly	159
2. Summary and evaluation	163
B. Part XI UNCLOS	164
I. Part XI UNCLOS and its obligations	164
1. Background: Common heritage of mankind, ISA's structure and regulatory role	164
2. Obligations of contractors	167
3. Obligations of sponsoring states	168
II. Collective compliance mechanisms	169
1. Ensuring compliance of contractors	170
a) Legal basis - Competence assignments for ensuring compliance with contractors' obligations	170
b) Initiation	171
c) Gathering of Information	171
d) Assessment and outcome	173
e) Reaction to cases of non-compliance	173
2. Ensuring compliance of sponsoring states	174
a) Legal basis - Competence assignments for ensuring compliance with states' obligations	174
b) General competence assignment	176
3. Summary and evaluation	177
C. Regional seas conventions	179
I. The regional seas conventions and their obligations	179
1. The regional seas conventions in general	179
2. The 'second-generation' regional seas conventions	180
a) Introduction to the Helsinki, OSPAR, and Barcelona Convention	180
b) General principles and general obligations	182
c) Annexes and protocols	183
d) Secondary rules	185
II. Collective compliance mechanisms	189
1. Regional seas conventions in general	189
a) Competence assignments for routine reporting procedures	189

Table of Contents

b) Enabling clauses for ad hoc NCPs	190
c) Summary	191
2. Second-generation regional seas conventions	192
a) Legal basis – Competence assignments	192
(1) Explicit and specific competence assignments	192
(a) Routine reporting procedures	192
(b) Explicit clauses for ad hoc NCPs	196
(2) General competence assignments to treaty bodies	197
(a) Competence to review the implementation of the convention	197
(b) Sufficient legal basis?	198
b) Competent treaty bodies	200
(1) Plenary treaty bodies	200
(2) Secretariats	201
(3) Subsidiary “compliance bodies” and other subsidiary bodies	201
(4) External organisations	203
c) Initiation	203
d) Gathering of information	204
(1) Routine reporting obligations	204
(a) Content of requested information	204
(b) Scope of requested information	205
(c) Further details on reporting	206
(2) Further sources of information and ad hoc means for verification	210
e) Assessment and outcome	211
(1) Routine reporting procedures	211
(a) Scope of assessment	211
(b) Assessment procedure	213
(2) Ad hoc NCP of Barcelona Convention	220
(a) Triggering of assessment	221
(b) Scope of assessment	222
(c) Assessment procedure	222
f) Reactions to cases of non-compliance and follow-up measures	223
3. Summary and evaluation	228

Table of Contents

D. London Protocol	230
I. The London Protocol and its obligations	230
1. Short introduction to the London Protocol	230
2. General principles and obligations	231
3. Secondary rules	232
II. Collective compliance mechanisms	233
1. Legal basis – Competence assignments and competent bodies	233
a) Explicit and specific competence assignments	233
(1) Routine reporting procedure	233
(2) Enabling clause for an ad hoc NCP	234
b) Competent treaty bodies	235
(1) MoP	235
(2) Secretariat	236
(3) Subsidiary bodies	236
2. Initiation	237
3. Gathering of information	238
a) Routine reporting obligations	238
(1) Content of requested information	238
(2) Scope of requested information	239
(3) Further details on reporting	239
(a) Substantive reports	239
(b) Implementation and effectiveness reports	240
b) Further sources of information and ad hoc means for verification	241
4. Assessment and outcome	242
a) Routine reporting procedure	242
(1) Substantive reports	242
(2) Implementation and effectiveness reports	243
b) Ad hoc NCP	243
5. Reactions to cases of non-compliance and follow-up measures	244
6. Summary and evaluation	246
E. IMO Conventions	247
I. IMO Conventions and their obligations	247
1. Background: IMO, its structure and regulatory role	247
2. The IMO Conventions of ILMP	250
3. General obligations	251

Table of Contents

4. Annexes	252
5. Secondary rules	253
II. IMO and collective compliance mechanisms	255
1. Introduction: IMO and its work to ensure state parties' compliance	255
2. Routine reporting procedures in IMO Conventions	256
a) Legal Basis - Competence assignments and competent bodies	257
(1) MARPOL	257
(2) STCW Convention	259
b) The Gathering of information	260
(1) Reporting obligations	260
(a) MARPOL	260
(b) STCW Convention	261
(2) Further sources of information and means of verification	262
c) Assessment and outcome	263
(1) MARPOL	263
(2) STCW Convention	264
d) Reactions to the Findings of the Reporting Procedure	267
(1) MARPOL	267
(2) STCW Convention	268
e) Summary and evaluation	269
3. Routine IMO member state audit scheme (IMSAS)	270
a) Background of the IMSAS	270
b) Legal basis	272
(1) Documents providing the basis for the IMSAS	272
(2) Explicit and specific competence assignments and competent bodies	274
c) Stages of the IMSAS procedure	276
d) The gathering of information	277
(1) Content and scope of gathered information	277
(2) Stages and means of gathering information	278
e) Assessment and outcome	279
(1) Assessment	279
(2) Outcome - Reports	280
f) Reactions to cases of non-compliance	282
(1) Facilitative measures	282
(2) Confrontational measures	283

Table of Contents

(3) Consolidated audit summary reports (CASRs) and analysis of CASRs	284
g) Follow-Up Measures	285
h) Summary and Evaluation	285
4. Compliance strategy of the IMO?	287
III. Coordinated port state control based on regional MoUs	287
1. Background	288
2. Regional MoUs	289
3. Collective compliance mechanism?	291
F. BBNJ Agreement	293
I. Short introduction	293
II. Collective compliance mechanisms	294
1. Legal basis – Competence assignments and competent bodies	294
2. Evaluation	295
G. The current landscape of collective compliance mechanisms in ILMP – Attainments and Needs	296
I. Attainments	296
II. Gaps and needs	298
1. Lack of collective compliance mechanism - Part XII UNCLOS	299
2. Insufficient collective compliance mechanisms	302
Part 4: Possible approaches and options to address the need for the further development of collective compliance mechanisms	305
A. The features and criteria needed for effective collective compliance mechanisms in general	305
I. Clear and precise legal bases	306
II. Competent and suitable collective bodies	308
III. Clear criteria for the setting in motion of mechanisms	311
IV. Clear criteria and standards for the gathering and ascertaining of information	312
V. Clear criteria and standards for assessment and for formulating outcomes	314
VI. Clear criteria for reactions to non-compliance and for follow-up measures	315

Table of Contents

VII. Opportunities to exchange knowledge and experiences between different compliance bodies	317
B. Specific suggestions for the further development of collective compliance mechanisms in ILMP	319
I. Making use of existing legal bases and specification of procedures	319
II. Routine audits as an alternative	320
III. Possibility for establishing confrontational reactive measures supplementing facilitative measures	320
C. The legal steps needed	321
I. In case of new treaties	321
II. In case of existing treaties	322
D. Further action at international level	324
I. Amendment of Part XII UNCLOS	324
II. Demanding call to the state community in the yearly GA Resolution on oceans and the law of the sea	327
Executive summary	329
A. The suitability of and need for collective compliance mechanisms in ILMP	329
B. Existing current landscape of collective compliance mechanisms in ILMP and the need for further action	330
C. Criteria and legal steps needed and possible action at international level	335
Literature	337