

# Table of contents

|                     |      |
|---------------------|------|
| Preface .....       | V    |
| Abbreviations ..... | XVII |
| Contributors .....  | XXI  |

## PART I POLITICAL APPROACHES

|                                                                                                                                            |   |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---|
| § 1 The European Security Union between Member State interests and necessities of European integration ( <i>Schwarzelühr-Sutter</i> )..... | 1 |
| § 2 Crime doesn't stop at the border post – European security in a multi-level system ( <i>Barley</i> ) .....                              | 5 |
| § 3 Building a strong and effective Security Union ( <i>Onidi</i> ).....                                                                   | 9 |

## PART II STRUCTURE AND PRINCIPLES

|                                                                                                                     |    |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| § 4 Governance of the European Security Union ( <i>Pilniok</i> ) .....                                              | 13 |
| A. Guaranteeing security: a joint undertaking .....                                                                 | 18 |
| B. The European Security Union: a legal and political objective.....                                                | 20 |
| C. The EU constitutional law framework for the EU's guarantee of security...                                        | 24 |
| I. EU competences for guaranteeing security .....                                                                   | 24 |
| 1. Competences for realizing the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice.                                             | 24 |
| 2. Specific security-related competences .....                                                                      | 27 |
| 3. Security-related cross-cutting competences .....                                                                 | 29 |
| 4. The external dimension of competences for internal security .....                                                | 31 |
| 5. Competences for external security .....                                                                          | 33 |
| II. Regulation of the exercise of competences in EU constitutional law ....                                         | 34 |
| 1. 'National security' as a limit to the exercise of the Union's powers...                                          | 34 |
| 2. Fundamental rights guarantees .....                                                                              | 36 |
| III. Rule-of-law requirements under primary EU legislation in relation to Member States' security authorities ..... | 38 |
| D. The EU's security architecture .....                                                                             | 39 |
| I. EU institutions .....                                                                                            | 40 |
| 1. European Council and Council of the European Union .....                                                         | 40 |
| 2. European Commission .....                                                                                        | 42 |
| a) College and Directorates-General .....                                                                           | 42 |
| b) High Representative and European External Action Service.....                                                    | 44 |
| 3. European Parliament .....                                                                                        | 45 |
| 4. Court of Justice of the European Union .....                                                                     | 45 |
| II. EU agencies in the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice .....                                                  | 47 |
| 1. Europol.....                                                                                                     | 48 |
| 2. Eurojust .....                                                                                                   | 50 |
| 3. Frontex .....                                                                                                    | 51 |
| 4. CEPOL .....                                                                                                      | 54 |

## *Table of contents*

|                                                                                          |    |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| 5. European Union Drugs Agency.....                                                      | 54 |
| 6. European Union Agency for Asylum .....                                                | 55 |
| 7. eu-LISA .....                                                                         | 56 |
| 8. European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights .....                                    | 56 |
| 9. Other agencies .....                                                                  | 57 |
| 10. Horizontal networks within the EU security architecture .....                        | 57 |
| III. Other EU bodies involved in guaranteeing security .....                             | 58 |
| 1. European Public Prosecutor's Office .....                                             | 59 |
| 2. European Defence Agency .....                                                         | 60 |
| 3. European Union Institute for Security Studies.....                                    | 60 |
| E. Modes of governance in the Security Union.....                                        | 61 |
| I. Integration by means of institutionalization, cooperation and mutual learning.....    | 61 |
| 1. Institutionalization of EU security agencies .....                                    | 61 |
| 2. Cooperation between the security authorities.....                                     | 62 |
| 3. Mutual observation and learning .....                                                 | 64 |
| II. Integration by means of harmonizing security law .....                               | 65 |
| 1. Harmonization of criminal law.....                                                    | 65 |
| 2. Harmonization of threat prevention and regulatory law .....                           | 66 |
| 3. Harmonization of security-related data protection law .....                           | 67 |
| 4. Soft law.....                                                                         | 67 |
| III. Integration by means of information systems .....                                   | 68 |
| 1. Interoperable personal data files in the composite security adminis-<br>tration ..... | 68 |
| 2. Institutionalization of other information systems.....                                | 73 |
| IV. Integration by means of financing the guarantee of security .....                    | 73 |
| 1. Funding Member States' security resources .....                                       | 74 |
| 2. Funding security research .....                                                       | 76 |
| 3. Funding security-related projects in third countries .....                            | 76 |
| F. Outlook: trends in the Security Union .....                                           | 77 |

## **PART III**

### **NATIONAL SECURITY AND SOVEREIGNTY OF MEMBER STATES**

|                                                                                                        |    |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| <b>§ 5 National security and sovereignty of Member States – an introduction</b><br><i>(Sule)</i> ..... | 79 |
| A. Overview .....                                                                                      | 79 |
| B. Common legal approach to deepening EU Security cooperation.....                                     | 80 |
| I. Central common values as a precondition .....                                                       | 80 |
| II. National and EU legal provisions on security .....                                                 | 81 |
| 1. National law .....                                                                                  | 81 |
| 2. EU law.....                                                                                         | 82 |
| C. Member States' 'red lines': competence issues arising from the term<br>'national security' .....    | 83 |
| I. Practical issues flowing from a conflict around competence.....                                     | 83 |
| II. Need to outline the scope of Art. 4(2) sent. 3 TEU.....                                            | 84 |
| 1. Definition of 'national security' .....                                                             | 84 |
| a) Formal definition of 'national security' .....                                                      | 84 |
| b) Substantive definition of 'national security' .....                                                 | 84 |
| 2. Consequences of the definition: Member States' courts' responses ....                               | 86 |
| D. Conclusion.....                                                                                     | 87 |

## Table of contents

|                                                                                                                                                                                                             |     |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| <b>§ 6 Rule-of-law provisions in primary law and Member States' security agencies (<i>Terhechte</i>)</b> .....                                                                                              | 89  |
| A. Introduction .....                                                                                                                                                                                       | 90  |
| B. The increasing importance of EU rule-of-law guarantees .....                                                                                                                                             | 91  |
| I. A Union based on the rule of law .....                                                                                                                                                                   | 91  |
| II. Formal und substantive EU rule-of-law guarantees .....                                                                                                                                                  | 92  |
| C. Rule-of-law guarantees and the Security Union.....                                                                                                                                                       | 93  |
| I. Foundations of the Security Union in primary EU law .....                                                                                                                                                | 93  |
| II. The context of freedom and security .....                                                                                                                                                               | 94  |
| III. Member States' security authorities within the system of the AFSJ .....                                                                                                                                | 95  |
| IV. Police cooperation as an example .....                                                                                                                                                                  | 95  |
| D. Member States' security authorities and EU rule-of-law guarantees .....                                                                                                                                  | 95  |
| I. Acting within the scope of the Treaties .....                                                                                                                                                            | 96  |
| II. General enforcement principles of EU law .....                                                                                                                                                          | 96  |
| III. EU rule-of-law guarantees between full commitment and relaxation ...                                                                                                                                   | 96  |
| E. Exceptions.....                                                                                                                                                                                          | 97  |
| I. Art. 4(2) sent. 3 TEU as a general exception in relation to security policy                                                                                                                              | 97  |
| II. Art. 72 TFEU in relation to the AFSJ .....                                                                                                                                                              | 98  |
| III. Exemptions to the Single Market Programme.....                                                                                                                                                         | 98  |
| IV. Special structure of the Common Foreign and Security Policy/Com-                                                                                                                                        |     |
| mon Security and Defence Policy.....                                                                                                                                                                        | 98  |
| F. Conclusions .....                                                                                                                                                                                        | 99  |
| <br><b>§ 7 The national security assumption under Art. 4 TEU and its interdependence with secondary legislation requirements and limits for the Member States' intelligence agencies (<i>Rüß</i>)</b> ..... | 101 |
| A. Introduction .....                                                                                                                                                                                       | 101 |
| B. Secondary-legislation requirements and limits for intelligence agencies – primary-law aspects.....                                                                                                       | 102 |
| I. Preliminary remarks .....                                                                                                                                                                                | 102 |
| II. Focus on intelligence agencies in the following examination of national security and intelligence agencies .....                                                                                        | 103 |
| III. Binding nature of laws and values on the intelligence services of the Member States in the community of laws and values .....                                                                          | 103 |
| IV. Scope of concrete primary-legislation requirements .....                                                                                                                                                | 104 |
| 1. Lack of powers to establish a European intelligence agency .....                                                                                                                                         | 104 |
| 2. Lack of explicit primary-legislative powers to regulate Member States' intelligence services .....                                                                                                       | 105 |
| 3. Interim findings .....                                                                                                                                                                                   | 106 |
| V. Art. 4(2) sent. 3 TEU .....                                                                                                                                                                              | 106 |
| C. Impact of the absence of sector-specific powers of regulation at EU level ..                                                                                                                             | 107 |
| I. Availability of a national security reservation and consequences of the Member States' involvement in EU lawmaking?.....                                                                                 | 107 |
| 1. Indirect assumption of Member States' 'responsibility' within the meaning of Art. 4(2) sent. 3 TEU?.....                                                                                                 | 107 |
| 2. Interim findings .....                                                                                                                                                                                   | 109 |
| II. Application of secondary legislation not specifically enacted to regulate it also in relation to the intelligence services?.....                                                                        | 109 |
| 1. Possible conflict scenarios .....                                                                                                                                                                        | 109 |
| 2. General primacy of EU law including in the case of Art. 4(2) sent. 3 TEU? .....                                                                                                                          | 109 |

## Table of contents

|                                                                                                                                                   |         |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------|
| III. Scope of the reservation.....                                                                                                                | 110     |
| 1. Special status of Art. 4(2) sent. 3 TEU compared to the exemption clauses to the EU fundamental freedoms .....                                 | 110     |
| 2. Competence reservation and secondary legislation; significance of the derogation for the intelligence services .....                           | 111     |
| 3. Specific fields.....                                                                                                                           | 114     |
| a) Data protection.....                                                                                                                           | 114     |
| b) Binding force in the context of use of the JHA databases and legal consequences.....                                                           | 115     |
| c) EU funding for intelligence service interfaces and legal consequences.....                                                                     | 117     |
| D. Summary .....                                                                                                                                  | 117     |
| <br><b>§ 8 The non-integrable core area of national security? On the function and scope of Art. 4(2) sent. 3 TEU (Leino-Sandberg) .....</b>       | <br>119 |
| A. Introduction .....                                                                                                                             | 119     |
| B. The backdrop to Art. 4(2) TEU .....                                                                                                            | 121     |
| I. National security and horizontal principles .....                                                                                              | 121     |
| II. ‘In particular, national security remains the sole responsibility of each Member State.’ .....                                                | 123     |
| C. Security in the EU Treaties: it’s all about framing? .....                                                                                     | 126     |
| I. Freedom, security and justice .....                                                                                                            | 126     |
| II. Internal market and (public) security .....                                                                                                   | 129     |
| III. When security crosses boxes: horizontal matters.....                                                                                         | 133     |
| IV. Common foreign and security policy .....                                                                                                      | 135     |
| D. ‘No other choice’ .....                                                                                                                        | 137     |
| <br><b>§ 9 Sovereigns in chains? Art. 4(2) sent. 3 TEU and EU law constraints on the use of AI in national security contexts (Buchheim) .....</b> | <br>139 |
| A. Giving content to Member States’ national security reserve .....                                                                               | 140     |
| B. Art. 4(2) sent. 3 TEU in a nutshell: overlapping powers, duties to coordinate, instruments of coordination .....                               | 141     |
| I. Art. 4(2) sent. 3 TEU in the context of the treaties’ conception of competitive federalism .....                                               | 141     |
| 1. General functioning of Union competences .....                                                                                                 | 141     |
| 2. Specific reasons that support this reading of Art. 4(2) sent. 3 TEU ...                                                                        | 142     |
| II. Functions and normative demands of Art. 4(2) sent. 3 TEU .....                                                                                | 143     |
| III. Instruments for managing competence overlap: the example of the GDPR.....                                                                    | 144     |
| 1. Choice of instrument: regulation v directive.....                                                                                              | 145     |
| 2. Determining the scope of EU legislation (scope exceptions) .....                                                                               | 145     |
| 3. Opening clauses.....                                                                                                                           | 145     |
| 4. Permissive standards .....                                                                                                                     | 146     |
| 5. Enhancing national security policy .....                                                                                                       | 146     |
| C. The case of AI regulation: EU law constraints on Member States’ use of AI in the context of national security policy .....                     | 146     |
| I. EU data protection law frameworks as indirect AI regulation.....                                                                               | 147     |
| 1. General data protection law: ample discretion in security matters.....                                                                         | 147     |
| 2. Specific EU data protection frameworks.....                                                                                                    | 149     |
| a) The data processing side of Member States’ procedural autonomy                                                                                 | 149     |
| b) The case of telecommunications data .....                                                                                                      | 150     |

## Table of contents

|                                                                                                                                          |         |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------|
| c) Tighter EU interventions in the field of security cooperation and networks .....                                                      | 151     |
| d) Overall security-focused thrust of EU interventions .....                                                                             | 152     |
| II. Direct AI regulation: constraints on Member States' security policy imposed by the proposed AI Act.....                              | 153     |
| 1. Instrumental choice: direct regulation of Member State procedure ...                                                                  | 153     |
| 2. Broad definition of AI as a constraint on Member States' national security policy .....                                               | 154     |
| 3. Scope I: exception for military AI use .....                                                                                          | 154     |
| 4. Scope II: general exception for national security matters .....                                                                       | 154     |
| 5. Discretion in virtue of classification .....                                                                                          | 155     |
| 6. Discretion in virtue of implementation.....                                                                                           | 156     |
| 7. Forbidden AI practices: permissive standard-setting .....                                                                             | 157     |
| 8. Summary: not anything goes, but everything's possible in the field of AI.....                                                         | 158     |
| D. EU AI Regulation and Art. 4(2) sent. 3 TEU: sovereigns in sovereignty-respecting chains .....                                         | 159     |
| <br><b>§ 10 ECJ in the <i>ultra vires</i> trap? French perspectives after the <i>Quadrature du Net</i> ruling (<i>Warusfel</i>).....</b> | <br>161 |
| A. Introduction .....                                                                                                                    | 161     |
| B. ECJ jurisdiction to assess national security for the purposes of EU law .....                                                         | 162     |
| I. Art. 4(2) TEU cited to justify potential lack of jurisdiction on the part of the Court of Justice.....                                | 162     |
| II. Recognition of national security subject to review by an EU judge .....                                                              | 163     |
| II. The constructive echo of European case-law by the <i>Conseil d'État</i> .....                                                        | 164     |
| 1. Refusal to carry out an <i>ultra vires</i> review .....                                                                               | 164     |
| 2. The reservation regarding the constitutional identity of France .....                                                                 | 165     |
| III. A persistent disagreement regarding the use of data in action to combat serious crime .....                                         | 167     |
| 1. A theoretical divergence regarding the scope of national security.....                                                                | 167     |
| 2. A subsequent questioning of the compromise approved by the <i>Conseil d'État</i> .....                                                | 169     |
| <br><b>PART IV</b><br><b>COOPERATION IN THE EUROPEAN SECURITY UNION</b>                                                                  |         |
| <br><b>§ 11 Dynamics of cooperation, soft ways to legal harmonization – an introduction (<i>Sehl</i>).....</b>                           | <br>171 |
| A. When it comes to national security... sensitive issues in relation to Member States' sovereignty and EU integration .....             | 171     |
| I. Reserved power and different security cultures.....                                                                                   | 172     |
| II. Transnational threats from outside and inside the EU .....                                                                           | 174     |
| III. Modes of cooperation: a question of trust.....                                                                                      | 174     |
| IV. Information sharing: a boost for security cooperation .....                                                                          | 175     |
| B. Dynamics of cooperation: soft ways to harmonization?.....                                                                             | 175     |
| I. Sharing intelligence as an endurance test .....                                                                                       | 176     |
| II. How a new type of threat to fundamental rights could lead to a European security benchmark on surveillance .....                     | 176     |
| C. Cooperation as a pathway in sensitive areas of common EU policy fields ..                                                             | 177     |

## Table of contents

|                                                                                                                                               |     |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| <b>§ 12 Between coordination, harmonization and centralization – modes of (inter)action in the European Security Union (Moser)</b> .....      | 179 |
| A. Introduction .....                                                                                                                         | 180 |
| B. The European Security Union in a nutshell.....                                                                                             | 182 |
| I. Policy context.....                                                                                                                        | 182 |
| II. Law and governance .....                                                                                                                  | 183 |
| C. Modes of (inter)action .....                                                                                                               | 185 |
| I. Coordination .....                                                                                                                         | 186 |
| II. Harmonization.....                                                                                                                        | 187 |
| III. Centralization.....                                                                                                                      | 189 |
| D. Case studies: navigating modes of action in border management and cybersecurity.....                                                       | 191 |
| I. Frontex .....                                                                                                                              | 191 |
| II. ENISA .....                                                                                                                               | 194 |
| E. Conclusions .....                                                                                                                          | 198 |
| <br><b>§ 13 The institutional dimension of the EU Security Union: the EU agencies (Schöndorf-Haubold)</b> .....                               | 199 |
| A. The EU security architecture: introductory remarks on its process of differentiation.....                                                  | 200 |
| B. The EU security architecture: stocktaking .....                                                                                            | 203 |
| I. Security agencies.....                                                                                                                     | 204 |
| 1. European Union Agency for Law Enforcement Cooperation (Europol).....                                                                       | 204 |
| a) Legal bases and structure .....                                                                                                            | 204 |
| b) Tasks .....                                                                                                                                | 206 |
| aa) Limited competence and prioritization.....                                                                                                | 206 |
| bb) Information collection point. ....                                                                                                        | 206 |
| cc) Operational functions, specifically participation in JITs .....                                                                           | 207 |
| dd) Data evaluation and analysis.....                                                                                                         | 208 |
| 2. European Border and Coast Guard Agency (Frontex) .....                                                                                     | 208 |
| a) Legal bases and structure .....                                                                                                            | 208 |
| b) Objectives and tasks .....                                                                                                                 | 210 |
| aa) Mandate. ....                                                                                                                             | 210 |
| bb) Basic responsibilities.....                                                                                                               | 210 |
| cc) Border management and return teams. ....                                                                                                  | 210 |
| dd) New operational powers.....                                                                                                               | 211 |
| c) Fundamental rights protection.....                                                                                                         | 211 |
| 3. European Union Agency for Criminal Justice Cooperation (Eurojust) .....                                                                    | 213 |
| a) Legal bases and structure .....                                                                                                            | 213 |
| b) Objectives and tasks .....                                                                                                                 | 214 |
| 4. EPPO .....                                                                                                                                 | 215 |
| a) Jurisdiction .....                                                                                                                         | 215 |
| b) Organization and structure.....                                                                                                            | 216 |
| c) Performance of tasks .....                                                                                                                 | 217 |
| 5. European Police College/European Union Agency for Law Enforcement Training (CEPOL).....                                                    | 217 |
| 6. European Union Agency for the Operational Management of Large-Scale IT Systems in the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice (eu-LISA)..... | 219 |

## Table of contents

|                                                                                                                                                |     |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| a) Large-scale IT systems .....                                                                                                                | 219 |
| b) Organization and structure .....                                                                                                            | 221 |
| c) Objective: to establish an overarching security agency data<br>network .....                                                                | 221 |
| II. Security networks and communications infrastructure: the example of<br>ETIAS .....                                                         | 223 |
| 1. Information systems used in EU security law: an overview .....                                                                              | 223 |
| 2. Wide-ranging networks: the example of ETIAS .....                                                                                           | 224 |
| 3. The role of the agencies in the ETIAS information network .....                                                                             | 225 |
| C. The law relating to the EU security agencies: the direction of development                                                                  | 226 |
| I. Establishing a genuine European border police force .....                                                                                   | 227 |
| II. Expanding Europol's mandate on information processing .....                                                                                | 228 |
| III. Establishing a security information architecture .....                                                                                    | 229 |
| D. Outlook and evaluation .....                                                                                                                | 230 |
| <br><b>§ 14 Towards EU standards on control and oversight of intelligence agencies</b><br><b>(Cameron)</b> .....                               | 233 |
| A. Introduction .....                                                                                                                          | 233 |
| B. The control and oversight 'landscape' .....                                                                                                 | 235 |
| C. Judicial and independent bodies .....                                                                                                       | 238 |
| I. General comments .....                                                                                                                      | 238 |
| II. Authorization .....                                                                                                                        | 239 |
| III. Post hoc functions of courts .....                                                                                                        | 241 |
| D. Prosecutors .....                                                                                                                           | 242 |
| E. Data protection authorities .....                                                                                                           | 242 |
| F. Concluding remarks .....                                                                                                                    | 244 |
| <br><b>PART V</b><br><b>OPERATIONALIZING THE EUROPEAN SECURITY UNION</b>                                                                       |     |
| <br><b>§ 15 Operationalizing the European Security Union – an introduction (Conrad).</b>                                                       | 247 |
| A. Introduction .....                                                                                                                          | 248 |
| B. The Union's security has an intergovernmental and an institutional<br>dimension .....                                                       | 249 |
| I. Intergovernmental cooperation to ensure external security and support<br>internal security .....                                            | 249 |
| II. Supranational dimension of an 'EU Security Union' based on Treaty<br>competences .....                                                     | 250 |
| III. The European Security Union: no executive powers, but initiation,<br>support and coordination of Member States' policies and action ..... | 252 |
| C. The Fifth Progress Report on the implementation of the EU Security<br>Union Strategy – the framework for this chapter .....                 | 254 |
| I. Protecting critical infrastructure in the EU against physical and digital<br>attacks .....                                                  | 254 |
| II. Enhancing the EU's cybersecurity .....                                                                                                     | 256 |
| III. Countering hybrid threats, fighting foreign interference and enhancing<br>EU cyber defence .....                                          | 257 |
| IV. Fighting terrorism and radicalization .....                                                                                                | 261 |
| 1. The fight against terrorism .....                                                                                                           | 261 |
| 2. Combatting radicalization that leads to violent extremism and ter-<br>rorism online and offline .....                                       | 262 |



## Table of contents

|                                                                                                                                          |            |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| V. Fighting organized crime .....                                                                                                        | 263        |
| VI. Organized crime .....                                                                                                                | 263        |
| VII. Ensuring the security of EU borders and supporting law enforcement<br>and judicial cooperation .....                                | 265        |
| VIII. The internal-external security nexus: security in the EU neighbourhood<br>and in partner countries .....                           | 268        |
| D. What remains to be done? .....                                                                                                        | 269        |
| E. Subsequent chapters .....                                                                                                             | 270        |
| <b>§ 16 Cybersecurity in the European multi-level governance system (Wischmeyer)</b>                                                     | <b>275</b> |
| A. Introduction .....                                                                                                                    | 276        |
| B. The cybersecurity problem – and how regulation can fix it.....                                                                        | 279        |
| I. From the ends of cybersecurity... ..                                                                                                  | 279        |
| II. To the means: three layers of cybersecurity regulation .....                                                                         | 280        |
| C. The European Union’s response to the cybersecurity problem .....                                                                      | 281        |
| I. EU cybersecurity regulation – an overview .....                                                                                       | 282        |
| II. Inconsistencies and gaps in EU cybersecurity regulation.....                                                                         | 283        |
| III. The EU Treaties as an obstacle to comprehensive and coherent cyber-<br>security regulation? .....                                   | 285        |
| D. Outlook: towards an effective multi-level cybersecurity governance system                                                             | 287        |
| <b>§ 17 Hybrid threats as a challenge to the European Union and its Member<br/>States (Tiilikainen)</b> .....                            | <b>289</b> |
| A. Introduction .....                                                                                                                    | 289        |
| B. The emergence of hybrid threats in the EU’s political discourse .....                                                                 | 290        |
| C. Towards shared control of the information space .....                                                                                 | 293        |
| D. Institutional framework for coordinated response .....                                                                                | 296        |
| E. Building resilience .....                                                                                                             | 298        |
| F. Tools for preventing hybrid threats and responding to them .....                                                                      | 300        |
| G. Conclusions .....                                                                                                                     | 304        |
| <b>§ 18 Intelligence cooperation in the European Union (Dietrich)</b> .....                                                              | <b>307</b> |
| A. Introduction .....                                                                                                                    | 308        |
| B. Key terms .....                                                                                                                       | 309        |
| I. Intelligence.....                                                                                                                     | 309        |
| II. Intelligence cooperation.....                                                                                                        | 311        |
| 1. Intelligence cooperation as a prerequisite for national security.....                                                                 | 312        |
| 2. Intelligence cooperation, intelligence cycle and multi-source intelli-<br>gence .....                                                 | 313        |
| 3. From ‘need to know’ to ‘need to share’ .....                                                                                          | 314        |
| 4. Informal and institutionalized partnerships in bilateral and multi-<br>lateral cooperation .....                                      | 314        |
| C. Intelligence cooperation in Europe .....                                                                                              | 317        |
| I. EU intelligence cooperation between political ambition and bureau-<br>cratic reality .....                                            | 317        |
| II. The primary legislative setting .....                                                                                                | 319        |
| 1. Art. 4(2) sent. 3 TEU – limiting the exercise of powers in the area of<br>‘national security’ .....                                   | 319        |
| 2. Intelligence cooperation on account of the duty to provide assistance<br>in the spirit of solidarity pursuant to Art. 222 TFEU? ..... | 322        |



## Table of contents

|                                                                                                                                            |                |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------|
| 3. Intelligence cooperation as part of ‘Permanent Structured Cooperation’ within the meaning of Art. 42(6) and Art. 46 TEU .....           | 323            |
| 4. Intelligence cooperation as ‘Enhanced Cooperation’ in accordance with Art. 326 et seqq. TFEU .....                                      | 325            |
| III. EU intelligence structures.....                                                                                                       | 326            |
| 1. Single Intelligence Analysis Capacity (SIAC) .....                                                                                      | 326            |
| a) EU Intelligence and Situation Centre (EU INTCEN) .....                                                                                  | 327            |
| b) EU Military Staff Intelligence Directorate (EUMS INT) .....                                                                             | 329            |
| 2. European Union Satellite Centre (EU SATCEN) .....                                                                                       | 330            |
| IV. Intelligence cooperation beyond the EU .....                                                                                           | 331            |
| C. Conclusions .....                                                                                                                       | 333            |
| <br><b>§ 19 Integrated border management: evolving tasks and division of labour between the EU and Member States (<i>Bossong</i>).....</b> | <br><b>335</b> |
| A. Introduction .....                                                                                                                      | 337            |
| B. The concept of IBM .....                                                                                                                | 341            |
| I. European understandings of IBM and the creation of Frontex .....                                                                        | 342            |
| II. IBM in the Treaty of Lisbon.....                                                                                                       | 344            |
| III. IBM and the subsequent evolution of the European Border and Coast Guard.....                                                          | 346            |
| IV. Additional use of Art. 77(2)(d) TFEU to expand the EU’s role in border security .....                                                  | 349            |
| C. Additional critique and developments .....                                                                                              | 350            |
| D. Conclusions .....                                                                                                                       | 353            |
| <br><b>§ 20 Paradigm shifts: from siloed databases to interoperability of EU large scale information systems (<i>Quintel</i>) .....</b>    | <br><b>355</b> |
| A. Introduction .....                                                                                                                      | 356            |
| B. The road from separated silos to interconnected systems .....                                                                           | 359            |
| I. The underlying databases .....                                                                                                          | 359            |
| II. Interoperability of EU large-scale information systems.....                                                                            | 367            |
| 1. The interoperability components .....                                                                                                   | 368            |
| 2. Development and maintenance of the interoperable system.....                                                                            | 370            |
| 3. Access to the interoperability components by national authorities ....                                                                  | 371            |
| 4. Access to the interoperability components by national law enforcement authorities .....                                                 | 372            |
| 5. The role of EU Agencies in the interoperable system .....                                                                               | 374            |
| C. Interoperable risk detection, automated data matching and AI-based functionalities.....                                                 | 377            |
| I. Problems related to data quality .....                                                                                                  | 378            |
| II. Algorithmic testing and inherent biases .....                                                                                          | 379            |
| III. The use of AI Act-based technologies .....                                                                                            | 383            |
| D. Data protection concerns in connection with interoperable information exchanges at different levels .....                               | 386            |
| I. EU data protection rules in different contexts .....                                                                                    | 387            |
| II. Supervision of multi-level data flows.....                                                                                             | 390            |
| E. Conclusion and outlook .....                                                                                                            | 391            |

*Table of contents*

**PART VI  
PERSPECTIVES**

|                                                                                        |            |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| <b>§ 21 On the future of security cooperation in the European Union (Zanger) .....</b> | <b>395</b> |
| A. Introduction .....                                                                  | 396        |
| B. Disruptive trends.....                                                              | 398        |
| I. Technological progress.....                                                         | 398        |
| 1. Adjusting to a changing reality .....                                               | 399        |
| 2. Opportunities to innovate .....                                                     | 399        |
| 3. Challenges .....                                                                    | 399        |
| II. The link between internal and external security .....                              | 400        |
| 1. Accelerating globalization/international dependencies .....                         | 401        |
| 2. Geopolitical competition .....                                                      | 401        |
| 3. Securitization of migration and asylum .....                                        | 402        |
| 4. Decline in transnational terrorism .....                                            | 402        |
| III. Executive aggrandisement .....                                                    | 403        |
| 1. Member States' backsliding.....                                                     | 403        |
| 2. European executive detours .....                                                    | 404        |
| C. The future of European security cooperation .....                                   | 405        |
| I. Roles and responsibilities .....                                                    | 405        |
| II. Legislative and policy agenda .....                                                | 407        |
| 1. Primary law .....                                                                   | 407        |
| 2. Secondary law .....                                                                 | 407        |
| a) Implementation roadmap.....                                                         | 408        |
| b) Empowerment of EU Agencies .....                                                    | 409        |
| c) CJEU case law .....                                                                 | 410        |
| D. Conclusion.....                                                                     | 410        |