

# Techniques and Assumptions in Jewish Exegesis before 70 CE

by

David Instone Brewer



J. C. B. Mohr (Paul Siebeck) Tübingen

## Contents

|                                       |   |
|---------------------------------------|---|
| <i>Preface</i> . . . . .              | v |
| <i>Foreword</i> . . . . .             | 1 |
| <i>General Introduction</i> . . . . . | 2 |
| The term “Scribes” . . . . .          | 2 |
| The term “Midrash” . . . . .          | 3 |
| Previous Studies . . . . .            | 4 |
| Origins of the Middoth . . . . .      | 5 |

### Part I: Exegeses in Scribal Traditions

|        |   |    |
|--------|---|----|
| I.1.0  | <i>Introduction to Scribal Traditions</i> . . . . . | 11 |
| I.1.1  | Sources of the scribal traditions . . . . .         | 11 |
| I.1.2  | Text, Translation and Notes . . . . .               | 12 |
| I.1.3  | Analysis of the Traditions . . . . .                | 13 |
| I.1.4  | Modes of Exegesis . . . . .                         | 14 |
| I.1.4a | – Peshat . . . . .                                  | 14 |
| I.1.4b | – Nomological . . . . .                             | 15 |
| I.1.4c | – Ultra-literal . . . . .                           | 15 |
| I.1.4d | – Derash . . . . .                                  | 16 |
| I.1.5  | Techniques of Exegesis . . . . .                    | 17 |
| I.1.5a | – Qal vaHomer . . . . .                             | 17 |
| I.1.5b | – Gezerah Shavah I . . . . .                        | 17 |
| I.1.5c | – Gezerah Shavah II . . . . .                       | 18 |
| I.1.5d | – Heqesh . . . . .                                  | 18 |
| I.1.5e | – Binyan Ab . . . . .                               | 19 |
| I.1.5f | – Contradiction . . . . .                           | 19 |
| I.1.5g | – Extension and Limitation . . . . .                | 19 |
| I.1.5h | – Unusual Form . . . . .                            | 20 |
| I.1.5i | – Mashal . . . . .                                  | 20 |
| I.1.5j | – Order . . . . .                                   | 20 |

|        |   |    |
|--------|---|----|
| I.1.5k | – Wordplay . . . . .  | 20 |
| I.1.5l | – No Redundancy . . . . .                                   | 21 |
| I.1.5m | – Precedent . . . . .                                       | 21 |
| I.1.5n | – Reductio ad Absurdum . . . . .                            | 21 |
| I.1.5o | – Logical Inconsistency . . . . .                           | 21 |
| I.1.5p | – Pragmatism . . . . .                                      | 21 |
| I.1.5q | – Prophetic Fulfilment . . . . .                            | 22 |
| I.1.5r | – Symbolism . . . . .                                       | 22 |
| I.1.5s | – Atomisation . . . . .                                     | 22 |
| I.1.5t | – Allegory . . . . .  | 22 |
| I.1.5u | – Amalgamation . . . . .                                    | 22 |
| <br>   |   |    |
| I.2    | <i>Exegeses by Named Authorities</i> . . . . .              | 23 |
| I.2.1  | Simeon the Just: The Nazarites . . . . .                    | 23 |
| I.2.2  | Simeon b.Shetah: Honi the Circler . . . . .                 | 25 |
| I.2.3  | Simeon b.Shetah & Judah b.Tabai: False witnesses . . . . .  | 25 |
| I.2.4  | Simeon b.Shetah & Judah b.Tabai: A single witness . . . . . | 26 |
| I.2.5  | Simeon b.Shetah: King Yannai's feast . . . . .              | 26 |
| I.2.6  | Simeon b.Shetah: King Yannai's trial . . . . .              | 29 |
| I.2.7  | Shemaiah & Abtalion: "For whose sake?" . . . . .            | 31 |
| I.2.8  | Judah b.Durtai: Hagigah on Sabbath . . . . .                | 31 |
| I.2.9  | Shammai: The sender is guilty . . . . .                     | 32 |
| I.2.10 | Shammai: Remember/Keep the Sabbath . . . . .                | 33 |
| I.2.11 | Shammai: Sue for peace for three days . . . . .             | 33 |
| I.2.12 | Shammai: Besieging on the Sabbath . . . . .                 | 35 |
| I.2.13 | Hillel: "For three things..." . . . . .                     | 35 |
| I.2.14 | Hillel: Itch within baldness . . . . .                      | 36 |
| I.2.15 | Hillel: Prozbul . . . . .                                   | 37 |
| I.2.16 | Hillel: Corpse within water . . . . .                       | 38 |
| I.2.17 | Hillel: Time to laugh, weep, scatter, gather . . . . .      | 39 |
| I.2.18 | Hillel: Passover on Sabbath . . . . .                       | 41 |
| I.2.19 | Hillel: Feet lead to the Temple . . . . .                   | 50 |
| I.2.20 | Hillel: "If we are here, who is here?" . . . . .            | 51 |
| I.2.21 | Hillel: A cry from afar . . . . .                           | 52 |
| I.2.22 | Hillel: Self-abasement exalts . . . . .                     | 53 |
| I.2.23 | Hillel: Disciple Yohanan b.Zakkai . . . . .                 | 53 |
| I.2.24 | Hillel & Bar Hé Hé: Forgotten offerings . . . . .           | 54 |
| I.2.25 | Hillel & Bar Hé Hé: The righteous and wicked . . . . .      | 56 |
| I.2.26 | Ben Bag Bag: Second Tithe purchases . . . . .               | 57 |
| I.2.27 | Ben Bag Bag: Tamid examined 4 days . . . . .                | 58 |
| I.2.28 | Ben Bag Bag: Redeem only with a lamb . . . . .              | 59 |
| I.2.29 | Baba b.Buta: Imprisoned by Herod . . . . .                  | 59 |
| I.2.30 | Gamaliel I: God jealous of inferiors . . . . .              | 63 |
| I.2.31 | Gamaliel I: Do not destroy altars . . . . .                 | 64 |

|        |   |     |
|--------|---|-----|
| I.2.32 | Gamaliel I: Two Toroth . . . . .                          | 65  |
| I.2.33 | Simeon b.Gamaliel I: A beautiful woman . . . . .          | 66  |
| I.2.34 | Hananiah the Priest: Peace to the Temple . . . . .        | 67  |
| I.2.35 | Hananiah the Priest: Peace is great . . . . .             | 67  |
| I.2.36 | Hananiah the Priest: Rewards of Torah . . . . .           | 68  |
| I.2.37 | Hananiah the Priest: Rulers cast off the yoke . . . . .   | 69  |
| I.2.38 | Eliezer b.Hananiah: Diverse Ephahs . . . . .              | 70  |
| I.2.39 | Eliezer b.Hananiah: Remember the Sabbath . . . . .        | 71  |
| I.2.40 | Judah b.Bathyra: Betrothed eat with priests . . . . .     | 71  |
| I.2.41 | Judah b.Bathyra: Undesignated gifts . . . . .             | 72  |
| I.2.42 | Judah b.Bathyra: Meal offering in left hand . . . . .     | 73  |
| I.2.43 | Judah b.Bathyra: Water libation . . . . .                 | 74  |
| I.2.44 | Yohanan b.Zakkai: Do not destroy altars . . . . .         | 75  |
| I.2.45 | Yohanan b.Zakkai: Two Toroth . . . . .                    | 76  |
| I.2.46 | Yohanan b.Zakkai: Bitter waters ceased . . . . .          | 77  |
| I.2.47 | Yohanan b.Zakkai: Temple door opened . . . . .            | 77  |
| I.2.48 | Yohanan b.Zakkai: Vespasian to be King . . . . .          | 79  |
| I.2.49 | Yohanan b.Zakkai: Murdering ox stoned . . . . .           | 80  |
| I.2.50 | Yohanan b.Zakkai: Total number of Levites . . . . .       | 82  |
| I.2.51 | Yohanan b.Zakkai: Valuing the half-shekels . . . . .      | 85  |
| <br>   |   |     |
| I.3    | <i>Exegeses by Pharisees and Sadducees</i> . . . . .      | 88  |
| I.3.1  | Eternal rewards . . . . .                                 | 88  |
| I.3.2  | Uncleanness of Scripture . . . . .                        | 90  |
| I.3.3  | Unbroken stream . . . . .                                 | 93  |
| I.3.4  | Damage by slave or ox . . . . .                           | 94  |
| I.3.5  | Name of God and ruler . . . . .                           | 95  |
| I.3.6  | Inheriting granddaughter . . . . .                        | 96  |
| I.3.7  | Saying the Name before bathing . . . . .                  | 100 |
| I.3.8  | Atonement Incense . . . . .                               | 101 |
| I.3.9  | Cleansing the Lamp . . . . .                              | 104 |
| I.3.10 | Death of false witnesses . . . . .                        | 104 |
| I.3.11 | Oral and written Torah . . . . .                          | 106 |
| I.3.12 | Date of Feast of Weeks . . . . .                          | 109 |
| I.3.13 | Eat meal offering with ox . . . . .                       | 111 |
| I.3.14 | Payment for public offerings . . . . .                    | 114 |
| I.3.15 | Skins for Tefillin . . . . .                              | 115 |
| I.3.16 | The Temple Court cries out . . . . .                      | 118 |
| <br>   |   |     |
| I.4    | <i>Exegeses by Beth Hillel and Beth Shammai</i> . . . . . | 118 |
| I.4.1  | Examine Phylacteries . . . . .                            | 118 |
| I.4.2  | Using entrusted goods . . . . .                           | 120 |
| I.4.3  | Between the evenings . . . . .                            | 124 |

|         |   |     |
|---------|---|-----|
| I.4.4   | Work finished by Sabbath . . . . .                            | 125 |
| I.4.5   | 81st day abortion . . . . .                                   | 126 |
| I.4.6   | 4th year grape gleanings . . . . .                            | 130 |
| I.4.7   | Pilgrim offering on Festival (a) . . . . .                    | 131 |
| I.4.8   | Guarded Sabbatical crop . . . . .                             | 132 |
| I.4.9   | Fringes . . . . .   | 134 |
| I.4.10  | First fleece of a flock . . . . .                             | 135 |
| I.4.11  | Reasons for a divorce . . . . .                               | 136 |
| I.4.12  | Attitude for Shema . . . . .                                  | 138 |
| I.4.13  | Incorrect heave offerings . . . . .                           | 139 |
| I.4.14  | Who goes up to Jerusalem . . . . .                            | 140 |
| I.4.15  | Minimum number of children . . . . .                          | 142 |
| I.4.16  | Half-bondservant . . . . .                                    | 143 |
| I.4.17  | Eternity for nearly righteous . . . . .                       | 145 |
| I.4.18  | Tassels on linen coat . . . . .                               | 146 |
| I.4.19  | Blessing for lights . . . . .                                 | 147 |
| I.4.20  | Honour Sabbath every day . . . . .                            | 149 |
| I.4.21  | Pilgrim offering on Festival (b) . . . . .                    | 150 |
| I.4.22  | The order of creation . . . . .                               | 152 |
| I.4.23  | Complimenting the bride . . . . .                             | 154 |
| I.4.24  | Offering from harlots' wages . . . . .                        | 155 |
| I.4.25  | "Dust" to cover blood . . . . .                               | 156 |
| I.4.26  | "Lamb" as sin . . . . .                                       | 157 |
| I.5     | <i>Techniques in Scribal Exegesis</i> . . . . .               | 159 |
| I.5.1   | Frequencies of Modes and Techniques used . . . . .            | 159 |
| I.5.2   | Comparison between different groups . . . . .                 | 160 |
| I.5.3   | Conclusion: a homogeneous corpus of exegeses . . . . .        | 161 |
| I.6     | <i>Assumptions in Scribal Exegesis</i> . . . . .              | 163 |
| I.6.1   | The Nomological approach to Scripture . . . . .               | 163 |
| I.6.2   | Five assumptions in scribal exegeses: . . . . .               | 165 |
| I.6.2.1 | – Scripture is totally self-consistent . . . . .              | 165 |
| I.6.2.2 | – Every detail in Scripture is significant . . . . .          | 166 |
| I.6.2.3 | – Scripture is read according to its context . . . . .        | 167 |
| I.6.2.4 | – Scripture does not have a secondary meaning . . . . .       | 169 |
| I.6.2.5 | – There is only one valid text form of Scripture . . . . .    | 170 |
| I.6.3   | Conclusions: Scribal exegesis is Nomological . . . . .        | 171 |
| I.7     | <i>Comparison of Scribal with Rabbinic Exegesis</i> . . . . . | 172 |
| I.7.1   | Texts removed from context . . . . .                          | 172 |
| I.7.2   | Multiple interpretations of single texts . . . . .            | 172 |
| I.7.3   | Exegesis based on variant or altered readings . . . . .       | 173 |

**Part II:**  
**Exegesis in Non-Scribal Traditions**

|            |   |     |
|------------|---|-----|
| II.1       | <i>Introduction to Non-Scribal Exegesis</i> . . . . .               | 177 |
| II.2       | <i>Exegesis in Ancient Texts and Translations</i> . . . . .         | 178 |
| II.2.1     | Masoretic Text . . . . .  | 178 |
| II.2.2     | Targumim . . . . .  | 178 |
| II.2.3     | Septuagint and Old Greek . . . . .                                  | 180 |
| II.3       | <i>Exegesis of the Dorshe Reshumot and Dorshe Hamurot</i> . . . . . | 181 |
| II.4       | <i>Exegesis in Josephus</i> . . . . .                               | 183 |
| II.4.1     | Sources of his traditions . . . . .                                 | 183 |
| II.4.2     | Influence of his background . . . . .                               | 184 |
| II.4.3     | Attitude towards Scripture . . . . .                                | 185 |
| II.4.4     | Techniques of Exegesis . . . . .                                    | 185 |
| II.4.4a    | – Etymology . . . . .   | 186 |
| II.4.4b    | – Allegory . . . . .  | 186 |
| II.4.4c    | – Typology . . . . .  | 186 |
| II.5       | <i>Exegesis at Qumran</i> . . . . .                                 | 187 |
| II.5.1     | Dating the documents . . . . .                                      | 187 |
| II.5.2     | Techniques of Exegesis . . . . .                                    | 189 |
| II.5.2a    | – Brownlee's 13 'principles' . . . . .                              | 189 |
| II.5.2b    | – An example . . . . .  | 190 |
| II.5.3     | Origin of the exegetical techniques . . . . .                       | 192 |
| II.5.3a    | – Apocalyptic dream interpretations . . . . .                       | 192 |
| II.5.3b    | – Targumim . . . . .  | 193 |
| II.5.3c    | – Philo . . . . .   | 194 |
| II.5.3d    | – Scribes . . . . .   | 195 |
| II.5.4     | Assumptions underlying exegesis . . . . .                           | 196 |
| II.5.4a    | – Scripture requires inspired exegesis . . . . .                    | 196 |
| II.5.4b    | – Scripture has no single valid text form . . . . .                 | 197 |
| II.5.5     | Conclusions: Qumran exegesis is Inspirational . . . . .             | 198 |
| II.6       | <i>Exegesis in Philo</i> . . . . .                                  | 198 |
| II.6.1     | Techniques of exegesis . . . . .                                    | 198 |
| II.6.1a    | – Siegfried's 23 'Rules' . . . . .                                  | 199 |
| II.6.1b    | – Allegory . . . . .  | 200 |
| II.6.1c    | – An example . . . . .  | 200 |
| II.6.2     | Origins of the exegetical techniques . . . . .                      | 201 |
| II.6.2a    | – Jewish influence: . . . . .                                       | 202 |
| II.6.2a.i  | – Did Philo know Hebrew? . . . . .                                  | 202 |
| II.6.2a.ii | – Did Philo know Palestinian Halakah? . . . . .                     | 202 |

|                              |  |     |
|------------------------------|--|-----|
| II.6.2a.iii                  | – Did Philo know Palestinian Haggadah? . . . . .                           | 203 |
| II.6.2b                      | – Hellenistic influence . . . . .  | 204 |
| II.6.2c                      | – Sources used by Philo . . . . .  | 205 |
| II.6.2c.i                    | – Therapeutae and Essenes . . . . .  | 205 |
| II.6.2c.ii                   | – Aristobulus and Aristeas . . . . .                                       | 205 |
| II.6.2c.iii                  | – Allegorists and literalists . . . . .                                    | 205 |
| II.6.2c.iv                   | – Etymological source . . . . .  | 207 |
| II.6.2c.v                    | – Other sources . . . . .  | 208 |
| II.6.3                       | <b>Assumptions underlying exegesis . . . . .</b>                           | 208 |
| II.6.3a                      | – Scripture requires inspired exegesis . . . . .                           | 208 |
| II.6.3b                      | – The Septuagint is a valid form of Scripture . . . . .                    | 209 |
| II.6.4                       | Conclusions: Philonic exegesis is Inspirational . . . . .                  | 210 |
| II.7                         | <b><i>Techniques and Assumptions in Non-scribal Exegesis . . . . .</i></b> | 212 |
| II.7.1                       | The Inspirational approach has five assumptions: . . . . .                 | 212 |
| II.7.1.1&2                   | Every detail is consistent and significant . . . . .                       | 213 |
| II.7.1.3                     | Scripture may be interpreted contrary to context . . . . .                 | 213 |
| II.7.1.4                     | Scripture has secondary meanings . . . . .                                 | 213 |
| II.7.1.5                     | Variant texts and translations are inspired . . . . .                      | 214 |
| II.7.2                       | Dorshe Reshumot /Hamurot and Josephus . . . . .                            | 214 |
| II.7.3                       | Apocalyptic literature . . . . .   | 215 |
| II.7.4                       | Samaritan literature . . . . .   | 215 |
| II.7.5                       | Ancient texts and translations . . . . .                                   | 215 |
| II.7.6                       | Conclusion: Non-scribal exegesis is Inspirational . . . . .                | 215 |
| II.8                         | <b><i>Comparison of Non-scribal with Scribal Exegesis . . . . .</i></b>    | 215 |
| II.8.1                       | Reasons for scribal rejection of inspired exegesis . . . . .               | 216 |
| II.8.1.1                     | – Their opponents demanded it? . . . . .                                   | 216 |
| II.8.1.2                     | – They were ignorant of non-scribal techniques? . . . . .                  | 216 |
| II.8.1.2a                    | – No: they knew different texts and translations . . . . .                 | 217 |
| II.8.1.2b                    | – They knew about prophetic inspiration . . . . .                          | 217 |
| II.8.2                       | Non-scribes also knew about Nomological exegesis . . . . .                 | 219 |
| II.8.3                       | Both approaches were coherent and could co-exist . . . . .                 | 220 |
| II.8.4                       | Typology at the interface of both approaches . . . . .                     | 220 |
| II.8.5                       | Conclusions: Co-existed before 70 CE . . . . .                             | 221 |
| III                          | Conclusions . . . . .  | 222 |
| III.1                        | Summary of this study . . . . .  | 222 |
| III.2                        | Points of contact with previous studies . . . . .                          | 223 |
| III.3                        | Implications of this study . . . . .                                       | 224 |
| III.4                        | Final conclusion . . . . .   | 225 |
| Appendix 1: Lists of Middoth | . . . . .  | 226 |
| Ap.1.1                       | 7 Middoth of Hillel . . . . .  | 226 |

|   |  |     |
|---|--|-----|
| Ap.1.2  | 13 Middoth of Ishmael . . . . .                | 227 |
| Ap.1.3  | 32 Middoth of Eliezer bJose haGelili . . . . . | 228 |
| Appendix 2: Summary of Scribal Exegeses . . . . . |  | 232 |
| Bibliography & Abbreviations . . . . .            |  | 242 |
| Bib.1   | Standard texts transcribed . . . . .           | 242 |
| Bib.2   | Abbreviations . . . . .                        | 242 |
| Bib.3   | Works referred to in this study . . . . .      | 248 |
|   | – Texts and Translations . . . . .             | 248 |
|   | – Other works referred to . . . . .            | 252 |
| Indexes   |  |     |
| Index of Subjects . . . . .                       |  | 280 |
| Index of Modern Authors . . . . .                 |  | 288 |
| Index of References . . . . .                     |  | 291 |