

## **Part I Literature Review**

<b>1 Scope, Terminology and Methodology</b> .....	<b>3</b>
1 Defining the Topic: The Application of the Public Policy Exception in China's Judicial Review of International Commercial Arbitral Awards .....	3
2 Terminology .....	4
2.1 International Commercial Arbitration .....	4
2.2 Public Policy .....	6
2.3 The Definition of China and the Scope of the Chinese Legal System .....	9
3 Methodology .....	11
3.1 Textual Analysis .....	11
3.2 Empirical Study .....	11
3.3 Comparative Study .....	12
<b>2 Public Policy in International Arbitration Law</b> .....	<b>15</b>
1 Introduction .....	15
2 The Developments of Public Policy in International Arbitration Law: A Historical Review .....	16
2.1 The Origin and Fundamental Characteristics of Public Policy .....	16
2.2 Historical Developments of Arbitration and the Application of Public Policy Within that Context .....	18
2.3 Developments of International Arbitration in Modern Times and the Calls for a New Definition of Public Policy .....	20
3 National and International Movements in Regulating the Application of Public Policy to Arbitration Practice .....	23
3.1 International Movements: Legislative Attempts to Restrict and Unify Public Policy .....	23

3.2	National Schemes: The Tension Between Unification and Localisation .....	25
3.3	Recent Discussions and Developments .....	27
4	Domestic, International and Transnational/Truly International Public Policy .....	28
4.1	Domestic and International Public Policy in Arbitration Law .....	28
4.2	Public Policy Approaches of Which State? .....	30
4.3	Transnational Public Policy and a New Arbitral Legal Order? .....	33
5	The Key Elements of Public Policy .....	37
6	Conclusion .....	38
<b>3</b>	<b>Overview of China's Practice in Applying Public Policy in Arbitration Law .....</b>	<b>41</b>
1	Introduction .....	41
2	General Review of China's Legal Environment: The Legislative and Judicial System in China .....	42
2.1	The Chinese Legislative System .....	42
2.2	The Chinese Judicial System .....	44
3	Historical Review of China's Arbitration Practices .....	49
3.1	Dual-Track Practices Before the Late 1980s .....	49
3.2	Developments: Enactment of the Chinese Arbitration Law and the Current Chinese Arbitration System .....	51
4	Distinct Aspects of the Current Arbitration System in China .....	59
4.1	A Complicated Set of Rules Governing Arbitration Practice .....	59
4.2	Types of Arbitration and Awards .....	60
4.3	Application of Different Mechanisms to the Awards .....	64
4.4	The Judicial Review Schemes of Annulment and the Enforcement of Arbitral Awards .....	68
4.5	Other Concerns of Chinese Courts and Judicial Review Practices .....	69
4.6	The Role of Arbitration Commissions and Arbitrators .....	73
5	The Public Policy Exception in China's Arbitration Law .....	79
6	Conclusion .....	84
 <b>Part II China's Public Policy Practice Compared to Other Jurisdictions</b>		
<b>4</b>	<b>Application of Public Policy in China .....</b>	<b>89</b>
1	Introduction .....	89
2	A General Statistical Description of China's Arbitration Practices and the Judicial Review of Arbitral Awards .....	90
2.1	China's Arbitration Practice .....	90
2.2	The Annulment/Non-enforcement Rate Study .....	92

2.3	The Application of Different Grounds for the Annulment or Non-enforcement of Arbitral Awards .....	94
3	Statistical Research on the Application of the Public Policy Exception: Fundamental Aspects .....	96
3.1	Methodology .....	96
3.2	The Pool of Cases: Foreign-Related and International Awards Reviewed in China .....	99
4	Statistical Study: Public Policy in Chinese Courts' Judicial Review of Foreign-Related and International Awards .....	110
4.1	Change Over Time .....	113
4.2	Roles of Parties and Courts .....	114
4.3	Different Elements of Public Policy .....	118
4.4	Primary Observations Arising from the Cases .....	126
5	Conclusion .....	128
<b>5</b>	<b>Substantive Notions, Public Morals and Fundamental Principles Under Public Policy .....</b>	<b>131</b>
1	Introduction .....	131
2	Overview of the Developments of Substantive Fundamental Principles .....	132
2.1	International Developments in Defining the Substantive Notions and Principles of Public Policy .....	132
2.2	The Overview of China's Approach in Defining Substantive Fundamental Principles .....	135
3	Substantive Fairness and Justice .....	136
3.1	International Practices and Controversies .....	137
3.2	Reflections on China .....	138
3.3	Analysis .....	141
4	Good Morals/Public Order .....	141
4.1	International Practice in Defining Good Morals and Public Order .....	141
4.2	Practice in China .....	143
4.3	Analysis .....	144
5	National Interests as Elements of Public Policy .....	145
5.1	International Developments .....	145
5.2	Chinese Practice: Overview .....	145
5.3	The Economic Interests of the State .....	146
5.4	Other Discussion on China's National Interests .....	148
6	Conclusion .....	149
<b>6</b>	<b>Procedural Fundamental Principles in Public Policy .....</b>	<b>151</b>
1	Introduction .....	151
2	Impartiality and the Equal Treatment of Parties .....	153
2.1	Impartiality of Arbitrators in the Composition of the Tribunal .....	153
2.2	Impartiality of Arbitrators in Trial Proceedings .....	159

2.3	Impartiality in Decision-Making .....	165
2.4	Institutional Impartiality .....	165
3	Protection of the Parties' Rights: The Hearing Rule .....	167
3.1	Introduction: The Hearing Rule .....	167
3.2	Practice in China .....	168
4	The Principle of Res Judicata and China's Judicial Sovereignty .....	170
4.1	International Developments and Discussions .....	170
4.2	Cases in China's Arbitration Practice .....	173
4.3	Discussion: Practice in China .....	180
5	Fraud and Dishonesty in Arbitration Practices .....	183
6	Approaches to Judicial Review .....	187
6.1	Determining Which Ground to Apply to Procedural Errors .....	187
6.2	The Criteria Governing the Application of Public Policy in Dealing with Procedural Issues .....	189
<b>7</b>	<b>Public Policy in the Form of Public Policy Rules .....</b>	<b>193</b>
1	Introduction .....	193
2	The Development of Mandatory Rules in Arbitration Law: A General Review .....	194
2.1	Major Aspects of Mandatory Rules .....	194
2.2	Mandatory Rules, Arbitrability and Public Policy .....	196
2.3	Mandatory Rules of Law not Equivalent to Public Policy .....	197
3	The Judicial Review Practice in Applying Public Policy Rules/ <i>Lois De Police</i> .....	200
3.1	International Practice .....	200
3.2	Possible Categories of Public Policy Rules in China: The Law and Academic Discussion .....	203
3.3	The Economic and Financial Regulations and Approvals .....	204
3.4	The Competition Law Rules .....	211
3.5	The Import/Export Controls and Public Health/ Environmental Protection .....	213
3.6	Other Cases .....	216
4	Conclusion: Establishing a Consistent Approach in Dealing with Public Policy Rules .....	217
4.1	China's Problem: Lack of a Practical Approach .....	217
4.2	Legislative Purpose as a Possible Indicator of Public Policy Rules .....	219
<b>8</b>	<b>Arbitrability and Public Policy .....</b>	<b>223</b>
1	Introduction .....	223
2	General Literature Review on Arbitrability .....	224
2.1	Definition of Arbitrability .....	224
2.2	Developments in Broadening the Scope of Arbitrability .....	225
2.3	The Revised Criteria for Defining Arbitrability .....	227
2.4	National or International Approaches to Arbitrability .....	229
2.5	Arbitrability and Public Policy .....	230

3	Reflections in China .....	232
3.1	The Arbitrability Issues in China in General .....	232
3.2	Arbitrability in China's Judicial Practice .....	235
3.3	The Exclusive Jurisdiction in China .....	244
4	Comments and Conclusion .....	247

### **Part III Conclusion and Recommendations**

#### **9 An Evaluation of the Application of Public Policy in the Chinese**

<b>Legal System .....</b>	<b>251</b>
1 Introduction .....	251
2 Domestic, International and Transnational/Truly International Public Policy in China .....	252
3 The Possible Key Elements of Public Policy in China's Practice ....	254
4 The Extent of Judicial Review .....	258
4.1 International Progress .....	258
4.2 Chinese Practice .....	262
5 Waiver and Estoppel in Applying Public Policy .....	267
6 Evaluation of the Performance of the Chinese Courts .....	270
6.1 General Performance of the Chinese Courts in Applying Public Policy in the Judicial Review of Arbitral Awards .....	270
6.2 Chinese Courts as Supervisory Courts and Enforcing Courts .....	271
6.3 The Functioning of the Prior Reporting System in Applying Public Policy .....	275
6.4 Problems and Proposed Reforms in China's Judicial System .....	276
7 The Role and Contributions of Arbitrators and Other Participants in Arbitration .....	279
7.1 Arbitration Commissions .....	279
7.2 Arbitrators .....	280
7.3 Lawyers and Other Participants .....	281
8 China's Legal System and Legal Culture: Globalisation and Localisation of Public Policy in China? .....	282
8.1 Internationalisation? .....	282
8.2 Localisation? .....	283
8.3 China's Choice and Future .....	285

<b>Conclusion: A Lesson from and for China .....</b>	<b>289</b>
--	------------

#### **Appendix A: Cases Dealing with Public Policy Determined by Lower Courts .....**

293

<b>Bibliography .....</b>	<b>301</b>
---------------------------	------------