

# Table of Contents

List of Figures and Tables	13
List of Abbreviations	15
Part I: Introduction, Background and Research Question	17
1 Introduction	19
1.1 Background	19
1.2 Research question	20
1.3 Overview of thesis structure	21
2 Liberalisation and transformation of electricity systems	23
2.1 Electricity market liberalisation	24
2.1.1 The standard model of electricity market liberalisation	24
2.1.2 Objectives beyond short-term efficiency in the standard model	26
2.1.2.1 Investment	28
2.1.2.2 Innovation	29
2.1.2.3 Complementary mechanisms	29
2.2 Electricity system transformation	31
2.2.1 Transformation of socio-technical systems	32
2.2.1.1 An evolutionary and socio-technical view on innovations	32
2.2.1.2 Lock-in and path-dependency	33
2.2.1.3 System transformation	33
2.2.2 Governance of system transformation	34
2.2.2.1 Strategic niche management	35
2.2.2.2 Foresight	35
2.3 Summary	36
3 Distributed generation, electricity networks and network regulation	39
3.1 Electricity system development and distributed generation	40
3.1.1 The infrastructure moves to the centre stage	40
3.1.2 Distributed generation	42

3.1.2.1	Definition and status	43
3.1.2.2	Distributed generation: General drivers	44
3.1.2.3	Distributed generation and electricity networks	46
3.1.3	Summary of the DG and network discussion	53
3.2	Network regulation	55
3.2.1	Network regulation in the context of the regulatory state	55
3.2.2	The standard model of economic regulation	57
3.2.2.1	Why is network regulation needed?	57
3.2.2.2	The principles of the standard model	59
4	Research question and methodology	65
4.1	Research question: Governance of DG integration and network transformation	65
4.1.1	Research question	65
4.1.2	How the standard model of regulation is defined in this thesis	66
4.1.3	Governance issues	67
4.1.4	Governance levels	68
4.1.5	Overview on research framework	69
4.2	Research design and method	70
4.2.1	Overview	71
4.2.2	Conceptual part	72
4.2.3	Case studies	73
4.2.3.1	Selection of case studies	74
4.2.3.2	Data collection	76
Part II:	Conceptual analysis	79
5	Network regulation and DG	81
5.1	DSO incentives resulting from DG	81
5.1.1	Additional network costs	82
5.1.2	Load reduction through DG	83
5.1.3	Network benefits	84
5.1.4	Summary	86
5.2	Integrating new objectives and incentives into the standard model	87
5.2.1	Regulatory objectives beyond efficiency	87
5.2.1.1	Rationale for considering DG within network regulation	87

5.2.1.2	The relationship between the efficiency and the DG objective	89
5.2.1.3	Principles for the design of DG mechanisms	90
5.2.2	A differentiated view of the cost-based vs. incentive regulation paradigm	91
5.3	Designing DG incentives for DSOs	94
5.3.1	Cost-based approaches	94
5.3.2	Price-based approaches	97
5.3.2.1	Standardised revenue driver	99
5.3.2.2	Including DG in the comparative efficiency analysis	99
5.3.3	Hybrid mechanisms	100
5.3.3.1	Combining cost-based and price-based elements	100
5.3.3.2	Menu of sliding scales	102
5.3.4	Rationale for DG integration and regulatory design	104
5.4	Conclusions	105
6	Network regulation and innovation	107
6.1	Network innovation: some basics and definitions	107
6.1.1	Process or product innovation and innovation externalities	107
6.1.2	Market structure and innovation	108
6.1.3	Regulation and innovation in general	109
6.1.4	Network innovations and innovation networks	109
6.2	The effect of different regulatory mechanisms on innovation	110
6.2.1	Cost-based regulation	110
6.2.2	Price-based regulation	112
6.2.2.1	Evidence from the literature	112
6.2.2.2	Main effects of price-based regulation	114
6.2.3	Conclusion	118
6.3	Regulatory approaches to innovation	119
6.3.1	Removing innovation externalities for the DSO	120
6.3.2	Input-based mechanisms	121
6.3.2.1	Pass-through of RD&D costs	122
6.3.2.2	Capitalisation of RD&D costs	123
6.3.3	Output-based mechanisms	125
6.3.3.1	Raising the cap based on output criteria	125
6.3.3.2	Extending regulatory periods	126
6.3.3.3	Removing the cap: Regulatory holidays	128
6.3.4	Conclusion	129
6.4	Beyond the incentive regulation mechanism	130

6.4.1	Is economic regulation the right place to foster innovations?	130
6.4.1.1	Critique from the perspective within regulatory economics	131
6.4.1.2	Critique from the perspective outside regulatory economics: Are revenue incentives sufficient?	132
6.4.2	Policy-Regulation Interface	134
6.5	Conclusion	135
7	Beyond changes in the incentive formula	137
7.1	Governance mechanisms beyond the incentive formula	138
7.1.1	Network transformation and the standard model	139
7.1.2	Reflexive governance of system transformation	142
7.1.3	Network regulation and governance of system transformation	144
7.1.3.1	Regulation under uncertainty	146
7.1.3.2	Actor coordination	152
7.1.4	Conclusion	154
7.2	Energy policy and regulation	155
7.2.1	Additional objectives beyond efficiency	155
7.2.2	Multiple objectives and independence	156
7.2.3	The relationship between policy and regulation	158
7.3	Conclusion	160
Part III:	Case studies	161
8	Case study UK	163
8.1	Background: Liberalisation pioneer and DG policy	163
8.2	Incentive regulation and DG connection	166
8.2.1	How does the hybrid incentive work?	167
8.2.2	Generator-use-of-system charges and the policy-regulation interface	169
8.3	Incentive regulation and network innovation	171
8.3.1	Background	171
8.3.2	How do the innovation mechanisms work?	173
8.3.3	The incentive mechanisms under discussion	175
8.3.4	Innovation outcome and further developments	177
8.4	Beyond changes in the incentive formula	179
8.4.1	The role and objectives of Ofgem	180

8.4.2	Regulatory instruments beyond economic incentives	183
8.4.2.1	Coordination beyond economic incentives	184
8.4.2.2	The Electricity Network Strategy Group	186
9	Case study Denmark	189
9.1	Background: Liberalisation, DG and system transformation	189
9.1.1	The traditional structure of the electricity industry in Denmark	189
9.1.2	Overview of electricity market liberalisation	191
9.1.3	DG Policy	192
9.1.4	From individual plants to system transformation	194
9.2	Governance of DG connection	198
9.2.1	The standard model of network regulation in Denmark	198
9.2.1.1	The role and objectives of regulators	198
9.2.1.2	From cost-based to price-based regulation	200
9.2.1.3	Network regulation and DG	201
9.2.2	Explaining the marginal role of the standard model	201
9.2.2.1	Cost-sharing mechanism	202
9.3	Governance of Innovation and System Transformation	205
9.3.1	The role of network regulation	206
9.3.2	Public Service obligation and the governance of innovation	207
9.3.3	The role of Energinet.dk	209
9.3.3.1	How Energinet.dk was set up	210
9.3.3.2	Relationship with energy policy	211
9.3.3.3	Regulation of Energinet.dk	212
9.3.3.4	The regulatory role of Energinet.dk	215
9.3.3.5	Summary	215
9.3.4	Governance mechanisms beyond economic incentives	216
9.3.4.1	Long-term planning	216
9.3.4.2	Actor cooperation	217
10	Comparative evaluation of the case studies	220
10.1	DG connection and integration	221
10.2	Network innovation	222
10.3	System Transformation	223
10.4	Cost implications	224

Part IV: Conclusions	227
11 Conclusions and questions for further research	229
11.1 Conclusions	229
11.1.1 Applying incentive mechanisms to new objectives	231
11.1.2 Beyond the incentive formula	232
11.1.3 General conclusions about the standard model of liberalisation	232
11.2 Limits of the thesis and further research	233
References	235