

Contents

1	The “Ethics Job”	1
1.1	The Role of the “In-house” Ethicist and How This Book Came About	1
1.2	Research in Genomics	3
1.2.1	Genetics and Genomics	3
1.2.2	A Genomics Research Project: The Procardis Consortium	4
1.2.3	Varieties of Genomics Research	4
1.3	Ethical Debate in Genomics	5
1.4	Putting Philosophy to Work in Ethics and Genomics	7
1.4.1	Careful Attention to Steps in Arguments	7
1.4.2	Matching up Theory with Experience	8
1.4.3	Developing Moral Thought	10
1.5	Conclusions	12
1.6	Study Questions	13
1.7	Coming Up Next	13
	References	13
2	Why Research Ethics? Why Ethics in Genetics? The Case of Genomics Research	15
2.1	A Brief History of the Ethical Regulation of Research	15
2.2	An Equally Brief History of Ethical Issues in Genetics	18
2.2.1	Worries About Eugenics	18
2.2.2	Genetics and Populations: The Spectre of “Race”	21
2.2.3	Genetics and Reproduction	22
2.2.4	Genetics, Life, and Identity	22
2.3	Meet ELSI	24
2.4	Too Much Ethics?	26
2.5	Human Subjects and Subjects of Research	28
2.6	Lessons from Research Abuses and Open Debate	32
2.7	Researchers Facing Ethical Issues: Accounts from the Front Line	33

2.7.1 Researchers Behaving Well: Detective Work Amongst the Mormons	34
2.7.2 Researchers Behaving Well: Warning the NIH About Privacy Risks	37
2.7.3 Researchers Behaving Well: What Watson Didn't Want to Know	38
2.8 Epilogue: What Can We Learn from Good Behaviour?	39
2.9 Conclusions	39
2.10 Study Questions	40
2.11 Coming Up Next	40
References	40
3 What Ethics Is, What It Is Not, and How We Are Going to Proceed	43
3.1 What Ethics Is Not: Clearing Away Confusion	43
3.1.1 The Business of Research Ethics Committees	43
3.1.2 ELSI and Ethics	47
3.1.3 Ethics Aims to Improve Standards?	48
3.1.4 A Note About the Practical Goals of Ethics	50
3.2 What Ethics Is	50
3.2.1 Universal Ethics or Relativistic Ethics?	52
3.2.2 Thinking Right and Doing Right: Moral Motivation	53
3.2.3 What Can We Hope for in Ethics?	53
3.2.4 Ethics and Other Values: The Value of Knowledge and the Value of Scientific Progress	54
3.2.5 The Case of the "Missing Ethics"	56
3.2.6 Reasoning in Ethics: A Very Brief Summary	57
3.2.7 Empirical Work in Ethics	60
3.3 Conclusions	61
3.4 Study Questions	61
3.5 Coming Up Next	62
References	62
4 Starting Analysis in Ethics: A Practical Guide	65
4.1 Introduction: How to Use This Chapter	65
4.2 Critical Reading in Ethics: Some Strategies	66
4.3 Reading an Article on Ethics: Some Preliminaries	67
4.3.1 What Journal?	68
4.3.2 The Range of Work in Ethics	68
4.3.3 Authors and Authority	69
4.3.4 Authors' Disciplinary Backgrounds and Affiliations	69
4.4 Some Basic Questions to Ask as You Are Reading	70
4.4.1 Where in the Text Can You Find Arguments and Evidence for Positions?	70

4.4.2	Key Concepts and Terms Used	71
4.4.3	What Words Are Used? Same Phenomenon, Different Descriptions, Different Values	72
4.4.4	What Conclusions, If Any, Are Drawn?	73
4.5	Looking for Assumptions: Presenting Positions and Framing Texts	74
4.5.1	Common Framings in Genetics and Genomics: Speed and “Future Promise”	77
4.6	Conclusions	79
4.7	Study Questions	79
4.8	Coming Up Next	81
	References	81
5	An Overview of Research Ethics and Challenges from Genomics ...	83
5.1	Introduction: Some Challenges in Genomics Research	83
5.1.1	The Traditional Basis of Research Ethics and Genomics Research	84
5.1.2	Potential Harms of Genomics Research: Informational Harms	84
5.1.3	Research Networks	86
5.2	Ethical Issues	88
5.2.1	Informed Consent: Complexity of Information and Rapid Change	88
5.2.2	Informed Consent: Individuals, Families, and Populations ..	90
5.2.3	Withdrawal from Research: Difficult, but then, Is It Really Necessary in Genomics?	91
5.2.4	Confidentiality and Privacy in Genomics Research: New Challenges to the Power to Protect Data	92
5.2.5	Confidentiality and Privacy in Genomics Research: Whose Confidentiality, Whose Privacy?	93
5.2.6	Feedback of Findings in Genomics Research	93
5.2.7	Benefit Sharing in Genomics Research	94
5.2.8	Genomics Research, Ancestry and Race	95
5.2.9	Can Genomics Information Be Inherently “Bad”?	97
5.2.10	Public Health Genomics	97
5.3	Ethical Issues in Social Science Research: Parallels and Lessons for Genomics Research	100
5.4	A Note on Technology and Ethics	101
5.5	Conclusions	103
5.6	Study Questions	104
5.7	Coming Up Next	105
	References	106

- 6 Autonomy and Its Limits: The View from Genomics** 109
 - 6.1 Introduction 109
 - 6.2 What Is Autonomy? Philosophical Accounts of the Notion of Autonomy 110
 - 6.2.1 Descriptive and Normative Accounts of Autonomy 111
 - 6.2.2 Mere Choice: Or Reasoned Choice? 111
 - 6.2.3 Negative and Positive Approaches to Autonomy 112
 - 6.2.4 The Domain of Autonomy: Self, Body, Life, Information ... 112
 - 6.2.5 Autonomy, Community, and Other Values 115
 - 6.2.6 Alternative Ways of Valuing and Protecting the Individual Not Based on Autonomy 117
 - 6.3 Autonomy in Research Ethics: Research Upon Autonomy 118
 - 6.3.1 Milgram’s Obedience Experiments 119
 - 6.3.2 Moral Conceit: What We Do Not Know About Ourselves .. 120
 - 6.3.3 The Fragility of Autonomy 121
 - 6.3.4 Consent, Authority, and Institutions 122
 - 6.3.5 Consent, Conscience, and Persuasion 123
 - 6.3.6 The Institutionalisation of Consent 125
 - 6.4 Conclusions 127
 - 6.5 Study Questions 127
 - 6.6 Coming Up Next 128
 - References 129

- 7 The Social and Institutional Setting of Ethics** 131
 - 7.1 Introduction 131
 - 7.2 Science in a Social Context 132
 - 7.2.1 Science and Money 132
 - 7.2.2 Scientific Teamwork 135
 - 7.2.3 Science and Wider Society 135
 - 7.3 Institutional Influences and Authority 136
 - 7.4 Social Influences on Moral Action 139
 - 7.4.1 Institutional Ethics: Administrative Evil 140
 - 7.5 Hindrances to Ethical Action and Reasoning and What to Do About Them 141
 - 7.5.1 Time 141
 - 7.5.2 Dehumanisation 144
 - 7.5.3 Social Conformity 145
 - 7.5.4 Moral Disengagement 146
 - 7.5.5 The Diffusion of Responsibility 146
 - 7.5.6 Whistleblowers 147
 - 7.6 Conclusions 147
 - 7.7 Study Questions 148
 - 7.8 Coming Up Next 148
 - References 149

8	Respect for Persons in Research and in Genetics	151
8.1	Study Question	151
8.2	Introduction	152
8.3	Varieties of Respect: Divergent Understandings of the Concept of Respect for Persons	153
8.4	Background: The Debate About Feedback of Results	154
8.5	The Use and Misuse of the Notion of “Respect for Persons” in a Current Debate in Genomics Research Ethics	156
8.6	Concluding Unscientific Postscript: Problems with the Use of Science in Ethical Debate	164
8.7	The Need for Detailed Consideration of Different Cases	167
8.8	Conclusions	168
8.9	Study Questions	169
8.10	Coming Up Next	170
	Appendix: Participants at a Workshop on Respect for Persons, St. Hugh’s College Oxford, 2010	170
	References	172
9	Responsibilities of Researchers in Genetics	173
9.1	Introduction	173
9.2	Responsibility for Health	175
9.3	Responsibilities of the Medical Profession	177
9.4	Responsibilities of Medical Researchers	178
9.5	Recent Calls for Researchers in Genomics to Take on Expanding Responsibilities	180
9.6	The Nature of Responsibility: “Chains of Responsibility” in Research Networks?	182
9.7	Responsibilities of Research Subjects and Genomics Research	183
9.8	Legal Notions of Responsibility: The “Duty of Care” of Genomics Researchers	184
9.9	Moral Responsibility: Some Lessons from Psychology	187
9.9.1	Warnings for Genomics Research: Ways in Which We Abnegate Responsibility	187
9.9.2	Ideology and Responsibility	189
9.9.3	How Can Responsible Behaviour Be Fostered?	189
9.10	Conclusions	190
9.11	Study Questions	191
9.12	Coming Up Next	192
	References	192
10	Data Sharing in Genomics	195
10.1	Introduction	195
10.2	Reasons to Share Genomics Data: Views from Policy and Practice	198

10.2.1	Data Sharing as the Norm	198
10.2.2	Improving Scientific Outputs	199
10.2.3	Fostering Novelty and Scientific Creativity	199
10.2.4	The Value of Sharing Certain Sorts of Data	199
10.2.5	Visions of Scientific and of Human Progress	199
10.2.6	The Value of Data and the Value of Knowledge	200
10.2.7	Data Sharing and Good Scientific Practice	200
10.2.8	Good Data Sharing and Stewardship	200
10.2.9	Data Sharing and Research Participants	200
10.2.10	Data Sharing Brings Benefit to the Public	201
10.2.11	The Timing of Data Sharing, Speed and Brakes	201
10.2.12	Interests in Controlling Data	201
10.3	Data Sharing and Scientific Practice	203
10.3.1	Stewardship of Data	204
10.3.2	Rewards, Sanctions, and the Scientific Community	204
10.4	The Value of Knowledge and the Value of Sharing Knowledge	206
10.5	Reasons Not to Share: Privacy and the Control of Personal Information	209
10.6	Do We Own Our Genetic Information?	211
10.7	The Value of Knowledge and the Value of Sharing Knowledge: Summary and Analysis	213
10.8	Conclusions	214
10.9	Study Questions	214
	References	215
	Afterword	217
	Glossary	219
	Abbreviations	223
	Index of Text Boxes	225
	Subject Index	227