

Contents

Introduction	1
I. Brief Background on Data Protection in EU Law	3
II. What is the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice?	6
III. Research Topic: Information Sharing in the AFSJ and Data Protection Rights	8
IV. Terminology	12
V. Limitations of the Research	15
VI. Sources	16
VII. Outline of the Research	16
A Data Protection Standard in the AFSJ	19
I. Brief Historical Review and Reasons for Data Protection	19
II. Council of Europe: Art. 8 ECHR, Convention No. 108 and Recommendation R (87) 15	22
1. Data Protection Guarantees of Article 8 ECHR	25
2. Data Protection Elements and Restrictions with Regard to Articles 5, 6, 10 and 13 ECHR	84
3. Convention No. 108 for the Protection of Individuals with Regard to Automatic Processing of Personal Data	92
4. Recommendation No. R (87) 15 Regulating the Use of Personal Data in the Police Sector	96
5. Conclusion: Towards Basic ECHR Principles for Security-Related Data Processing	103
III. European Union Standards	106
1. Main Data Protection Instruments in the AFSJ and Their Scope	107
2. EU Data Protection Principles in the AFSJ	127
3. Conclusion: Data Protection Rules in the AFSJ are Still a Patchwork	171

B AFSJ Actors in the Light of the European Data

Protection Standard	175
I Brief Background Information	176
II European Agencies and OLAF	177
1. Europol	177
2. Eurojust	214
3. OLAF	226
4. Frontex	246
5. Joint Situation Centre of the Council	253
6. European Judicial Network	254
7. Conclusion: Fragmented Data Protection Framework Versus Increasing Powers of the AFSJ Agencies and OLAF	256
III Data Processing in European Information Exchange Systems	259
1. The Schengen Information System	260
2. The Visa Information System	280
3. The Customs Information System	292
4. Eurodac	304
5. Proposal for an Agency Managing Large IT Systems (SIS II, VIS and Eurodac) from a Data Protection Point of View	314
6. Conclusion: Stagnating Data Protection Framework in Contrast to Increasing Functionalities of the EU Information Systems	318

**C Cooperation and Data Exchange of the AFSJ Actors
and Their Compliance with the European Data**

Protection Standard	321
I Inter-Agency Data Exchange and OLAF	322
1. Europol-Eurojust	322
2. Europol-OLAF	330
3. Europol-Frontex	333
4. Eurojust-OLAF	338
5. Eurojust-Frontex	342
6. Conclusion: Unsatisfactory Data Protection Framework in AFSJ Inter-Agency Information-Sharing	342
II Data Exchange Between AFSJ Agencies and Europe's Information Systems: SIS, CIS, VIS and Eurodac	344
1. Europol-SIS II Access	344
2. Europol-VIS Access	348
3. Europol-CIS Access	357
4. Europol-Eurodac Access	360
5. Eurojust-SIS II Access	366

6. Eurojust-CIS Access	368
7. Conclusion: Unbalanced Interests – Law Enforcement Access and Respect of Data Protection Principles	368
D Perspectives and Suggestions for Improvement	371
I. Key Findings	372
II. Lawfulness of the Expanding AFSJ Functionalities	379
III. Limits of Preemptive Storing and Law Enforcement Access to Databases of a Non Law Enforcement Nature	381
1. Pre-Emptive Storing in View of the Case-Law	382
2. No Coherent Solution by the European Court of Justice for Law Enforcement Access	389
IV. Reforming the Supervisory Structure and Creating a General Notification Duty	393
1. The Need for a Central Supervisory Authority	394
2. Upgrading the Rights of the Supervisory Body to Guarantee Effective Protection	396
3. Towards a General Notification Duty	398
V. Aligning the Data Processing Framework in the AFSJ: Improvement Suggestions	398
1. Procedural Requirements and Legal Basis	400
2. Catalogue of Stored Data	400
3. Avoiding Unclear Terms and Harmonising Key Terms	401
4. Framing the Access Conditions	401
5. Improving the Protection of Victims, Witnesses and Persons Whose Data are Pre-Emptively Entered in Security Related Databases	402
6. Individual Rights	404
7. Notification	405
8. Control of Data Recording and Binding Security Rules	406
9. Improving the Protection and the Transparency of Information Originating from Private Parties or Third States	407
10. Common Rules on the Relations to Third Parties	407
11. Managing the Time-Limits	408
12. Dual Control: Introducing an Internal DPO	409
13. Improving the Decision Making and Introducing Sunset and Review Provisions	409
VI. Towards Harmonised Data Protection Principles for Intra-AFSJ Information Exchange	410
1. Restricting the Purpose of Transfer	411
2. Defining Unclear Legal Terms	411
3. Designating the Accessing Actors and Authorities	413
4. Harmonising the Access Procedure	413

5. Coordinating the Access Conditions	414
6. Data Protection and Data Security Rules	415
7. Follow-Up of the Transferred Data	416
8. Cooperation Between Data Protection Authorities	418
9. Penalties in Case of Misuse	418
10. Access Right, Correction, Deletion and Notification	418
11. Keeping of Records	420
12. Implementing Effective Monitoring and Evaluation	420
13. Specific Rules Concerning Europol and Eurojust and JIT Cooperation	421
VII. The Important Impact of the Lisbon Treaty	422
Concluding Remarks	424
Documents	429
I. Conventions, Treaties, Acts and Related Documents	429
II. Council of Europe	430
III. EU Related Documents	431
Table of Cases	449
I. ECtHR Cases and Decisions of the Commission of the Council of Europe	449
II. EU Cases	453
Bibliography	457