

Table of Contents

List of Abbreviations	29
Chapter 1: Introduction	33
1.1 Introduction	33
1.2 Building Blocks of the Thesis: Research Question and Research Context	39
1.2.1 Building Block 1: Poverty across EU Member States – Social Policy and Human Rights Perspectives	40
1.2.2 Building Block 2: From the Minimum Core Doctrine to the Right to a Social Minimum	44
1.2.3 Building Block 3: Realising the Right to a Social Minimum	50
1.2.4 Building Block 4: Necessity of Disaggregated Data to Realise the Right to a Social Minimum	52
1.3 Methodology: From Doctrinal Methods to Socio-Legal Analysis	53
1.3.1 Doctrinal Methods: The Authoritative Value of General Comments and Concluding Observations	54
1.3.2 Enhancing the Doctrinal Method through Qualitative Content Analysis with MAXQDA	59
1.3.3 Descriptive Statistics and a Human Rights Critique of Social Policy Data	69
1.3.4 The Added Value of a Comparative, Socio-Legal Methodology	73
1.4 Justifying the Material, Geographical and Temporal Scope	74
1.4.1 Material Scope: Why a Human Right to a Social Minimum?	74
1.4.2 Geographical Scope: Why a Focus on the EU Member States and the Human Rights Treaty Bodies?	78
1.4.3 Temporal Scope: Why a Focus on 2009-2019?	83
1.5 Conclusion	85

Chapter 2: Poverty across EU Member States: Social Policy and Human Rights Perspectives	87
2.1 Introduction	87
2.2 Conceptualising Poverty: A Social Policy Perspective	88
2.2.1 The AROPE-Indicator as the EU's Official Conceptualisation of Poverty	89
2.2.2 A Historical Overview of the EU's Official Framing of Poverty	95
2.2.3 'Deservingness'-Theory and Contrasting Views on the Main Causes of Poverty	102
2.3 Conceptualising Poverty: A Human Rights Perspective	104
2.3.1 The Historical Origins of Poverty as a Matter of Concern under International Human Rights Law	105
2.3.2 Human Dignity as Key Principle of the Human Rights Approach to Poverty	110
2.3.3 The Historical Origins of the Minimum Core Doctrine	113
2.4 Measuring Poverty: A Social Policy Perspective	116
2.4.1 The EU-SILC: Advantages and Disadvantages	117
2.4.2 Using the EU-SILC for Research: Challenges of Disaggregation	119
2.4.3 A Comparative Analysis of Poverty in EU MS Applying EU-SILC	120
2.4.4 Criticising the EU-SILC as Underlying Data Source for the Measurement of Poverty	124
2.5 Measuring Poverty: A Human Rights Perspective	126
2.5.1 Human Rights Indicators	126
2.5.2 Disaggregation as a Core Principle of a Human Rights Approach to Data	128
2.5.3 Populating Indicators with Disaggregated Data	130
2.6 Conclusion	134
Chapter 3: Distilling the Normative Content of the Human Right to a Social Minimum	135
3.1 Introduction	135

3.2 Framing the Minimum Core Doctrine as a Substantive Right to a Social Minimum	136
3.2.1 Minimum Essential Levels	137
3.2.2 Subsistence	141
3.2.3 Non-Discriminatory Access	147
3.2.4 The Core Obligation to Realise the Right to a Social Minimum	154
3.2.5 Overcoming the Piecemeal Approach: The Added Value of Conceptualising a Substantive Right to a Social Minimum	159
3.3 Giving Normative ‘Teeth’ to the Right to a Social Minimum	161
3.3.1 Distilling the Normative Content of ‘Minimum Essential Levels’	163
3.3.2 Distilling the Normative Content of ‘Subsistence’	166
3.3.3 Distilling the Normative Content of ‘Non-Discriminatory Access’	175
3.3.4 Non-Discriminatory Access in Practice: Classifying Specific Groups as Disadvantaged or Marginalised	179
3.4 Analysing Substantive Dimensions according to five HRTBs	182
3.4.1 Re-Conceptualising the Substantive Links into Three Dimensions	185
3.4.2 The Poverty Dimension (P)	189
3.4.3 The Material Deprivation Dimension (MD)	192
3.4.4 The Work Dimension (W)	193
3.5 Intersectionality	196
3.5.1 Intersectional Categories for Persons with Disabilities, Children and Roma	197
3.5.2 Children with Disabilities	199
3.5.2.1 The Poverty Dimension for Children with Disabilities	201
3.5.2.2 The Material Deprivation Dimension for Children with Disabilities	205
3.5.3 Roma Children	208
3.5.3.1 The Poverty Dimension for Roma Children	210
3.5.3.2 The Material Deprivation Dimension for Roma Children	212
3.5.4 Comparative Analysis between Children with Disabilities and Roma Children	213

3.6 Conclusion	214
Chapter 4: Realising the Right to a Social Minimum	217
4.1 Introduction	217
4.2 The Limits of Formal Legal Means	221
4.2.1 Domestic Application According to the HRTBs	222
4.2.1.1 Domestic Application in CESCRC's General Comments	223
4.2.1.2 Domestic Application in CESCRC's COs to EU MS from 2009-2019	225
4.2.1.3 Domestic Application in the COs of the Group Specific HRTBs	229
4.2.2 Justiciability According to the HRTBs	234
4.2.2.1 Justiciability in CESCRC's General Comments	236
4.2.2.2 Justiciability in CESCRC's COs to EU MS from 2009-2019	240
4.2.2.3 Justiciability in the COs of the Group Specific HRTBs	242
4.2.3 Why Formal Legal Means are Neither Sufficient nor Necessary to Realise Rights	247
4.3 Realising Rights	251
4.3.1 Realising Rights by All Appropriate Means	255
4.3.2 Realising Rights in CESCRC's COs to EU MS from 2009-2019	258
4.3.3 Realising Rights in the COs of the Group Specific HRTBs	260
4.4 Identifying Hindering Conditions in the HRTBs' Jurisprudence	263
4.4.1 Austerity	264
4.4.2 Social Protection Gaps	274
4.4.2.1 Minimum Income Protection Schemes as a 'Last Safety Net'?	276
4.4.2.2 Social Protection Gaps in the HRTBs' COs to the EU MS	281
4.4.3 Patterns of Discrimination	283
4.5 Analysis of Hindering Conditions for Persons with Disabilities, Children, and Roma	287
4.5.1 Persons with Disabilities	288

4.5.2 Children	293
4.5.3 Roma	296
4.6 Intersectionality	297
4.6.1 Children with Disabilities	298
4.6.1.1 Social Protection Gaps	298
4.6.1.2 Educational Segregation, Austerity and Institutionalisation	302
4.6.2 Roma Children	304
4.6.2.1 Social Protection Gaps	304
4.6.2.2 Educational Segregation, Austerity and Patterns of Discrimination	307
4.7 Conclusion	308
Chapter 5: Why the Lack of Disaggregated Statistics Hinders the Realisation of the Right to a Social Minimum	311
5.1 Introduction	311
5.2 The Collection of Disaggregated Data as a Human Rights Obligation	312
5.2.1 CESCER and Disaggregated Data	313
5.2.2 The CRPD Committee and Disaggregated Data	315
5.2.3 The CRC Committee and Disaggregated Data	316
5.2.4 The CERD Committee and Disaggregated Data	317
5.2.5 The CEDAW Committee and Disaggregated Data	319
5.2.6 Comparative Analysis	320
5.3 Persons with Disabilities	321
5.3.1 Contested Disability Definitions and Assessments	322
5.3.2 Poverty and Employment Gaps for Persons with Disabilities	325
5.3.3 Disability Benefits	332
5.3.4 Why Populating Indicators with Disaggregated Data Remains a Challenge for Persons with Disabilities	336
5.4 Children	340
5.4.1 The Disconnect of Child Poverty as a Human Rights or Social Policy Issue	342
5.4.2 A Short History of the EU's Policy Space on Child Poverty	345

5.4.3 The EU-SILC and Available Empirical Data on Child Poverty in the EU	349
5.4.4 Child Poverty across the EU MS according to EU-SILC	353
5.4.5 Why Populating Indicators with Disaggregated Data Remains a Challenge for Children	356
5.5 Roma	359
5.5.1 Who are the Roma and how many Roma are there?	359
5.5.1.1 Who are the Roma? Tensions between Self-identification and External Identification	360
5.5.1.2 How many Roma are there?	364
5.5.2 From Census Data to Sampling Frames: Unavailability and Unreliability	370
5.5.3 Roma Poverty and Social Exclusion	377
5.5.4 Why Populating Indicators with Disaggregated Data remains a Challenge for Roma	385
5.6 Intersectionality and Disaggregated Statistics	388
5.6.1 Children with Disabilities	389
5.6.2 Roma Children	390
5.6.3 The ‘Most Intersectional’ Case: a Female Roma Child with a Disability	395
5.7 Excluded by Design: EU-SILC and Disaggregation	397
5.8 Conclusion	400
Chapter 6: Conclusion	403
6.1 How Should EU MS Realise the Right to a Social Minimum?	404
6.2 A Methodological Agenda: The Promises of Qualitative Comparative Analysis for Comparative Research on the Realisation of Human Rights	407
6.3 A Policy Agenda: Embedding the Right to a Social minimum in the EU Infrastructure	409
Bibliography	417
Primary Sources	417
United Nations	417
Council of Europe	422

European Union	423
Other Primary Sources	428
Secondary Sources	428
Books, Edited Books and Journal Articles	428
Reports and Working Papers	451
Other Sources	455
Appendix	457
Appendix 1. CESCR's Most Recent Reporting Cycles Addressing the EU MS (2009-2019)	458
Appendix 2. The CRPD Committee's Most Recent Reporting Cycles Addressing the EU MS (2009-2019)	460
Appendix 3. The CRC Committee's Most Recent Reporting Cycles Addressing the EU MS (2009-2019)	462
Appendix 4. The CERD Committee's Most Recent Reporting Cycles Addressing the EU MS (2009-2019)	464
Appendix 5. The CEDAW Committee's Most Recent Reporting Cycles Addressing the EU MS (2009-2019)	466
Appendix 6. Disability Assessment Criteria and Categories of Capacity/ Incapacity for Work (MISSOC, 2022)	468
Appendix 7. Disability Equality Indicators Across the EU MS (DOTCOM, 2019)	476